

Final Report

On

Post Procurement Review of 12 contracts of
Bangladesh Rural Electrification Board (REB) for the procurement

Period 2015-16

Contract package # CPTU/SR-002(b)

Consultant: K.M HASSAN
Independent Consultant

Central Procurement Technical Unit (CPTU)

Implementation Monitoring & Evaluation Division (IMED)

Ministry of Planning

June, 2018

Contents

Abbreviations.....	3
Executive Summery	5
Chapter One.....	8
Post Procurement Review	8
1.1 Introduction:	8
1.2 Independent Consultants Selection:	8
1.3 Objectives of the Assignment:.....	9
1.4 Scope of the Assignment:.....	9
1.5 Methodology :	10
Chapter Two.....	11
2.0 Selection of Procurement Contracts :	11
2.1 Profile of procurement contracts (2015-2016):	11
2.2 Selection of procurement contracts :	13
Chapter Three	16
3.0 Brief description of 3 (three) Projects :	16
Chapter Four	19
4.0 Individual Contract Review:	19
Chapter Five	20
5.0 Field visits:.....	20
Chapter Six.....	21
6.0 Procurement Management Capacity of the Procuring Entities :	21
Chapter Seven	24
7.0 Competition in Procurements	24
Chapter Eight	25
8.0 Findings	25
8.1Strengths:.....	25
8.2 Weakness:	25
8.3 Non-compliance with Acts and Rules:.....	25
8.4 Difficulty in identification of procured goods at field level:	26
8.5 Lack of updated official cost estimate:	26
8.6 Weak Competition	26
Chapter Nine	27
9.0 Recommendation	27
Chapter Ten.....	29
10.0 Conclusion	29

Abbreviations

AA	:	Approving Authority
APP	:	Annual Procurement Plan
BEC	:	Bid Evaluation Committee
BOC	:	Bid Opening Committee
BREB	:	Bangladesh Rural Electrification Board
BWDB	:	Bangladesh Water Development Board
BDT	:	Bangladesh Taka
BUET	:	Bangladesh University of Engineering and Technology
BTCL	:	Bangladesh Telecommunication Company Limited
B.E.	:	Bid Evaluation
CPTU	:	Central Procurement Technical Unit
CSFM	:	Clearing, Storage and Movement
CCGP	:	Cabinet Committee on Government Purchase
DPM	:	Direct Procuring Method
DL	:	Distribution List
DPP	:	Development Project Proforma
DP	:	Delegation of Power
DOFP	:	Delegation of Financial Power
GOV	:	Government of Bangladesh
GCC	:	General Conditions of Contracts
HOPE	:	Head of Procuring Entity
HRD	:	Human Resource Development
IMED	:	Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division
ITD	:	Inspection and Testing Directorate
IFT	:	Invitation of Tender
ICT	:	International Competitive Tender
JICA	:	Japan International Cooperation Agency
LGED	:	Local Government Engineering Department
LOI	:	Letter of Invitation
L.D	:	Liquidated Damage
LTM	:	Limited Tendering Method

MPSS	:	Material Planning, Standardization and Specification
NCT	:	National Competitive Tender
NOA	:	Notification of Tender
OSTETM	:	One Stage Two Envelops Tendering Method
OTM	:	Open Tendering Method
ODA	:	Official Development Assistance
PPA	:	Public Procurement ACT
PPR	:	Public Procurement Rules
PBS	:	Palli Bidyut Samity
Pkg	:	Package
PD	:	Project Director
PT	:	Part
PCC	:	Particular Condition of Contract
POC	:	Proposal Opening Committee
PEC	:	Proposal Evaluation Committee
P.O	:	Purchase Order
REE-RRDP-II	:	Rural Electrification Expansion – Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program-II
RHD	:	Roads and Highways Development
RFT	:	Request of Tender
RR	:	Receiving Report
SPC	:	Spun Pre-Stretched Concrete
SE	:	Superintendent Engineer
SSRE	:	Switching Station of Rural Electricity
SSTETM	:	Single Stage Two Envelope Tendering Method
S/S	:	Sub/Station
STD	:	Standard Tender Document
TEC	:	Tender Evaluation Committee
TOC	:	Tender Opening Committee
TOS	:	Tender Opening Sheet
TSC	:	Technical Sub-Committee
TDS	:	Tender Data Sheet
URED-DCSD	:	Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System; Dhaka, Chittagong & Sylhet Division

Executive Summery

As per PPA-2006(PUBLIC PROCUREMENTACT) Section-24 and PPR-2008(PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES) Rules-45 & 46, the responsibility of CPTU is to review and monitor the progress of works and review the method followed by the government agencies for the procurement of goods, works and services. According to Rules-45 & 46, the records of procurement activities of any Procuring Entity (PE) shall be reviewed by CPTU using own resources or by hiring Independent Consultants for the total procurement performed in a financial year worth at least taka 10.00 cores in a PE. The Procuring Entity to be reviewed will be specified by the CPTU and the Independent Consultants will verify the compliance of the provisions of the Act and Rules taken in procurement process.

In view of the above background, CPTU selected 4 (four) individuals as 'Post Procurement Consultants'. Each consultant will individually review 4 numbers of procurement contracts awarded by 3 (three) PEs in the financial year 2015-2016 from each of 4 target agencies- LGED, BREB, RHD and BWDB.

Independent consultant is assigned to review and evaluate 4 (four) procurement contracts (selected by CPTU) of each of the 3 (three) Procuring Entities (PE's) of Bangladesh Rural Electrification Board (BREB), The Procuring Entities are : -(a) Project Director, Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System: Dhaka-Chittagong-Sylhet (URED- DCSD)

(b) Project Director, Rural Electrification Expansion – Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program II (REE-RRDP-II) and (c) Project Director, Construction of Switching Station for Rural Electrification Program (CSS-REP);

To achieve the objectives and perform the scope of services or the assignment, post review were conducted to the selected contracts in the Format prescribed by the CPTU. Individual contract review incorporating part:-1: General information, part:-2: Compliance with Act and Rules, part:-3: Post review of goods/works contract and part:-4: Report on physical inspection, has been annexed at Annex-A (Part-1, Part-2, Part-3 & Part-4), Annex-B(Part-1, Part-2, Part- 3 & Part-4) and Annex-C(Part-1, Part-2, Part-3 & Part-4). Field visits were undertaken on 11.05.2018 for physical inspection of construction works of C-type, D-type, E-type and Rest house Building at Mymensingh PBS-1 H/Q under contract no: URED-MY-1,CW-03-001 verifying civil construction work. Also visited the site of Mymensingh PBS-2 (Bhaluka) for physical verification of “33 KV Line Construction / Up-gradation work of Bhaluka to Maona (24 KV), Bhaluka to Trishal (12 KM), Maona to Karial (18 KM) and seedstore to paragaid (4 KM)”.

On 15.05.2018, field visit was made At Naringdi PBS-2 for physical verification of 33KV Line Construction/Up-gradation Etakhola to Naranpur (20 KM), Etakhola to Hajipur (15KM) and Polash to Etakhola (13 KM).

Findings the procurement contracts are as follows:

- 1) All the records and documents of the contract as per rule-43(1)(2)(3)(4) and schedule VIII-(part-A & B) of PPR-2008 was maintained . The records and documents which are not found in the contract files are: a)Copy of the original cost estimate with date for a particular contract; b)Names and full addresses of the tenderers who purchase tender or proposal; c)Acknowledgement of receipts of payment by the tenderers; e)Records of sending notification

of award for contracts for publication in CPTU's website and PE's website; f) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details;

2) Checklist with steps for tender opening is not followed fully as per rule 97(4)(G) and schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008.

3) Checklists showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17)(18) & Schedule-IV(Part-A) of PPR-2008;

4) Goods procured under a contract are received by the Central Ware Houses(Dhaka, Khulna & Chittagong) that supply the goods to the PBSs as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB are not available in PD office to identify the ultimate sites or places where the procured goods under a contract have been used.

5) The annual procurement plan with cost estimate is not updated on a quarterly basis as per Rule-16(10) of PPR-2008. Official estimate was not be kept in sealed cover and opened by TEC during evaluation as per Rule 16(5)(A)(B), PPR-2008. 6) It is not clear that the evaluation report was sent by the Chairman, TEC directly to the tender approving authority in sealed envelope as per rule. 7) For official Estimate; One committed headed by Member (Admin) and Controller (A & F), CE (P & P) Director (MPSS) as member were formed vide memo no.

পাবিবো/সচিব/বোঃ সং-৪৮০/২০১২/১১ তারিখ ০৫-০১-১২ to prepare "official estimate" for the materials Purchase. The committee will collect information from all sources to make a realistic estimate and take approval from Chairman BREB. As informed by BREB that approved estimate was valid for one year and acts as "approved rate schedule" for making official estimate for any procurement. 08) There are no provisions of insurance for line construction works.

The recommendations for improvement are:

1. BREB may take care for making the official estimate based of the present market value, Annual procurement plan with cost estimate has to update on quarterly basis as per Rule-16(10) of PPR-2008. The, official cost estimate will kept in sealed cover that will be opened by TEC during evaluation as per rule 15(5)(a)(b), PPR-2008 estimated price.
2. Evaluation Report shall be sent to by TEC/PEC/BEC directly to the tender approving authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.
3. The time spent at each stage of procurement contract /schedule of activities to be maintained as per Rule-8(17) (18) and schedule –IV (Part-ka, kha, Gha) of PPR-2008.
4. Step to be taken to complete the evaluation in time, avoiding the excess Evaluation time[for package –URED-S-G-02-001 (123 days), URED-S-G-04-001 (76 days), URED-S-S-03 (211 days), REE-RRDP-II-G-12(32 days), CSS-03(38 days), CSS-07-02 (38 days), CSS-07-01 (38 days)]. Evaluation time to the followed as per Rule-36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008.
5. Board's approval time to be followed as per Rule -36(6), Schedule-III, Part-A of PPR-2008.
6. Director MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the package number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the contract number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.

7. Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations have to be maintained in the relevant contract file as per provisions of Rule 43(1) (2)(3)(4) of PPR-2008 and schedule –VIII (Part A & B).
8. The un-successful Bidder's to be notifying the causes of un-success with the refund of their Bank Guarantee after the contract sign with the successful Bidder as per section - 53 & section-63 of PPR 2006.
9. Insurance coverage are to be kept in the line construction works.
10. Frequent extension of contract completion time should be discouraged. For delay in completion of works by contractors, LD to be imposed as per contract.
11. Afford to be given for timely completion of every contract.
12. As per Rule- 46(1),(3),(6) PE will perform post procurement Review.
13. The notification of award for contracts to be published in CPTU's website as per Rule- 37(2) of PPR-2008.
14. Allocation letters and the Receiving Reports of the Goods should be kept in the contract file as proof of full execution of the goods under the contract.
15. Steps to be taken to sign the contract within the initial Tender validity time.
16. TEC Recommendation for higher price to be justified with reasonable cause.
17. The completion time for the line construction work to be counted from the date of signing of the contract avoiding the date of issuance of materials.
18. Biased on the materials availability, work order for line construction of be given for timely completion of the work.
19. Records and documentation of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations have to be maintained in the relevant contract file as per provision of Rule-43(1)(2)(3)(4) of PPR-2008 and the Schedule-VIII (Part-A & B) of PPR 2008.
20. Checklist with steps for tender opening has to be followed as per provisions of Rule- 97(4)(G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR 2008;
21. Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract number or the package number in the allocation letter and Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the contract number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.
22. Frequent extension of contract completion time of line works may be avoided.
23. More people to be trained on PPR/PPA for the project office for smooth implementation of the project.

Chapter One

Final Report

On

Post Procurement Review

1.1 Introduction:

As per PPA-2006(PUBLIC PROCUREMENT ACT) Section-24 and PPR-2008(PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES) Rules-45 & 46, the responsibility of CPTU is to review and monitor the progress of works and review the method followed by the government agencies for the procurement of goods, works and services. According to Rules-45 & 46, the records of procurement activities of any Procuring Entity shall be reviewed by CPTU using own resources or by hiring Independent Consultants for the total procurement performed in a financial year worth at least taka 10.00 cores in a PE. The Procuring Entity to be reviewed will be specified by the CPTU and the Independent Consultants will verify the compliance of the provisions of the Act and Rules taken in procurement process.

1.2 Independent Consultants Selection:

In view of the above background, CPTU selected 4 (four) individuals as 'Post Procurement Consultants'. Each consultant will individually review 4 numbers of procurement contracts awarded by 3 (three) PEs in the financial year 2015-2016 from each of 4 target agencies- LGED, BREB, RHD and BWDB.

I am one among the 4 consultants and I signed the contract agreement with CPTU on 8th April 2018.

On 9th April 2018, CPTU selected the following 3 projects of BERB for me, to review and evaluate 4 procurement contracts awarded by each of the projects in FY: 2015-2016

- a. Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System: Dhaka-Chittagong-Sylhet(URED- DCSD)**
- b. Rural Electrification Expansion – Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program (REE-RRDP-II).**
- c. Construction of Switching Station for Rural Electrification Program**

1.3 Objectives of the Assignment:

- (a) determine whether the procurement processes and contracting proceedings are in accordance with the Public Procurement Act and Rules
- (b) assess the extent to which Value-for-Money is being achieved in the procurement process as required by the Procuring Entities;
- (c) review and assess the capacity of the Procuring Entity in handling procurement from preparation to contract implementation and documentation are maintained as per Rules & required standards;
- (d) review and assess that the procurements made are being used for the intended purpose;
- (e) identify improvements in the procurement contracting in the light of deficiencies identified in the earlier review; and
- (f) Any other issues that may appear pertinent.

1.4 Scope of the Assignment:

As per ToR the scope of services are as follows:

- a) verify the procurement and contracting proceedings of the PEs and identify non-compliance with the procurement Act and Rules;
- b) verify whether PEs have used STDs in its Procurement content & put necessary information in TDS/PDS and other formats correctly.
- c) verify that the Goods, Works and Consulting Services contracted were supplied and/or completed according to the required specifications and technical standards;
- d) identify inappropriate practices or questionable decisions and/or actions;
- e) verify that documentation and record keeping systems are in place and adequate for ensuring post review requirements;
- f) verify that goods and works exist at intended locations and are being used for the purposes they were acquired;
- g) determine remedies to correct the identified deficiencies

To achieve the objectives and perform the scope of services of the assignment, post review will be conducted on the project files with special focus on the following aspects, documentation and procedures of the PEs

- a) Procurement Plan
- b) Pre/Post qualification
- c) Tender /RFP Document
- d) Advertisement
- e) Tender Opening
- f) Formation of TEC/PEC and TOC/POC
- g) Tender /Proposal Evaluation
- h) Approval of Tender/Proposals
- i) Contract Award
- j) Completion of Contract
- k) Complain and Appeal
- l) Contract Amendment
- m) Procurement Management Capacity
- n) Fraudulence and Corruption
- o) Maintenance of Procurement related file

1.5 Methodology :

To carry out the post procurement review the following methodologies are being adopted under the 3(three) broad phases in a step-by-step procedure:

Phase-I:

- Identify and obtain information on contracts from responsible staff;
- Visit to PMU offices and obtain procurement related documents of FY:2015-2016 including total nos. of contracts and total contract values
- Obtain project documents of 3 identified projects
- Preparation of brief descriptions of the 3 projects
- Preparation and submission of First Status Report.
- Preparation and submission of Second Status Report.
- etc

Phase-II:

- Documentary review at PMU offices for selected goods and service pkgs.
- Documentary review of selected works pkgs. at DMU offices and physical inspections in implementation sites at different PalliBidyut.
- Discussion with the field officers regarding the difficulty for implementation of works.

Phase -III:Reporting Obligations:

The following Reports will be prepared and submitted

- Inception Report
- Status Reports: 1st Status Report
- Second Status Report
- Draft Final Report
- Final Report

Chapter Two

2.0 Selection of Procurement Contracts :

The list supply by the 3 PE's for the total procurement contracts for the year 2015-2016, 12 contracts of the 3 PE of BREB had been selected. Taking into account large numbers of contract packages, the predominance of works packages and small value of contracts, Sample Contracts for Goods Works and services were selected based on the following criteria:

- At least 15% of the total number of procurement contracts in such a way that the reviewed contracts in each Procuring Entity cover at least 30% of the total contract value in the year 2015-2016.
- Value of the contracts: low value ,medium value, high value
- Method of procurement;
- Category: sample from goods,works and services contracts;
- Type: National Competitive Tender (NCT) and International Competitive Tender (ICT);
- Geographical spread of the contracts ;
- Location of implementation: remoteness of site;
- Nature and complexity of procurement;
- Evaluation carried out by PMU and DMU;
- Status of work: ongoing and completed;
- Protests/Claims and how addressed;

The project wise sample contracts preliminarily selected on the basis of the above criteria are given in the following table.

2.1 Profile of procurement contracts (2015-2016):

The profile of the procurement contracts showing (a) category of procurements, (b) method and type and (c) summery of individual contract review in prescribed Format (goods, works and services) is listed below:

a) Category:

Name of PE	Total contract No		Goods		Works		Service		Number Visited
	Total (No.)	Reviewed(No.)	Total (No.)	Reviewed(No.)	Total(No.)	Reviewed(No.)	Total(No.)	Reviewed (No.)	
UREDSD	113	04	19	02	83	01	01	01	04
REE-REDP-2	145	04	30	04	115	01	-	-	04
CSS-REP	26	04	05	03	19	01	-	-	04

b) Method/ Type:

Name of PE	OTM		DPM		ICT		NCT		SSTETM	
	Total (No.)	Reviewed (No.)	Total (No.)	Reviewed (No.)	Total (No.)	Reviewed (No.)	Total (No.)	Reviewed (No.)	Total (No.)	Reviewed (No.)
URED S-DCSD	113	04	-	-	20	03	93	01	-	-
REE-REDP-2	29	04	01	04	-	-	115	01	-	-
CSS-REP	07	03	-	-	-	-	19	01	-	-

NB: All construction works awarded by S.E Rajshahi Zone under REE-REDP-II and CSS REP project were under LTM

C) Summary of Individual Contract Review Format (Goods , Works and services).

Ministry/Agency Name: Bangladesh Rural Electrification Board Review Financial Year: 2015-2016; Month of Review: April 2008

(Value in Lac Taka)

Sl No	Procuring Entity ID & Name	Total Procurements						Contracts Reviewed					
		No	Value in Taka/ Million	Total				Goods/Works					
				No	%	Value	%	OTM		DPM		SSTEM	
1.	UREDS-DCSD	113	7966.83	04				No	Value	No	Value	No	Value
2.	REE-REDP-2	145	3341.74	04									
3.	CSS-REP	26	572.79	04									

N.B: In addition, 3 (three) procurement contracts of works of Tk.----- awarded by SE Rangpur Zone under project ----- were reviewed and are Annexed: A-6, A7, A8.

2.2 Selection of procurement contracts :

From the lists supplied by the Project Directors/Procurement Entities, BREB, the following procurement contracts have been selected for the post procurement review:

A.Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System: Dhaka, Chittagong & Sylhet Division. (UREDS-DCSD):

SL. NO	Cont. Pkg. No.	Description of Procurement	TYPE	Contract Price (USD/Taka)	Method / Type
1	UREDS-G-02-001	Supply of ACS R conductor	Goods	USD 12,791,400	OTM/NCT
2	UREDS-G-04-001	Supply of SPC pole	Goods	USD 15,462,517	OTM/NCT
3	UREDS-MY-1CW-03-001	Construction of C-type, D-type, E-type and rest house building at Mymensingh PBS-1, HQ	Works	BDT4,70,17,678.68	OTM/NCT
4	UREDS-S-03	Supervision Management Consultancy Service	Service	USD 2,854,333 + BDT 155,017,065	OTM/NCT

Project Management Unit (PMU) , headed by PD, procures Goods, Services, civil construction works and 33 KV lines construction works. While the works of 11 KV line construction works are procured by 7 District Management Units (DMU), headed by Superintendent Engineer (SE) in each district .

Procurements under UREDS-DCSD for FY: 2015-2016 contained 73(seventy three)packages and total values were BDT 7966.83 million. Out of the 73(seventy three) contracts, PMU procured 19(nineteen)packages of Goods amounting to BDT 6834.24 million and 1(one) package of Services amounting to BDT 272.7 million 43(forty three) packages of works (33 KV line construction) amounting BDT 599.30millions, 10(ten) packages of works (civil construction) amounting BDT 260.6 million.

7 (seven) DMUs procured 40 packages. of Works amounting to BDT 174.42 million. SE Dhaka (North) 6 packages amounting BDT 30.71 million in NCT, SE Dhaka (South) 5 packages amounting BDT 27.02 million in NCT, SE Faridpur 3 packages amounting BDT 14.5 million in NCT, SE Mymensingh 8 packages amounting BDT 29.4 million in NCT, SE Sylhet 4 packages amounting BDT 19.98 million in NCT, SE Comilla 7 packages amounting BDT 30.27 million in NCT, SE Chittagong 7 packages amounting BDT 22.55 million in NCT.

B. Rural Electrification Expansion – Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program (REE-RRDP-II):

SL. NO	Cont. Pkg. No.	Description of Procurement	TYPE	Contract Price (Taka)	Method / Type
1	RRDP-II-G-12/Lot-1	Supply of single phase distribution transformer	Goods	BDT 27,79,02,000.00	OTM/NCE
2	RRDP-II-G-16/Lot-2	Supply of single phase electronic meter	Goods	BDT 100537500.00	OTM/NCE
3	RRDP-II-G-23/Lot-1	Supply of Sub-station, hardware and connectors	Goods	BDT 28217417.33	DPM
4	RRDP-II-L-43-03-N	Construction of overhead line under Rajshahi PBS area.	Works	BDT 25,90,465.45	e-GP

Project Management Unit (PMU) procures Goods, having values above Tk 3135.35 million. Two district Management Unit (DMU) headed by Superintendent Engineer (SE) procures works (line construction) of total BDT 296.39 million. District Management Unit (DMU) Rangpur procure in the FY 2015-2016 total BDT 105.33 million out of which 33 package works BDT 105.33 million out of which 17 package –LTM 16 package e-GP LTM.

DMV Rajshahi Procure in the year 2015-2016 total BDT 191.06 million in 82 package 79 package in LTM and 3 package in eGP-LTM.

C. Construction of Switching Station for Rural Electrification Program:

SL. NO	Cont. Pkg. No.	Description of Procurement	TYPE	Contract Price (Million Taka)	Method / Type
1	CSS-REP.P/CSS-03-1	Supply of ACSR conductor	Goods	BDT 13,62,71,900.00	OTM/NCT
2	CSS-REP.P/CSS-07-02	Supply of SPC Pole (55 ft)	Goods	BDT 11,34,17,600.00	OTM/NCT
3	CSS-REP.P/CSS-07-01	Supply of SPC Pole (45 ft)	Goods	BDT 9,96,19,000.00	OTM/NCT
4	33KV-JPA-N-L-03N	Construction of 33 KV line under Jaypurhat PBS area	Works	BDT 24,81,311.94.00	e-GP

Total numbers of packages of goods, works and services of the 3 projects are 284 nos. with total values of BDT 12145.79 million. Total numbers of selected sample contract packages from 3 projects are 12 nos. which amount to BDT 3600.32 Million.

Review of selected sample contracts cover 4.23% of total numbers of contracts awarded by 3 project in FY; 2015-2016 . In respect of values the selected sample contracts cover 29.64% of total values of procurements executed by the 3 projects.

Project Management Unit (PMU) procures Goods, having values above Tk 526.90 million in 5(five) packages. All packages are in OTM. Three District Management Unit (DMU) headed by Superintendent Enginner(SE) procures works (line construction) of total BDT 46.21 million. District Management Unit (DMU) Rangpur Zone procure in the FY 2015-2016 procure 5(five) packaes of total BDT 11.76 million in LTM. District Management Unit (DMU) Rajshahi Zone procure in the FY 2015-2016 procure 5(five) packaes of total BDT 11.40 million out of each 4 packages in LTM and 1 package e-GP. District Management Unit (DMU) Khulna Zone procure in the FY 2015-2016 procure 9(nine) packaes of total BDT 17.04 million in LTM. Director, CS&M procure 2(two) package of total BDT 6.02 million in OTM.

Chapter Three

3.0 Brief description of 3 (three) Projects :

Based on the information and documents obtained from the PEs, brief descriptions of the 3 projects were prepared. Project wise descriptions are presented below:

3.1 Name of Project: Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System Dhaka, Chittagong & Sylhet Division. (URED-DCSD)

3.1.1 Background: The Government of people's Republic Bangladesh has undertaken of Up-gradation of Rural Electric Distribution System(URED) Project under the Rural Electricity Transmission and Distribution (T&D) project with the financial support from the International Development Agency (IDA) with the objective of reducing system losses and enhancing capacity in the rural distribution network in the eastern part of Bangladesh. The Project has been designed to address the investment gap in the medium-voltage rural primary distribution network (33 KV) and main 11 KV lines. The project will cover construction of new lines, rehabilitation/upgrading of lines, and construction of substations to complement the rapid expansion of the lower-voltage network that occurred over the last decade. To overcome the low-voltage problem, URED-DCSD covers three Districts Electrification works in 39.PBS funded by World Bank and GOB.

3.1.2 Completion Time: The Project started July 2014 with the target to finish by 30 June 2018.As per original DPP. The physical works of the projects as of now is about 60%, so it will not possible to close the project by 30 June 2018.

REP processed to extended the project period for 12 (Twelve) months i.e. up to June 2019 from the original date of expiry.

3.1.3 Cost of the Project:

- i) Total :51983.33 million Taka
- ii) GOB(F.E) : 12933.33 million Taka
- iii) PA (RPA) :37050.00 million Taka
- iv) PBS OWN FUND : 2000.00 million Taka

3.1.4 Geographical Area: URED-DCSD coves 230 upazilasof Dhaka, Chittagongand Sylhet District under 39 PalliBidyutSamity(PBS).

3.1.5 Major Component of the Project: Major Components of this projects are construction of 110 nos. 33/11 KV Substation, 32 nos. River Crossing Towers and 29 nos. Switching Stations.

Construction of 33 KV new line	:	2728 Km.
Up-gradation of 33 KV line	:	887 Km.
Construction of 11 KV New line/up-gradation:		2634 Km
Installation of 33/11 KV New Sub-stations :		110 No
Installation of River crossing tower	:	32 Set
Installation of Switching station	:	31 No

3.2 Name of Project: Rural Electrification Expansion – Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program (REE-RRDP-II).

3.2.1 Background: The BREB currently owns and operate about 2,52,000 km. distribution lines, 495 No 33/11 KV Sub-stations to serve 9.80 million consumers through it's 72(seventy two) Rural Electric co-operatives called PalliBidyutSamity (PBS) throughout the country. GOB has declared vision for universal access of electricity by 2021. To meet the growing electricity demand and to meet the goal of universal access of electricity by 2021, the GOB has taken an extensive plan to add more than 11,500 MW electricity to the national grid by the year 2015. To evacuate the additional power BREB has also prepared its Plan for proper utilization of additional power.

BREB would be the prime electricity user by expanding distribution network in the rural areas. The rural distribution system under BREB ad the leading energy user in Bangladesh therefore needs to expand distribution network in the rural areas, while creating to the growing load.

A project titled Rural Electrification Expansion Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program-II is being running in 2014. So, to continue the consumer connection for homogeneous development of the country this project Rural Electrification Expansion Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program-II has been prepared for new consumer connection by expanding distribution network in 21(twenty one) PBSs area under Rajshahi and Rangpur division. To overcome the low-voltage problem, REE-RRDP-II covers two Districts Electrification works in 21. PBS funded by World Bank and GOB.

3.2.2 Completion Time: The Project started July 2014 with the target to finish by 30 June 2018.As per original DPP. The physical works of the projects as of now is about 86%, so it will not possible to close the project by 30 June 2018.

REP processed to extended the project period for 12 (Twelve) months i.e. up to June 2019 from the original date of expiry.

3.2.3 Cost of the Project:

- | | |
|----------|-------------------------|
| i) Total | : 13852.00 million Taka |
| ii) GOB | : 13852.00 million Taka |

3.2.4 Geographical Area:REE-RRDP-II the project will be implemented in 125 Upazilas of 16 districts in the 21 nos. PBS of Rasjshahi and Rangpur Division in Bangladesh.

3.2.5 Major Component of the Project:

Construction of new Distribution Line (33 KV & below)	:	7,700km
Up-gradation/Renovation of Distribution Line	:	800 km
Construction of New sub-station	:	30nos (300 MVA)
Augmentation of sub-station	:	12 nos. (80 MVA)
Total consumer connection	:	3,25,000nos

3.3 Name of Project: Construction of Switching Station for Rural Electrification Program.

3.3.1 Background: PGCB has constructed 132/33 KV Grid Sub-Station at Magura, Panchagarh, Chuadang, Joypurhat without Switching Station. According to the taken decision of higher Archie, it has been agreed in principle that organization involved in electricity distribution system has to build its own switching station (including bus-bar, bay-breaker, isolator, CT-PT, metering and controlling system etc) according to their requirement.

Each PBSs are evacuating power of around 25 MW load by ¾ no. Sub-Station through 33 KV Source line. For this reason 33 KV sources line are overloaded and system loss is very high. To improve that capability of distribution system to keep pace with the consumer growth and minimize the system loss of the said PBSs construction of Switching Station is urgently needed.

The overall objective of the project are to upgrade and to enhance capacity of the Rural distribution network to meet the increasing demand of electricity, to minimize the load shedding in the rural areas under Rural Electrification (RE) program and thus achieving reliability of distribution system for grater satisfaction of consumers as well as to reduce system loss of the distribution system. This will also improve the operational and financial performance of PBSs. Also access to reliable and un-interrupted electricity is a prime requirement for both economic development and irrigation purposes and thus creates employment opportunities, Strengthens health facilities, and improves education & literacy facilities, and to contribute to national GDP.

3.3.2 Completion Time: The Project started July 2014 with the target to finish by June 2016. The project had been completed in stipulated time.

3.3.3 Cost of the Project:

i)	Total	: 1215.80 million Taka
ii)	GOB	: 1214.04 million Taka
iii)	BREB	: 1.76 million Taka

3.3.4Geographical Area:Construction of Switching Station for Rural Electrification Programproject covers27 Upazilas of 6 Districts in 4 PBS.

3.3.5 Major Component of the Project:

(a) Construction of 33 KV New Sub-Transmission Line	: 210 km.
(b) Construction of 33 KV New Switching Station	: 04 Nos

Chapter Four

4.0 Individual Contract Review:

Individual contract review of the selected contracts has been undertaken in the Format prescribed by the CPTU. Individual contract review incorporating part-1: General information, Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules and Part-3: Post review of goods/works contract, Part-4: Report on physical inspection, has been annexed as follows.

Sl. No	Contract Pkg.	Procurement Contracts Reviewed	Annexure
1)	UREDS-G-02-001 dated: 06.09.2015	Supply of ACSR conductor (D-1, D-4,D-5, D-6 & D-28)	Annex: A -1 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
2)	UREDS-G-04-001 dated 06.09.2015	Supply of SPC Pole (R-44,R-46,R-47,R-48,R-49,R-50 & R-51)	Annex: A -2 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
3)	UREDS-MY-1-CW-03-001 dated 03.03.2016	Construction of C-Type, D-Type, E-Type and Rest House Building at Mymensingh PBS-1 H/Q	Annex: A-3 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
4)	UREDS-S-03 dated 15.12.2015	Supervision and Management Consultancy Service	Annex: A-4 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
5)	RRDP-II-G-12-(Lot-1) dated 03.09.2015	Supply of Distribution Transformer (G-4,G-5,G-6,G-7,G-16 & G-17)	Annex: B-1 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
6)	RRDP-II-G-16-(Lot-2) dated 28.10.2015	Supply of Single Phase Electric Meters	Annex: B-2 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
7)	RRDP-II-G-23-(Lot-1) dated 01.07.2015	Supply of Sub-Station Hardware & Connectors.	Annex: B-3 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
8)	RRDP-II-L-43-03 dated:19.06.2016	Construction of OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS.	Annex: B-4 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
9)	CSS-03 dated: 13.07.2015	Supply of Bare Conductor (D-1, D-4, D-5, D-28)	Annex: C-1 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
10)	CSS-07-02 dated 16.07.2015	Supply of SPC Pole(50') R-48	Annex: C-2 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
11)	CSS-07-01 dated 16.07.2015	Supply of SPC Pole(50') R-47	Annex: C-3 (P-1,P-2,P-3 & P-4)
12)	CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03 dated:19.06.2016	Construction of 8.194 KM OHD Line under Jaypurhat PBS.	Annex: C-4 (P-1,P-2,PT-3 & P-4)

Chapter Five

5.0 Field visits:

Field visits were undertaken for physical inspection of the works as follows:

On 11-05-2018, site visit of the Mymensing PBS-1 (Muktagacha) was performed.

Completion time is excess than the time allowed in the contract. PD explained that some of desalting works need more to start the works and as the work is in the Residential area, So more time were required. The quality of the work is over all satisfactory. They follow the work orders and made proper supervision with the Engineers/Consultant.

On 11-05-2018 site visit of the Mymensing PBS-2 (Bhaluka) for physical verification of 33 KV Line Construction/Up-gradation at Mymensing PBS-2 are (Total 70.781km 33KV feeder line) meet with Mr. Shamimul Islam D. G.M(PBS) and Mr. Monir Hossain, Executive Engineer ,REB Completion time is excess than the time allowed in the contract. Field office and PD office explain that these obstacle from the local people for the right-off-way for construction of 33KV Line. So several times construction works were stopped and required extra time to complete the work. The Line Construction is standard and quality of the work is satisfactory.

On 15-05-2018 site visit of the Narsingdi PBS-2 for physical verification of 33 KV Line Construction/Up-gradation at Narsingdi PBS-2 are (Total 70.1 km). It is an on going project. THE PROGRAM IS SLOW. PD office and field office are advised to expedite the work to complete the work in schedule time.

Chapter Six

6.0 Procurement Management Capacity of the Procuring Entities :

Bangladesh Rural Electrification Board (BREB) is a big organization expanding its activities in rural areas all over Bangladesh. Each of the selected Procuring Entities has to spend every year a huge amount of money for procurement of goods, works and services. Procurement management capacity of the Procuring Entities is described below:

a) Project Director, Up- gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System Dhaka, Chittagong & Sylhet Division. (URED-DCSD)

In the Financial year 2015-2016, 113 (one hundred thirteen) number of Procurement Agreements of goods, works and services were awarded by the PE, total contract value of amount of TK. 788,02.73 lac. The PE has 2 (two) Deputy Project Director (Superintendent Engineer), 6(six) Deputy Director (Technical), 6 (six) Assistant Engineer, 6(six) Data Entry Operator, 5(five) office peon, 1(one) Director(Admin), 2(two) Deputy Director(Admin), 1(one) Asst. Director(Admin), 1(one)Director Finance, 1(one) Deputy Director(Finance.),1(one) Ass. Director(Finance.),1(one) Accountant(Finance.) and other staff to assist him in procurement management. 8(eight) officials received training on procurement arrangement by CPTU. In addition, the PE has a Finance Directorate under him for keeping accounts and bill payments. Procurements of goods are done by the PE. But the allocation and distribution of goods to the PBSs are done by the Material Planning, Standardization and Specification Directorate (MPSS) as per approved DPP. The goods are received by the Central Ware Houses (Khulna, Chittagong and Savar) that deliver the received goods to the PBSs as per allocation letter issued by the MPSS Directorate. Before delivery or receipt, pre-delivery inspection and/or post-landing inspection are carried out by the Inspection and Testing Directorate, BREB. After inspection and receiving of the goods bill of the supplier are recommended by the Clearing, Storage and Movement Directorate (CS & M), BREB. Final payments are made by the Finance Directorate under the project with the approval of the Procuring Entity.

Procurement of works contract is done by the concerned Superintendent Engineer (SE), Project, Zone office. Advertisement, opening and evaluation are carried out in the SE (project) zone office. The Evaluation report of the TEC is sent to PE for approval. PE send the evaluation report to chairman BREB for the approval. After approval, S.E Zone signs the contract agreement and issues a work order for execution of construction works. Supervision of works is carried out by the consulting firm appointed by BREB. The Executive Engineer and the Assistant Engineer of the SE Zone office also supervise contractual works. Completion certificate is given by the local engineer of the consulting firm and approved by the Executive Engineer and SE (project) zone office. The bills of quantities are sent to the PE for approval and payment.

b) Project Director : Rural Electrification Expansion – Rajshahi Rangpur Division Program-II (REE-RRDP-II).

In the Financial year 2015-2016, 145 (one hundred forty five) number of Procurement Agreements of goods and works were awarded by the PE, total contract value of amount of TK. 788,02.73 lac. The PE has 2 (two) Deputy Project Director (Superintendent Engineer), 3(three) Deputy Director (Technical/Executive engineer), 9 (nine) Assistant Engineer, 8(eight) Data Entry Operator, 4(four) office peon, 1(one) Deputy Director(Admin), 1(one) Asst. Director(Admin), 1(one) Deputy Director(Finance.),1(one) Ass. Director (Finance.), 1(one) Accountant (Finance.) and other staff to assist him in procurement management. 6(six) officials received training on procurement arrangement by CPTU. In addition, the PE has a Finance Directorate under him for keeping accounts and bill payments. Procurements of goods are done by the PE. But the allocation and distribution of goods to the PBSs are done by the Material Planning, Standardization and Specification Directorate (MPSS) as per approved DPP. The goods are received by the Central Ware Houses (Khulna, Chittagong and Savar) that deliver the received goods to the PBSs as per allocation letter issued by the MPSS Directorate. Before delivery or receipt, pre-delivery inspection and/or post-landing inspection are carried out by the Inspection and Testing Directorate, BREB. After inspection and receiving of the goods bill of the supplier are recommended by the Clearing, Storage and Movement Directorate (CS & M), BREB. Final payments are made by the Finance Directorate under the project with the approval of the Procuring Entity.

Procurement of works contract is done by the concerned Superintendent Engineer (SE), Project, Zone office. Advertisement, opening and evaluation are carried out in the SE (project) zone office. The Evaluation report of the TEC is sent to PE for approval. PE send the evaluation report to chairman BREB for the approval. After approval, S.E Zone signs the contract agreement and issues a work order for execution of construction works. Supervision of works is carried out by the consulting firm appointed by BREB. The Executive Engineer and the Assistant Engineer of the SE Zone office also supervise contractual works. Completion certificate is given by the local engineer of the consulting firm and approved by the Executive Engineer and SE (project) zone office. The bills of quantities are sent to the PE for approval and payment.

c) Project Director : Construction of Swtching Station for Rural Electrification Program.

In the Financial year 2015-2016, 26 (twenty six) number of Procurement Agreements of goods and works were awarded by the PE, total contract value of amount of TK. 788,02.73lac. The PE(Executive Engineer) has 4 (four) Assistant Engineer, 4(four) sub-Assistant Engineer, 2(two) Data Entry Operator, 1(one) office peon) and other staff to assist him in procurement management. 2(two) officials received training on procurement arrangement by CPTU. In addition, the PE has a Finance Directorate under him for keeping accounts and bill payments. Procurements of goods are done by the PE. But the allocation

and distribution of goods to the PBSs are done by the Material Planning, Standardization and Specification Directorate (MPSS) as per approved DPP. The goods are received by the Central Ware Houses (Khulna, Chittagong and Savar) that deliver the received goods to the PBSs as per allocation letter issued by the MPSS Directorate. Before delivery or receipt, pre-delivery inspection and/or post-landing inspection are carried out by the Inspection and Testing Directorate, BREB. After inspection and receiving of the goods bill of the supplier are recommended by the Clearing, Storage and Movement Directorate (CS & M), BREB. Final payments are made by the Finance Directorate under the project with the approval of the Procuring Entity.

Procurement of works contract is done by the concerned Superintendent Engineer (SE), Project, Zone office. Advertisement, opening and evaluation are carried out in the SE (project) zone office. The Evaluation report of the TEC is sent to PE for approval. PE send the evaluation report to chairman BREB for the approval. After approval, S.E Zone signs the contract agreement and issues a work order for execution of construction works. Supervision of works is carried out by the consulting firm appointed by BREB. The Executive Engineer and the Assistant Engineer of the SE Zone office also supervise contractual works. Completion certificate is given by the local engineer of the consulting firm and approved by the Executive Engineer and SE (project) zone office. The bills of quantities are sent to the PE for approval and payment.

Remarks: The project completed in time (as per DPP) Credits goes to Project Director. As he completed the project with minimum numbers of officer's.

Chapter Seven

7.0 Competition in Procurements

Number of sale of tender documents, number of tenderers participated and number of responsive tenderers are shown below:

Sl. No	Cont. Pkg no	T doc. Sold	No. Participated	Responsive (no)	Cont. Price(higher or lower)
1.	UREDS-G-02-001(Supply of ACSR conductor D-1, D-4,D-5, D-6 & D-28)	22	08	04	21.43% less than the estimated price
2.	UREDS-G-04-001(Supply of SPC Pole R-44,R-46,R-47,R-48,R-49,R-50 & R-51)	09	03	03	9.75% higher than the estimated price
3.	UREDS-MY-1-CW-03-001 (Construction of C-Type, D-Type, E-Type and Rest House Building at Mymensingh PBS-1 H/Q)	55	09	04	13.80% lower than the estimated price
4.	UREDS-S-03 (Supervision and Management Consultancy Service)	18	06(Short listed)	03	12.37% less than the estimated price
5.	RRDP-II-G-12-(Lot-1) (Supply of Distribution Transformer G-4,G-5,G-6,G-7,G-16 & G-17)	03	02	02	21.72% higher than the estimated price
6.	RRDP-II-G-16-(Lot-2) (Supply of Single Phase Electric Meters)	03	02	02	6.81% less than the estimated price
7.	RRDP-II-G-23-(Lot-1) (Supply of Sub-Station Hardware & Connectors).	01(DPM)	01	01	0.92% higher than the estimated price
8.	RRDP-II-L-43-03 (Construction of OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS).	23(LTM-e-GP)	23	23	5% lower than the estimated price
9.	CSS-03 -01(Supply of Bare Conductor D-1, D-4, D-5, D-28)	04	03	03	8.93% higher than the estimated price
10.	CSS-07-02 (Supply of SPC Pole R-48)	07	03	03	5.81 higher than the estimated price
11.	CSS-07-01 (Supply of SPC Pole R-47)	07	03	03	4.39% higher than the estimated price
12.	CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03 (Construction of 8.194 KM OHD Line under Jaypurhat PBS).	02	02	02	14.98% higher than the estimated price

From the above table it appears that, out of 12 procurement contracts, 1-3 tenderers participated in 7 procurements contracts, 8-9 tenderers participated in 2 procurements .

Chapter Eight

8.0 Findings

Strengths, deficiencies, non-compliance with the procurement Rules and acts and comments and recommendations have been described while reviewing individual procurement contracts and are annexed as Annex-A, Annex-B and Annex-C. The common findings are described below:

8.1 Strengths:

- a) Procuring Entities made Annual Procurement Plan with approval of Chairman.
- b) Advertisement in at least in one Bengali and one English national newspaper as per Rule.
- c) Procuring Entities used Standard Tender Documents in of CPTU procurement and put necessary information in TDS and other formats;
- d) TOC and TEC were formed as per Rule ;
- e) TEC/PEC completed evaluation in time as prescribed by Rule(inNos of 12 review Packages).
- f) NOA issued in time within 7 days from approval of award decision;
- g) Procurement contract agreements were signed in time within 28 days from NOA issue as per Rule;
- h) Above 30% of officials of the Procuring Entities involved in procurements received training on procurements.
- i) one PE completed the project works as per DPP allocated time(Switching station for Rural Electrification).

8.2 Weakness:

Non- Maintenance of Records and Documents:

- a) Records and documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant contract file as per provisions of Rule- 43 (1)(2)(3)(4) & Schedule- VIII (Part-A & B) of PPR-2008.
- b) Records of sending notifications of award for contracts for publications CPTU's website are not maintained as per Rule- 37 (2) PPR-2008;

8.3 Non-compliance with Acts and Rules:

- i. Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained as per provisions of Rule-6 and Rule 64(6) of PPR-2008;
- ii. Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed as per provisions of Rule- 97(4)(G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR- 2008;

- iii. Checklists showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17)(18) & Schedule – IV(Part-A) of PPR-2008.
- iv. Rule 36 of PPR-2008 states that the evaluation report by the TEC shall be directly sent to the tender approving authority. But, there is no record that TEC send the evaluation report to the tender approving authority in sealed envelope as per rule.

8.4 Difficulty in identification of procured goods at field level:

Goods Procured under a contract were received by Central Ware Houses (Khulna, Chittagong & Savar). The Ware Houses distributed the goods as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB Dhaka to the PBSs that received the goods and supplied the items to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBSs received goods from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied them to the contractors without contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there was also no mention of contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where the goods procured under a contract had been used.

8.5 Lack of updated official cost estimate:

Annual procurement plan was prepared by the procuring Entities and approved by the Chairman, BREB. But, the annual procurement plan with cost estimate was not updated on a quarterly basis as per Rule 16(10) of PPR-2008.

8.6 Weak Competition

Some of the selected procurement contracts competition was weak. From para-7.00 above it appears that 2-3 tenderers participated in 7(seven) contracts. where 2-9 tenderer purchase tender documents in two contracts 8-9 tenderers participated (where 22-55 tenderer purchased tender documents) and 4(four) tenderers were made responsive. This resulted in weak competition.

Chapter Nine

9.0 Recommendation

The recommendations for improvement are sated below:

Documentation and maintaining records from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations are to be maintained in the relevant contract file as per provisions of Rule- 43(1)(2)(3)(4) of PPR-2008. The Schedule- VIII (Part-A & B) of PPR 2008. The procuring Entities will maintain the records of each procurement contract as per Rules. The following essential may be kept in a contract file:-

- a) Copy of the official cost estimate with date for a particular contract as per rule 16(5) (a) (b), PPR-2008.
 - b) names and full address of the tenderers who submitted tender or proposal;
 - c) minutes of tender opening meeting as per rule – 94(11) of PPR-2008;
 - d) copy of the office order constituting Tender Evaluation Committee (TEC) and Tender opening Committee (TOC);
 - e) delivery and acceptance reports for goods and completion reports for works;
 - f) bill of quantities for works / measurement book submitted;
 - g) acknowledgement of receipts of payment by the tenderers;
 - h) original copy of advertisement in the Newspapers;
 - i) records of publishing advertisement in the PE's website;
 - j) records of sending notifications of award for contracts for publications in CPTU's website as per Rule -37(2) of PPR-2008;
 - k) Other documents as listed in the rules.
-
1. BREB may take care for making the official estimate based of the present market value, Annual procurement plan with cost estimate has to update on quarterly basis as per Rule-16(10) of PPR-2008. The, official cost estimate will kept in sealed cover that will be opened by TEC during evaluation as per rule 15(5)(a)(b), PPR-2008 estimated price.
 2. Evaluation Report shall be sent to by TEC/PEC/BEC directly to the tender approving authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.
 3. The time spent at each stage of procurement contract /schedule of activities to be maintained as per Rule-8(17) (18) and schedule –IV (Part-ka, kha, Gha) of PPR-2008.
 4. Step to be taken to complete the evaluation in time, avoiding the excess Evaluation time[for package –URED-S-G-02-001 (123 days), URED-S-G-04-001 (76 days), URED-S-S-03 (211 days), REE-RRDP-II-G-12(32 days), CSS-03(38 days), CSS-07-02 (38 days), CSS-07-01 (38 days)]. Evaluation time to the followed as per Rule-36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008.
 5. Board's approval time to be followed as per Rule -36(6), Schedule-III, Part-A of PPR-2008.
 6. Director MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the package number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the

contract number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.

7. Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations have to be maintained in the relevant contract file as per provisions of Rule 43(1) (2)(3)(4) of PPR-2008 and schedule –VIII (Part A & B).
8. The un-successful Bidder's to be notifying the causes of un-success with the refund of their Bank Guarantee after the contract sign with the successful Bidder as per section - 53 & section-63 of PPR 2006.
9. Insurance coverage are to be kept in the line construction works.
10. Frequent extension of contract completion time should be discouraged. For delay in completion of works by contractors, LD to be imposed as per contract.
11. Afford to be given for timely completion of every contract.
12. As per Rule- 46(1),(3),(6) PE will perform post procurement Review.
13. The notification of award for contracts to be published in CPTU's website as per Rule- 37(2) of PPR-2008.
14. Allocation letters and the Receiving Reports of the Goods should be kept in the contract file as proof of full execution of the goods under the contract.
15. Steps to be taken to sign the contract within the initial Tender validity time.
16. TEC Recommendation for higher price to be justified with reasonable cause.
17. The completion time for the line construction work to be counted from the date of signing of the contract avoiding the date of issuance of materials.
18. Biased on the materials availability, work order for line construction of be given for timely completion of the work.
19. Records and documentation of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations have to be maintained in the relevant contract file as per provision of Rule-43(1)(2)(3)(4) of PPR-2008 and the Schedule-VIII (Part-A & B) of PPR 2008.
20. Checklist with steps for tender opening has to be followed as per provisions of Rule- 97(4)(G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR 2008;
21. Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract number or the package number in the allocation letter and Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the contract number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.
22. Frequent extension of contract completion time of line works may be avoided.
23. More people to be trained on PPR/PPA for the project office for smooth implementation of the project.

Chapter Ten

10.0 Conclusion

The Government enacted 'The Public Procurement Act, 2006' (PPA-2006) and consequently made 'The Public Procurement Rules, 2008' (PPR-2008) for ensuring transparency, accountability, efficiency and fair competition in the procurement of goods, works or services using public funds. So compliance with the positives of Rules and Act should be ensured by the Procuring Entities. The reviewer believes that this kind of post procurement review will create consciousness and awareness in the Procuring Entities in the complying with the Rules and Act in procurement contracts for achieving competition, transparency and value for money in using public funds. The reviewer also feel that three months time is not adiqueiate for this job. It may be extended to 4-5 months for review.

Annex: A-1

Individual Contract Review Format(Package: UREDS-G-02-001)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	22 nd & 24 th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System; Dhaka, Chittagong, & Sylhet Division, (UREDS;DCSD) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Reference No.	ACSR conductor (D1-2000 Km, D4-300 Km, D5-800 Km, D6-100Km,D28-500Km) UREDS-G-02-001 dated: 06.09.2015
Contract Amount	USD 12,791,400
Procurement Type	ICT
Category of Procurement	Goods
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under UREDS.DCSD Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	World Bank, IDA Credit No. 5381-BD

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (URED-S-G-02-001)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (18.05.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque :04.12.2014 Star :04.12.2014
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU :07.12.2014 UN Development Business website :01.12.2014
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008 and IDA
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	22(Twenty Two)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	08(Eight)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :04.12.2014 Submission :19.01.2015 46 days(preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	04(Four)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	05(Five)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	02 (Two) 2 (two) consultant from IDA
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary, Power Division, MPEMR
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		

5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] BEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :19.01.2015 Evaluation :06.04.2015 77 days (opening- evaluation) IDA concurrence :08.04.2015 Approved by IDA :01.05.2015 23 days (for IDA approval). Submission to Board :19.05.2015 Scrutiny by Board :19.05.2015 120 days(opening–BREB approval) Submission to Ministry :25.05.2015 126 days (opening-sub. Ministry) Approval of CCGP :22.07.2015 58 days(sub.-approval by CCGP) Concurrence by Ministry : 06.08.2015 73 days(sub.-approval by Ministry)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/ submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] BEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :19.01.2015 Evaluation :06.04.2015 77 days (opening-evaluation)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	04 (Four)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/ Proposals		

6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) + review time by development partner [R-36(6)-schedule- III, Part-A]	Evaluation :06.04.2015 Submission to Ministry :25.05.2015 Approval order from Ministry :06.08.2015 (with approval of CCGP) 122 days (evaluation - approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	-
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board and Power Ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :06.08.2015 NOA issue :09.08.2015 03 days (approval- NOA issue) Contract signing :06.09.2015 28 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) + review time by development partner [R-36(6)-schedule- III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :25.05.2015 Approval order from Ministry :06.08.2015 73 days (sub. Ministry-approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		IDA
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/ Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70 days (10 weeks) + + review time by development partner Opening to NOA :72 days +	Opening :19.01.2015 NOA issue :09.08.2015 202 days(opening- NOA Issue) Contract signing :06.09.2015

		Contract signing :28 days Opening to contract:100 days +	230 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/ PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT- Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:70 days (10 weeks) + + review time by development partner NOA to Contract signing: 28 days IFT to NOA : 100 days + IFT to contract :128 days +	IFT :04.12.2014 NOA :09.08.2015 248 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :06.09.2015 276 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 &2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not available
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1) & 117(10)]	NO
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		50% within 16 weeks &100% 24 weeks from contract day(06.09.2015) 50% : 27.02.2016 100% : 11.06.2016
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		50% : 25.02.2016 100% : 21.05.2016
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	0.05% Of contract price for each week of delay or part there of	N/A (within contract period)
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide	N/A

		whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A
9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director 1 Deputy Project Director (SE) 2 Deputy Director (Tech) 6 Asst. Engineer 6 Computer Operator 6 Peon 5 Director (Admin) 1

			Deputy Director (Admin) 2 Asst. Director (Admin) 1 Director Finn 1 Deputy Director (Finn.) 1 Asst. Director (Finn.) 1 Accountant 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 8(eight) completed trainings

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (URED-G-02-001)

Date of Review: 22 nd & 24 th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Number and Date supply of ACSR Conductor (D1-200 Km, D4-300 Km, D5-800 Km, D6-100Km, D28-5000Km). URED-G-02-001 dated 06.09.2015	Contract Amount: USD 1,27,91,400.00
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S BRB Cables Industries Ltd. BSCIC Industrial Estate Kushtia-7000, Bangladesh	

Procurement Method : ICT, OTM

Category : Goods

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc.), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per standard Tender document of IDA.
Advertising	Advertised on 04.12.2014 with other 8 packages/sub-packages in the Daily Ittafaq and the Daily Star (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper), CPTU's website on 07.12.2014 and UN Development Business website 01.12.2014 as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule -X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	N/A
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	46 days (preparation-submission)
Tender opening	Tender was received and opened at one place (Big. Gen.

and minutes of Tender opening	Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka) on 19.01.2015. Tender Opening Sheet (TOS) was prepared, and signed by BOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f). Signatures of the attending tenderers or then authorized representatives were obtained without mentioning their names & designation.
Tender security records	Tender security records (Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount) with their confirmations are available in PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	<p>Commercial, financial and technical evaluation was done by the BEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report, detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record, financial capability etc. Verification of authenticity of the Bid security and credit facilities were also carried out by BEC.</p> <p>and 01 (one) tender M/S TBEA Deyang Cable Co. Ltd. China, was technically non-responsive for submission of false test report.</p> <p>The name of the participating Bidders are follows:</p> <p>01) M/S Apar Industries Ltd. India.</p> <p>02) M/S TBEA Deyang Cable Co. Ltd. China</p> <p>03) M/S Wuxi Jiangnan Cable Co. Ltd, China</p> <p>04) M/S Aerospace Electric Group Co. Ltd. China</p> <p>05) M/S Hangzhou Cable Company Ltd, China</p> <p>06) M/S SBS Cable Limited, Bangladesh</p> <p>07) M/S BRB Cables industries Ltd, BSCIC Industrial Estate, Kushtia-7000, Bangladesh</p> <p>08) M/S Zhongli Science and Technology Group Co. Ltd. China</p>
Contract document	<p>The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and</p> <p>(i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.</p>
Advance payment guarantee details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: 411020288692, Issue date: 20.09.2015, Expiry date: 16.06.2016, Guarantee amount: USD 1279140 issued by Standard Chartered Bank- 67, SCB House, Gulshan Aveneu, Dhaka-1212

Performance security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: IBBL/KST/BG-652/205, Issue date: 23.08.2015, Expiry date: 11.09.2017, Guarantee amount: USD 1279140 issued by Islami Bank Bangladesh Limited Kushtia.																																																																																																																													
Complaints and Appeals	N/A																																																																																																																													
Contractual completion date	50% within 16 weeks & 100% 24 weeks from contract day(06.09.2015) 50% : 27.02.2016 100% : 11.06.2016																																																																																																																													
Actual completion date	50% : 25.02.2016 100% : 21.05.2016																																																																																																																													
Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																																																																																																													
Delivery receipt or like instrument	<table><tr><td colspan="9">Khulna Ware House</td></tr><tr><td>RR NO.</td><td>5839</td><td>5849</td><td>5927</td><td>5931</td><td>5960</td><td>5756</td><td>5784</td><td>5882</td></tr><tr><td>Date</td><td>25.02.16</td><td>02.03.16</td><td>26.04.16</td><td>28.04.16</td><td>22.05.16</td><td>29.12.16</td><td>25.01.16</td><td>24.03.16</td></tr><tr><td colspan="9">(D1-800 km, D-28-2000 km, D4-120 km, D5-320 km, D6-40 km) = 3280 km.</td></tr><tr><td colspan="9">Dhaka Ware House (Savar)</td></tr><tr><td>RR NO.</td><td>100909</td><td>10927</td><td>100988</td><td>100991</td><td>101015</td><td>100863</td><td>100879</td><td>100952</td></tr><tr><td>Date</td><td>25.02.16</td><td>01.03.16</td><td>26.04.16</td><td>28.04.16</td><td>24.05.16</td><td>29.12.16</td><td>25.01.16</td><td>24.03.16</td></tr><tr><td colspan="9">(D1-800 km, D28- 1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) =2460 km.</td></tr><tr><td colspan="9">Chittagong Ware House</td></tr><tr><td>RR No.</td><td>100628</td><td>100637</td><td>100694</td><td>100696</td><td>100707</td><td>100671</td><td>100594</td><td>100604</td></tr><tr><td>Date</td><td>25.02.16</td><td>02.03.16</td><td>26.04.16</td><td>28.04.16</td><td>23.05.16</td><td>24.03.16</td><td>29.12.15</td><td>25.01.16</td></tr><tr><td colspan="9">(D1-600 km, D28-1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) = 2460 km</td></tr><tr><td colspan="9">Total (3280 km+ 2460 km+ 2460 km)= 8200 km</td></tr></table>									Khulna Ware House									RR NO.	5839	5849	5927	5931	5960	5756	5784	5882	Date	25.02.16	02.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	22.05.16	29.12.16	25.01.16	24.03.16	(D1-800 km, D-28-2000 km, D4-120 km, D5-320 km, D6-40 km) = 3280 km.									Dhaka Ware House (Savar)									RR NO.	100909	10927	100988	100991	101015	100863	100879	100952	Date	25.02.16	01.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	24.05.16	29.12.16	25.01.16	24.03.16	(D1-800 km, D28- 1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) =2460 km.									Chittagong Ware House									RR No.	100628	100637	100694	100696	100707	100671	100594	100604	Date	25.02.16	02.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	23.05.16	24.03.16	29.12.15	25.01.16	(D1-600 km, D28-1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) = 2460 km									Total (3280 km+ 2460 km+ 2460 km)= 8200 km								
Khulna Ware House																																																																																																																														
RR NO.	5839	5849	5927	5931	5960	5756	5784	5882																																																																																																																						
Date	25.02.16	02.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	22.05.16	29.12.16	25.01.16	24.03.16																																																																																																																						
(D1-800 km, D-28-2000 km, D4-120 km, D5-320 km, D6-40 km) = 3280 km.																																																																																																																														
Dhaka Ware House (Savar)																																																																																																																														
RR NO.	100909	10927	100988	100991	101015	100863	100879	100952																																																																																																																						
Date	25.02.16	01.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	24.05.16	29.12.16	25.01.16	24.03.16																																																																																																																						
(D1-800 km, D28- 1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) =2460 km.																																																																																																																														
Chittagong Ware House																																																																																																																														
RR No.	100628	100637	100694	100696	100707	100671	100594	100604																																																																																																																						
Date	25.02.16	02.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	23.05.16	24.03.16	29.12.15	25.01.16																																																																																																																						
(D1-600 km, D28-1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) = 2460 km																																																																																																																														
Total (3280 km+ 2460 km+ 2460 km)= 8200 km																																																																																																																														
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	N/A																																																																																																																													

Timeliness of payment	<u>Payment Statement</u>					
	Payment Recommended by PD Office	Bill Amount (USD)	R/M-Refund (after completion) USD	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD	10% Advance Payment (USD)	Cheque Amount Payment Date
	21-09-2015		1279140.00		1279140.00	1279140.00 03.11.15
	28.01.2016	1693769.22		169376.922		1355015.38 01.02.16
	28.02.2016	3148587.18		314858.718		2518869.74 02.03.16
	07.03.2016	1606891.84		160689.184		1285513.47 15.03.16
	28.03.2016	1716577.51		171657.751		1373262.01 04.04.16
	27.04.2016	2065140.43		206514.043		1652112.35 28.04.16
	28.04.2016	1148783.04		114878.304		919026.62 05.03.16
	25.03.2016	1411650.78		141165.078		1129320.62 26.03.16
	31.05.2016					1279140.00 07.06.16
	Total	12791400.00			1279140.00	12791400.00
<p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the Chart.</p> <p>Direct Payment through World Bank.</p> <p>No IT & Vat deduction for the above Payment.</p>						
Others matters	<p>ACSR Conductor was received by Dhaka, Chittagong and Khulna Houses. The Ware Houses distributed the goods as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB. Dhaka to the PBSs that received the goods and supplied the items to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBSs received the goods from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 8200 km of ACSR Conductor purchased under the contract had been used.</p>					
Compliance with agreed	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the</p>					

<p>provisions</p> <p>Yes or No (Explain)</p>	<p>beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D)of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17)(18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f)It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of BEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 77 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p> <p>However as it is IDA funded Project, So PPR is not mandatory for all the steps.</p>
---	---

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (URED-S-G-02-01)

Procurement Item name and no	ACSR conductor (D1-2000 Km, D4-300 Km, D5-800 Km, D6-100Km,D28-500Km) =8200 Km.
Location	PE's Office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka.
Date of visit	25.04.2018, 28.04.2018& 221.04.2018
Date of Contract	Contract Signing : 06.09.2015
Contracted completion date (Original)	50% within 16 weeks &100% 24 weeks from contract day(06.09.2015) 50% : 27.02.2016 100% : 11.06.2016
Actual completion date	50% : 25.02.2016 100% : 21.05.2016
Contract value	USD : 12791400
Final Contract Value	USD : 12791400
Supplier Contractor	M/S, BRB Cable Industries Ltd., BSCIC Industrial Estate, Kushtia-7000, Bangladesh
Arrival Date at port	N/A

Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	Khulna Ware House								
	RR NO.	5839	5849	5927	5931	5960	5756	5784	5882
	Date	25.02.16	02.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	22.05.16	29.12.16	25.01.16	24.03.16
	(D1-800 km,D-28-2000 km, D4-120 km, D5-320 km, D6-40 km) = 3280 km.								
	Dhaka Ware House (Savar)								
	RR NO.	100909	10927	100988	100991	101015	100863	100879	100952
	Date	25.02.16	01.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	24.05.16	29.12.16	25.01.16	24.03.16
	(D1-800 km, D28- 1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) =2460 km.								
	Chittagong Ware House								
	RR No.	100628	100637	100694	100696	100707	100671	100594	100604
	Date	25.02.16	02.03.16	26.04.16	28.04.16	23.05.16	24.03.16	29.12. 15	25.01.16
	(D1-600 km, D28-1500 km, D4-90 km, D5-240 km, D6-30 km) = 2460 km								
Scope of work	Supply of SPC ACSRconductor (D1-2000 Km, D4-300 Km, D5-800 Km, D6-100Km,D28-500Km) =8200 Km.								
Materials (Supply and quality)	Supplied ACSRConductor-8200 Km as per Receiving Reports (RR) as mentioned above. The quality were verified by BREB team and fund satisfactory..								
Workmanship Quality	Before delivery of the goods, BREB's inspection team made pre-delivery inspection in the manufacture's factory to ensure the quality of materials as per specification and technical standards. After the delivery of the goods to the BREB's store at Savar. Post-delivery inspection was conducted by BREB's team for quality and quantity.								
Construction supervision	N/A								
Time overruns	N/A								
Cost overruns	N/A								
Deficiencies/ defects observed	ACSR Conductor was received by Dhaka, Chittagong and Khulna Houses. The Ware Houses distributed the goods as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB. Dhaka to the PBSs that received the goods and supplied the items to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBSs								

	received the goods from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 8200 km of ACSR Conductor purchased under the contract had been used.																																																																		
Timelines of payments to contractor	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Payment Statement</u></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Payment Recommended by PD Office</th><th>Bill Amount (USD)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion) USD</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD</th><th>10% Advance Payment (USD)</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>21-09-2015</td><td></td><td rowspan="9">1279140.00</td><td></td><td rowspan="9">1279140.00</td><td>1279140.00</td><td>03.11.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>28.01.2016</td><td>1693769.22</td><td>169376.922</td><td>1355015.38</td><td>01.02.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>28.02.2016</td><td>3148587.18</td><td>314858.718</td><td>2518869.74</td><td>02.03.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>07.03.2016</td><td>1606891.84</td><td>160689.184</td><td>1285513.47</td><td>15.03.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>28.03.2016</td><td>1716577.51</td><td>171657.751</td><td>1373262.01</td><td>04.04.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>27.04.2016</td><td>2065140.43</td><td>206514.043</td><td>1652112.35</td><td>28.04.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>28.04.2016</td><td>1148783.04</td><td>114878.304</td><td>919026.62</td><td>05.03.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>25.03.2016</td><td>1411650.78</td><td>141165.078</td><td>1129320.62</td><td>26.03.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>31.05.2016</td><td></td><td></td><td>1279140.00</td><td>07.06.16</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>12791400.00</td><td></td><td></td><td>1279140.00</td><td>12791400.00</td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the Chart. Direct Payment through World Bank. No IT & Vat deduction for the above Payment.</p>						Payment Recommended by PD Office	Bill Amount (USD)	R/M-Refund (after completion) USD	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD	10% Advance Payment (USD)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	21-09-2015		1279140.00		1279140.00	1279140.00	03.11.15	28.01.2016	1693769.22	169376.922	1355015.38	01.02.16	28.02.2016	3148587.18	314858.718	2518869.74	02.03.16	07.03.2016	1606891.84	160689.184	1285513.47	15.03.16	28.03.2016	1716577.51	171657.751	1373262.01	04.04.16	27.04.2016	2065140.43	206514.043	1652112.35	28.04.16	28.04.2016	1148783.04	114878.304	919026.62	05.03.16	25.03.2016	1411650.78	141165.078	1129320.62	26.03.16	31.05.2016			1279140.00	07.06.16	Total	12791400.00			1279140.00	12791400.00	
Payment Recommended by PD Office	Bill Amount (USD)	R/M-Refund (after completion) USD	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD	10% Advance Payment (USD)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																																													
21-09-2015		1279140.00		1279140.00	1279140.00	03.11.15																																																													
28.01.2016	1693769.22		169376.922		1355015.38	01.02.16																																																													
28.02.2016	3148587.18		314858.718		2518869.74	02.03.16																																																													
07.03.2016	1606891.84		160689.184		1285513.47	15.03.16																																																													
28.03.2016	1716577.51		171657.751		1373262.01	04.04.16																																																													
27.04.2016	2065140.43		206514.043		1652112.35	28.04.16																																																													
28.04.2016	1148783.04		114878.304		919026.62	05.03.16																																																													
25.03.2016	1411650.78		141165.078		1129320.62	26.03.16																																																													
31.05.2016					1279140.00	07.06.16																																																													
Total	12791400.00			1279140.00	12791400.00																																																														
Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.																																																																		

Annex: A-2

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: UREDS-G-04-001)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	22 nd & 24 th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System; Dhaka, Chittagong, & Sylhet Division, (UREDS;DCSD) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Reference No.	Supply of SPC Pole (R-44=5000 Nos, R-46=10,000 Nos, R-47=11,000 Nos, R-48=4,000 Nos, R-49=900 Nos, R-50=1,300 Nos, R-51=1,200 Nos) UREDS-G-04-001 dated 06.09.2015
Contract Amount	USD 15,462,517.00
Procurement Type	ICT
Category of Procurement	Goods
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under UREDS.DCSD Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	World Bank, IDA Credit No. 5381-BD

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (URED-G-04-001)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (18.05.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque : 04.12.2014 Star : 04.12.2014
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU : 07.12.2014 UN Development Business website : 01.12.2014
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008 and IDA
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	09 (Nine)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	03 (Three)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :04.12.2014 Submission :20.01.2015 47 days (preparation-sub.)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		

4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3(Three)[R-7, schedule-II]	04(Four)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	05(Five)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	02 (Two) 2 (two) consultant from IDA
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary, Power Division, MPEMR
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days[R-32] BEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening : 20.01.2015 Evaluation: : 06.04.2015 76 days (opening to evaluation) For IDA Concurrence : 08.04.2015 Approved by IDA : 01.05.2015 23 days (for IDA approval). Submission to Board : 19.05.2015 Scrutiny by Board : 19.05.2015 119 days(opening–BREB approval) Submission to Ministry : 25.05.2015 125 days (opening-sub. Ministry) Approval of CCGP : 22.07.2015 58 days(sub.-approval by Ministry) Concurrence by

			Ministry : 06.08.2015 73 days(sub.-approval by Ministry)
	Days actual between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] BEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :20.01.2015 Evaluation :06.04.2015 76 days (opening - evaluation)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	03 (Three)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week (70 days)+ (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) + review time by development partner [R-36(6)-schedule- III, Part-A]	Evaluation :06.04.2015 Submission to Ministry :25.05.2015 Approval order from Ministry :06.08.2015 (with approval of CCGP) 122 days (evaluation - approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	-
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope	Via BREB Board and Power Ministry

		[R-36(3)]	
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	<p>a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date</p> <p>[R-36(4)](a),schedule-II]</p> <p>b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA</p> <p>[R-102(11),schedule-II]</p>	<p>Approval :06.08.2015</p> <p>NOA issue :09.08.2015</p> <p>03 days (approval-NOA)</p> <p>Contract signing :06.09.2015</p> <p>28 days (NOA–contract signing)</p>
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	<p>CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period)</p> <p>+ review time by development partner</p> <p>[R-36(6)-schedule- III, Part-A]</p>	<p>Submission to Ministry :25.05.2015</p> <p>Approval by Ministry :06.08.2015</p> <p>(with approval of CCGP)</p> <p>73 days (sub. Ministry-approval)</p>
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		IDA
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and	<p>Safe Custody:2 days [R-32]</p> <p>Evaluation to NOA:70 days (10 weeks) +</p> <p>+ review time by</p>	<p>Opening :20.01.2015</p> <p>NOA issue :09.08.2015</p>

	issuance of NOA/PO/ Contract signing/LOI	development partner Opening to NOA :72 days Contract signing :28 days Opening to contract:100 days +	201 days(opening-NOA issue) Contract signing :06.09.2015 229 days (opening -contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT- Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:70 days (10 weeks) + + review time by development partner NOA to Contract signing: 28 days IFT to NOA : 100 days + IFT to contract :128 days +	IFT :04.12.2014 NOA :09.08.2015 248 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :06.09.2015 276 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not available
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/ Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1) & 117(10)]	NO
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/		100% within 52 weeks from contract day(06.09.2015)

	Delivery		50% : 23.01.2016 100% : 05.09.2016
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		50% : 23.01.2016 100% : 17.12.2016
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	0.05% Of contract price for each week of delay or part there of	N/A
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint[R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A
9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A

10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director- 1 Deputy Project Director (SE) 2 Deputy Director (Tech)- 6 Asst. Engineer- 6 Computer Operator- 6 Peon- 5 Director (Admin)- 1 Deputy Director (Admin)- 2 Asst. Director (Admin)- 1 Director Finn- 1 Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1 Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1 Accountant- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 8(eight) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (UREDS-G-04-001)

Date of Review: 22nd & 24th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract No. and Date Supply of SPC Pole (R-44=5000 Nos, R-46=10,000 Nos, R-47=11,000 Nos, R-48=4,000 Nos, R-49=900 Nos, R-50=1,300 Nos, R-51=1,200 Nos). UREDS-G-04-001dt 06.09.2015	Contract Amount: USD 15,462,517
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S Contech Construction Ltd. JV with DADA Engineering Ltd. TSCD Power Ltd. and Royal Green Products Ltd. Dhaka, Bangladesh	

Procurement Method: ICT, OTM

Category: Goods

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per standard Tender document of IDA.
Advertising	Advertised on 04.12.2014 with other 8 packages/sub-packages in the Daily Ittfaq and the Daily Star (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper), CPTU's website on 07.12.2014 and UN Development Business website 01.12.2014 as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule –X& XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	N/A
Time allowed for	47 days (preparation-submission)

submission of Tenders	
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	Tender was received and opened at one place (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka) on 19.01.2015. Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by BOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f). Signatures of the attending tenderers or then authorized representatives were obtained without mentioning their names & designation.
Tender security records	Tender security records (Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount) with the confirmations are available in PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	<p>Commercial, financial and technical evaluation was done by the BEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report, detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record, financial capability etc. Verification of authenticity of the Bid security and credit facilities were also carried out by BEC.</p> <p>The name of the participating Bidders are follows:</p> <p>01) M/S Confidence Power Ltd. Bangladesh</p> <p>02) M/S Charka SPC Pole Ltd, Bangladesh</p> <p>03) M/S Contech Construction Ltd. JV with DADA Engineering Ltd. TSCD Power Ltd. and Royal Green Products Ltd. Dhaka, Bangladesh</p>
Contract document	<p>The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and</p> <p>(i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.</p>
Advance payment guarantee details and records	<p>i. Bank Guarantee NO: 1594150006, Issue date: 25.08.2015, Expiry date: 11.11.2017, Guarantee amount: USD 555,603.40 issued by Uttara Bank Gulshan</p> <p>ii. Bank Guarantee NO: SBL/GUL/CR/BG/2015/1900, Issue date: 03.09.2015, Expiry date: 21.11.2017, Guarantee amount: USD 308,971.45, issued by Standard Bank Gulshan</p> <p>iii. Bank Guarantee NO: 170/2015, Issue date: 25.08.2015, Expiry date: 08.12.2017, Guarantee amount: USD 402,369 issued by</p>

	iv. Mercentile Bank Dhaka Bank Guarantee NO: DG-PB-802-1550106, Issue date: 24.08.2015, Expiry date: 11.11.2017, Guarantee amount: USD 279,308.11 issued by Commercial Bank of Ceylon Motijheel.
Per security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: 1594150006, Issue date: 25.08.2015, Expiry date: 11.11.2017, Guarantee amount: USD 555603.40 issued by Uttara Bank Ltd. Gulshan Dhaka.
Protest & other matters	N/A
Contractual completion date	100% within 52 weeks from contract day(06.09.2015) 50% : 23.01.2016 100% : 05.09.2016
Actual completion date	50% : 23.01.2016 100% : 17.12.2016
Bill of lading, if any	N/A
Delivery receipt or like instrument	<p>Total 33400 Nos. of SPC pole were supplied to 45 PBS throughout the country by the contractor. Receiving of the Pole by the PBS are provided by PD Office. The receiving date was for December 2015 to October 2016. The total Pole delivered to different PBS are appended below.</p> <p>Gazipur-1791 Nos,Kishorganj-610 Nos,Munshiganj-1090 Nos,Sherpur-411 Nos,Chandpur-1-634 Nos,Chandpur-2-491 Nos,Chittagong-1-735 Nos,Chittagong-2-585 Nos,Comilla-1-585 Nos,Comilla-2-660 Nos,Feni-1290 Nos,Dhaka-2-1635 Nos,Mymensingh-3-560 Nos,Narayangonj-1-296 Nos,Narayangonj-2-757 Nos,Narsingdi-1-730 Nos,Narsingdi-2-1115 Nos,Coxs Bazar-535 Nos,Jamalpur-905 Nos,Netrokona-2958 Nos,Rajbari-264 Nos,Faridpur-688 Nos,Dhaka-1-625 Nos,Dhaka-3-610 Nos,Manikganj-1339 Nos,Shariatpur-506 Nos,Gopalganj-620 Nos,Madaripur-1085 Nos,Tangail-1426 Nos,Netrokona-600 Nos,Mymensingh-1-778 Nos,Mymensingh-2-1880 Nos,Hobigon-1133 Nos,Comilla-3-2451Nos,Chittagong-3-690 Nos,B.Barua-680 Nos,Laksmipur-861 Nos,Noakhali-1070 Nos,Moulvibazar-482 Nos,Sunamganj-755 Nos,Sylhet-1-925 Nos,Sylhet-2-440 Nos.</p>
Liquidated damages, details	USD 135588.00

and enforcement for delays																																																																																										
Timeliness of payment	<div><div>Payment Statement</div><table><tr><th>Payment t Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion) USD</th><th>R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD</th><th>10% Advance Payment (USD)</th><th>Cheque Amount (USD)</th><th>Payment t Date</th></tr><tr><td>14.10.15</td><td></td><td rowspan="12">1410663.7</td><td></td><td rowspan="12">1546251.70</td><td>1546251.70</td><td>23.11.15</td></tr><tr><td>28.01.16</td><td>2801865.35</td><td>280186.535</td><td>2241492.28</td><td>04.02.16</td></tr><tr><td>25.01.16</td><td>1438030..30</td><td>140803.03</td><td>1150424.24</td><td>02.02.16</td></tr><tr><td>30.03.16</td><td>1184818.71</td><td>118481.871</td><td>947854.97</td><td>04.04.16</td></tr><tr><td>13.06.16</td><td>1640858.50</td><td>164085.850</td><td>1312686.80</td><td>16.06.16</td></tr><tr><td>16.06.16</td><td>1614327.89</td><td>161432.789</td><td>1291462.31</td><td>20.06.16</td></tr><tr><td>20.06.16</td><td>1793154.99</td><td>179315.499</td><td>1434523.99</td><td>27.06.16</td></tr><tr><td>22.09.16</td><td>1104632.82</td><td>110463.282</td><td>883706.26</td><td>26.09.16</td></tr><tr><td>04.09.16</td><td>944798.75</td><td>94479.875</td><td>755839.00</td><td>08.09.16</td></tr><tr><td>30.10.16</td><td>1530078.67</td><td>153007.867</td><td>1224062.94</td><td>01.11.16</td></tr><tr><td>27.12.16</td><td>1409951.02</td><td>140995.102</td><td>1127960.82</td><td>03.01.17</td></tr><tr><td>23.02.17</td><td></td><td></td><td>1410663.70</td><td>02.03.17</td></tr><tr><td></td><td></td><td>135588.00</td><td>L/D</td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>Total</td><td>15462517.00</td><td>1546251.70</td><td>1546251.70</td><td>1546251.70</td><td>15326929.00</td><td></td></tr></table><p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart.</p><p>Direct Payment though World Bank.</p><p>No IT & Vat deduction for the above Payment.</p></div>							Payment t Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion) USD	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD	10% Advance Payment (USD)	Cheque Amount (USD)	Payment t Date	14.10.15		1410663.7		1546251.70	1546251.70	23.11.15	28.01.16	2801865.35	280186.535	2241492.28	04.02.16	25.01.16	1438030..30	140803.03	1150424.24	02.02.16	30.03.16	1184818.71	118481.871	947854.97	04.04.16	13.06.16	1640858.50	164085.850	1312686.80	16.06.16	16.06.16	1614327.89	161432.789	1291462.31	20.06.16	20.06.16	1793154.99	179315.499	1434523.99	27.06.16	22.09.16	1104632.82	110463.282	883706.26	26.09.16	04.09.16	944798.75	94479.875	755839.00	08.09.16	30.10.16	1530078.67	153007.867	1224062.94	01.11.16	27.12.16	1409951.02	140995.102	1127960.82	03.01.17	23.02.17			1410663.70	02.03.17			135588.00	L/D				Total	15462517.00	1546251.70	1546251.70	1546251.70	15326929.00	
Payment t Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion) USD	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD	10% Advance Payment (USD)	Cheque Amount (USD)	Payment t Date																																																																																				
14.10.15		1410663.7		1546251.70	1546251.70	23.11.15																																																																																				
28.01.16	2801865.35		280186.535		2241492.28	04.02.16																																																																																				
25.01.16	1438030..30		140803.03		1150424.24	02.02.16																																																																																				
30.03.16	1184818.71		118481.871		947854.97	04.04.16																																																																																				
13.06.16	1640858.50		164085.850		1312686.80	16.06.16																																																																																				
16.06.16	1614327.89		161432.789		1291462.31	20.06.16																																																																																				
20.06.16	1793154.99		179315.499		1434523.99	27.06.16																																																																																				
22.09.16	1104632.82		110463.282		883706.26	26.09.16																																																																																				
04.09.16	944798.75		94479.875		755839.00	08.09.16																																																																																				
30.10.16	1530078.67		153007.867		1224062.94	01.11.16																																																																																				
27.12.16	1409951.02		140995.102		1127960.82	03.01.17																																																																																				
23.02.17					1410663.70	02.03.17																																																																																				
		135588.00	L/D																																																																																							
Total	15462517.00	1546251.70	1546251.70	1546251.70	15326929.00																																																																																					
Evaluation	Commercial evaluation, financial evaluation and technical evaluation were done by the BEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. Verification of authenticity of documents such as Bid security, Credit facilities, Test reports, supply records were carried out by BEC.. In the evaluation report detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record the financial capability etc. with other technical & Financial detailed.																																																																																									
Compliance with agreed provisions Yes or No (Explain)	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p>																																																																																									

	<p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of BEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 76 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p> <p>However as it is IDA funded Project, So PPR is not mandatory for all steps.</p>
--	--

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (CSS-07-01)

Procurement Item name and no	Supply of SPC Pole (R-44=5000 Nos, R-46=10,000 Nos,R-47=11,000 Nos, R-48=4,000 Nos, R-49=900 Nos, R-50=1,300 Nos,R-51=1,200 Nos)=33400 Nos. .
Location	Total 45 PBS.
Date of visit	25.04.2018 & 28.04.2018 at PE's office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka
Date of Contract	Contract Signing : 16.07.2015
Contracted completion date (Original)	100% within 52 weeks from contract day(06.09.2015) 50% : 23.01.2016 100% : 05.09.2016
Actual completion date	50% : 23.01.2016 100% : 17.12.2016
Contract value	USD 15462,517.00
Final Contract Value	USD 15326923.00
Supplier Contractor	M/S Contech Construction Ltd. JV with DADA Engineering Ltd. TSCD Power Ltd. and Royal Green Products Ltd. Dhaka, Bangladesh
Arrival Date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	Total 33400 Nos. of SPC pole were supplied to 45 PBS throughout the country by the contractor. Receiving of the Pole by the PBS are provided by PD Office. The receiving date was for December 2015 to October 2016. The total Pole delivered to different PBS are appended below. Gazipur-1791 Nos,Kishorganj-610 Nos,Munshiganj-1090 Nos,Sherpur-411 Nos,Chandpur-1-634 Nos,Chandpur-2-491 Nos,Chittagong-1-735 Nos,Chittagong-2-585 Nos,Comilla-1-585 Nos,Comilla-2-660 Nos,Feni-1290 Nos,Dhaka-2-1635 Nos,Mymensingh-3-560 Nos,Narayanganj-1-296 Nos,Narayanganj-2-757 Nos,Narsingdi-1-730 Nos,Narsingdi-2-1115 Nos,Coxs Bazar-535 Nos,Jamalpur-905 Nos,Netrokona-2958 Nos,Rajbari-264 Nos,Faridpur-688 Nos,Dhaka-1-625 Nos,Dhaka-3-610 Nos,Manikganj-1339

	Nos,Shariatpur-506 Nos,Gopalganj-620 Nos,Madaripur-1085 Nos,Tangail-1426 Nos,Netrokona-600 Nos,Mymensingh-1-778 Nos,Mymensingh-2-1880 Nos,Hobigon-1133 Nos,Comilla-3-2451Nos,Chittagong-3-690 Nos,B.Barua-680 Nos,Laksmipur-861 Nos,Noakhali-1070 Nos,Moulvibazar-482 Nos,Sunamganj-755 Nos,Sylhet-1-925 Nos,Sylhet-2-440 Nos.
Scope of work	Supply of SPC Pole (R-44=5000 Nos, R-46=10,000 Nos,R-47=11,000 Nos, R-48=4,000 Nos, R-49=900 Nos, R-50=1,300 Nos,R-51=1,200 Nos) =33400 Nos.
Materials (Supply and quality)	Supplied SPC Pole R47-2600 Nos. as per Receiving Reports (RR)
Workmanship Quality	Before delivery of the goods, BREB's inspection team made pre-delivery inspection in the manufacture's factory to ensure the quality of materials as per specification and technical standards. After the delivery of the goods to the BREB's store. Post- delivery inspection was conducted by BREB's team for quality and quantity.
Construction supervision	N/A
Time overruns	Time over run and LD Imposed USD 135588.00
Cost overruns	N/A
Deficiencies/ defects observed	The SPC pole received by the PBSs from the contractor as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka. The PBSs received the SPC poles and supplied the item to different contractors working in the respective areas. The PBSs received SPC poles from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 3450.00 Nos of SPC poles purchased under the contract had been used.

Timelines of payments to contractor	<u>Payment Statement</u>						
	Payment t Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion) USD	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment) USD	10% Advance Payment (USD)	Cheque Amount (USD)	Payment t Date
	14.10.15		1410663.7		1546251.70	1546251.70	23.11.15
	28.01.16	2801865.35		280186.535		2241492.28	04.02.16
	25.01.16	1438030..30		140803.03		1150424.24	02.02.16
	30.03.16	1184818.71		118481.871		947854.97	04.04.16
	13.06.16	1640858.50		164085.850		1312686.80	16.06.16
	16.06.16	1614327.89		161432.789		1291462.31	20.06.16
	20.06.16	1793154.99		179315.499		1434523.99	27.06.16
	22.09.16	1104632.82		110463.282		883706.26	26.09.16
	04.09.16	944798.75		94479.875		755839.00	08.09.16
	30.10.16	1530078.67		153007.867		1224062.94	01.11.16
	27.12.16	1409951.02		140995.102		1127960.82	03.01.17
	23.02.17					1410663.70	02.03.17
			135588.00	L/D			
	Total	15462517.00	1546251.70	1546251.70	1546251.70	15326929.00	
	Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart.						
	Direct Payment though World Bank.						
	No IT & Vat deduction for the above Payment.						
	Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.					
The allocation Letters of the poles to the PBS and the Receiving Reports of the poles should be kept in the contract file as of full execution of the contract.							

Annex: A-3

Individual Contract Review Format(Package: UREDS-MY-1-CW-03-001)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	22 nd & 24th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System; Dhaka, Chittagong, & Sylhet Division, (UREDS;DCSD) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Reference No.	Construction of C-type, D-type, E-Type & Rest House Building at Mymensingh PBS H/Q (C-type-1x130 m ² , D-type-6x100 m ² , E-type-2x93 m ² , Rest house-1x210 m ²) UREDS-MY-1-CW-03-001 dated 03.03.2016
Contract Amount	BDT 4,70,17,678.68
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Works
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	Civil construction for 3 (three) type Residential Building is required for proper accommodation of the BREB officers under Mymensingh PBS. Renovation works of Rest House Building will help the officers and Guests who visit the mymensingh PBS for short duration of official works.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	World Bank, IDA Credit No. 5381-BD

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (URED5-MY-1-CW-03-001)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (18.05.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Amadersomoy :08.11.2015 Dhaka Turbine :08.11.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU :09.11.2015
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	Followed PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	55 (Fifty five)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	09 (Nine)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; At least 21 days for above 2.00 crore up to 5.00 crore [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :08.11.2015 Submission :07.12.2015 29 days (preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	07(Seven)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	02 (Two) (Dr. Md. Shawkat Osman, DUET and Md. Shafiqullslan, XEN Civil Aviation Authority)

4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Chairman, BREB
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :07.12.2015 Evaluation :27.01.2016 51 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:08.02.2016 Approval by Board :08.02.2016 63 days(opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days[R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III,part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :07.12.2015 Evaluation: :27.01.2016 Submission to Board:08.02.2016 Approval by Board :08.02.2016 51 days (opening-evaluation) 63 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	04 (Four)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	HOPE-5 weeks (35 days) NOA- 1 week(7 days) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :27.01.2016 Approval by HOPE :08.02.2016 12 days (evaluation –Board’s Approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	HOPE	HOPE
6.3	Authority approved	HOPE	HOPE
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via PD to Chairman
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval	Approval :08.02.2016 NOA issue :10.02.2016

	sign/LOI	but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	02 days (approval-NOA) Contract signing :03.03.2016 22 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	weeks+ NOA -1 week; -Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to HOPE :08.02.2016 Approval by HOPE :08.02.2016 01 day (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		N/A
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		Chairman, BREB
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days Evaluation to NOA:42 days Opening to NOA:44 days Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:72 days [R-36(6)Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :07.12.2015 NOA issue :10.02.2016 65 days(opening-NOA issue) Contract signing :03.03.2016 87 days (opening-contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 14 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:42 days IFT to NOA:58 days Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:86days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	IFT :08.11.2015 NOA :10.02.2016 94 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :03.03.2016 116 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not available
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/ Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1) & 117(10)]	Yes within 120 days
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/		52 weeks (365 days) (Within 02.03.2017)

	Execution/ Delivery		
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		25.10.2017
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	Agrees Sum as specified in the Particular conditions of Contract	03 (three) times extension without LD
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A
9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No

12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		<p>Yes</p> <p>Project Director- 1</p> <p>Deputy Project Director (SE) -2</p> <p>Deputy Director (Tech)- 6</p> <p>Asst. Engineer- 6</p> <p>Computer Operator- 6</p> <p>Peon- 5</p> <p>Director (Admin)- 1</p> <p>Deputy Director (Admin)- 2</p> <p>Asst. Director (Admin)- 1</p> <p>Director Finn- 1</p> <p>Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1</p> <p>Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1</p>
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		<p>Yes</p> <p>8(eight) completed training</p>

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (URED5-MY-1-CW-03-001)

Date of Review: 22 nd & 24 th April,2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Contract No. and Date Construction of C-type, D-type, E-Type & Rest House Building at Mymensingh PBS H/Q -C-type-1x130 m ² , D-type-6x100m ² ,E-type-2x93 m ² ,Rest house-1x210 m ² URED5-MY-1-CW-03-001 dated 03.03.2016	Contract Amount: BDT 4,70,17,678.68
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S DeshEngg. & Development agency (Pvt) Ltd., KabiFaraqueSharani, H/N-11, Nikunja-2, Joarshara, Dhaka	

Procurement Method : NCT,OTM

Category :Works.

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 08.11.2015 with other 03(three) packages/sub-packages in the Amadersomoy and Dhaka Turbine (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper) and CPTU's website on 09.11.2015 as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule -X&XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	N/A
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	29 days (preparation-submission)
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	Tender was received and opened at one place (Office of the Project Director URED5;DCSD Project Training Academy Building (6 th floor) BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka) on 7.12.2015. Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by TOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f).

Tender security records	Tender security records such as Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount provided by the tenderers and the confirmations are available in PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	Verification of Authenticity of documents such as the Bid security, credit facilities Past experience, supply records etc were carried out by TEC. Experience of tenderer was done by TEC. The name of the participating Bidder are follows: 01) M/S MBCC-OMC JV 02) M/S S.R.L Joint Venture (JV) 03) M/S Md. FazlulHaqueHazan 04) M/S Green International 05) M/S DeshEngg. & Development agency (Pvt) Ltd. 06) M/S Ahsan Construction 07) M/S A.B Enterprise 08) M/S AbdusSamad Khan 09) M/S IB, M & Co. JV
Contract document	The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A
Per security details and records	Guarantee NO: OBL/UB/BG/02/2016, Issue date: 23.02.2015, Expiry date: 22.05.2017(Ext-22.11.2017),Guarantee amount: BDT 47, 01,768.00 issued by One Bank Ltd. Uttara, Dhaka. Guarantee extended up to 22.11.2017
Protest & other matters	N/A
Contractual completion date	52 weeks (365 days) (Within 02.03.2017)
Actual completion date	25.10.2017

Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																																																					
Delivery receipt or like instrument	Certificate of final inspection and acceptance was given by the local consultant of M/S Prokawshal Upodesta Limited on 01.02.2015, which was approved by the Executive Engineers.																																																																					
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	N/A																																																																					
Timeliness of payment	<div><div>Payment Statement</div><table><tr><th>Payment Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment))</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>25.05.16</td><td>5450000.00</td><td rowspan="8">2427607.00</td><td>545000.00</td><td>5722250.00</td><td>4332750.00</td><td>25.05.16</td></tr><tr><td>21.06.16</td><td>4045000.00</td><td>404500.00</td><td>404500.00</td><td>3236000.00</td><td>21.06.16</td></tr><tr><td>05.09.16</td><td>6395000.00</td><td>639500.00</td><td>734560.00</td><td>5020940.00</td><td>06.09.16</td></tr><tr><td>22.11.16</td><td>7350000.00</td><td>735000.00</td><td>808500.00</td><td>5806500.00</td><td>22.11.16</td></tr><tr><td>16.04.17</td><td>7800000.0</td><td>780000.00</td><td>858000.00</td><td>6162000.00</td><td>17.04.17</td></tr><tr><td>19.06.17</td><td>7000000.00</td><td>700000.00</td><td>770000.00</td><td>5530000.00</td><td>20.08.17</td></tr><tr><td>13.11.17</td><td>10512137.00</td><td>1051214.00</td><td>1156536.00</td><td>8304387.00</td><td>22.11.17</td></tr><tr><td>20.12.17</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>2427607.00</td><td>27.12.17</td></tr><tr><td>Total</td><td>48552137.00</td><td>2427607.00</td><td>4855214.00</td><td>5304346.00</td><td>40820184.00</td><td></td></tr></table></div> <div>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart</div>							Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	25.05.16	5450000.00	2427607.00	545000.00	5722250.00	4332750.00	25.05.16	21.06.16	4045000.00	404500.00	404500.00	3236000.00	21.06.16	05.09.16	6395000.00	639500.00	734560.00	5020940.00	06.09.16	22.11.16	7350000.00	735000.00	808500.00	5806500.00	22.11.16	16.04.17	7800000.0	780000.00	858000.00	6162000.00	17.04.17	19.06.17	7000000.00	700000.00	770000.00	5530000.00	20.08.17	13.11.17	10512137.00	1051214.00	1156536.00	8304387.00	22.11.17	20.12.17				2427607.00	27.12.17	Total	48552137.00	2427607.00	4855214.00	5304346.00	40820184.00	
Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																																																
25.05.16	5450000.00	2427607.00	545000.00	5722250.00	4332750.00	25.05.16																																																																
21.06.16	4045000.00		404500.00	404500.00	3236000.00	21.06.16																																																																
05.09.16	6395000.00		639500.00	734560.00	5020940.00	06.09.16																																																																
22.11.16	7350000.00		735000.00	808500.00	5806500.00	22.11.16																																																																
16.04.17	7800000.0		780000.00	858000.00	6162000.00	17.04.17																																																																
19.06.17	7000000.00		700000.00	770000.00	5530000.00	20.08.17																																																																
13.11.17	10512137.00		1051214.00	1156536.00	8304387.00	22.11.17																																																																
20.12.17					2427607.00	27.12.17																																																																
Total	48552137.00	2427607.00	4855214.00	5304346.00	40820184.00																																																																	
Evaluation	Commercial evaluation, financial evaluation and technical evaluation were done by the TEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. Verification of authenticity of documents such as Bid security, Credit facilities, Past experience, supply records were verified by TEC.. In the evaluation report detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of Past experience, supply record past experience the financial capability etc. with other technical & Financial detailed.																																																																					
Compliance with agreed	Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following: a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the																																																																					

<p>provisions</p> <p>Yes or No</p> <p>(Explain)</p>	<p>beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Records of confirmation of the tender securities of the participating tenderers as per Rule-24 (1) of PPR-2008 were not available in the file.</p> <p>f) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>h) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 51 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, past experience, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p>
--	--

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (URED5-MY-1-CW-03-001)

Procurement Item name and no	Construction of (C-Type, D-Type, E-Type and Rest House) Building at Mymensingh PBS-1 H/Q (C- type- 1x130 m2, D- type- 6x100 m2, E-type- 2x93 m2, Rest house- 1x210 m)
Location	Muktagacha, Mymensingh, (Mymensingh PBS-1 H/Q)
Date of visit	11.05.2018
Date of Contract	03.03.2016
Contracted completion date (Original)	52 weeks (365 days) (Within 02.03.2017)
Actual completion date	25.10.2017
Contract value	TK: 4,70,18,000
Final Contract Value	TK. 4,85,52,137.62
Supplier Contractor	M/S Desh Engg. & Development (Pvt) Ltd, Dhaka, Bangladesh (Lowest Bidder)
Arrival Date at project site/warehouse (Goods)	N/A
Scope of work	Construction of (C-Type, D-Type, E-Type and Rest House) Building at Mymensingh PBS-1 H/Q (C- type- 1x130 m2, D- type- 6x100 m2, E-type- 2x93 m2, Rest house- 1x210 m)
Materials (Supply and quality)	N/A
Workmanship Quality	
Construction supervision	Construction Supervision was under taken by the consultant M/SKarigariParamarsha Consulting Engineers appointed by BREB . The work also Supervised and monitor by the office of the

	Executive Engineer (O & M) REB Mymensingh and Project office (SE- Dhaka South)						
Time overruns	Contractual completion date was 25.11.2016. Time was expended three times up to 13.03.2017.						
Cost overruns	N/A						
Deficiencies/ defects observed	Contractual completion date was 02.03.2017. Time extended up to 25.10.2017 (3 rd time) with the approval of the Chairman, BREB. Final Bill paid after submission of as-Build-drawing by the contractor.						
Timelines of payments to contractor	<u>Payment Statement</u>						
	Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date
	25.05.16	5450000.00	2427607.00	545000.00	5722250.00	4332750.00	25.05.16
	21.06.16	4045000.00		404500.00	404500.00	3236000.00	21.06.16
	05.09.16	6395000.00		639500.00	734560.00	5020940.00	06.09.16
	22.11.16	7350000.00		735000.00	808500.00	5806500.00	22.11.16
	16.04.17	7800000.0		780000.00	858000.00	6162000.00	17.04.17
	19.06.17	7000000.00		700000.00	770000.00	5530000.00	20.08.17
	13.11.17	10512137.00		1051214.00	1156536.00	8304387.00	22.11.17
	20.12.17					2427607.00	27.12.17
Total	48552137.00	2427607.00	4855214.00	5304346.00	40820184.00		
Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart							
Comments and recommendations	a) Completion certificate should be issued immediately after proper inspection of the construction work and submission of as –built drawing by the construction. b) Completion time of contract should be extended with careful examination of the works. Extension of time again and again lead to delayed implementation of project activities. c) Afford to be given for timely completion of work.						

Annex: A-4

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: UREDS-S-03) Part-1: General.

Data of Review	22 nd April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Up-gradation of Rural Electricity Distribution System; Dhaka, Chittagong, & Sylhet Division, (UREDS;DCSD) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name And Reference	(Supervision and Management Consultancy Services : 682 man-month) UREDS-S-03 dated 15.12.2015
Contract Amount	USD 2,854,333 + BDT 155,017,065 inclusive of local indirect taxes (with 10% Contingency).
Procurement Type	ICT
Category of Procurement	Service: (Supervision and Management Consultancy Services : 682 man-month)
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	To support the Project Management Unit (PMU) of BREB in activities related to reviewing design, tendering, contracting, construction and supervision of the Project including the supervision of the Social and Environment Monitoring Program. The Consultant will also coordinate closely with the “Survey, Design and Supervision Local Consultants” of individual PBSs as well as the individual technical consultant and the individual procurement consultant for proper Implementation of the Project work. To accelerate economic activities in rural area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	World Bank, IDA Credit No. 5381-BD

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (18.05.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper[R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque :22.07.2014 Financial Express :22.07.2014
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU :22.07.2014 UN Development Website :17.07.2014
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008 and IDA
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	18 (Eighteen)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	18 (Eighteen)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :22.07.2014 Submission :25.08.2014 34 days (preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/POC/BOC and TEC/PEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/PEC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	04(Four)

4.2	No of member in TOC/PEC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	05(Five)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	02 (Two) 2 (two) consultant from IDA
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary, Power Division, MPEMR
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] PEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening (EOI) :26.08.2014 For IDA approval on (EOI) Evaluation :23.11.2014 89 days [opening –evaluation (EOI)] Approval of IDA(EOI):10.12.2014 17 days (for IDA approval). Submission for IDA approval on Draft RFP :15.12.2014 NOC of IDA on RFP:18.12.2014 RFP issue (6 short listed firm):23.12.14 Pre-bid on RFT :05.01.2015 Amendment of RFP:08.01.2015 RFP submission (2 envelope) :04.02.2015 Tech. Evaluation of RFP :14.03.2015 NOC of IDA (Tech- eval) :15.03.2015 Financial proposal open :18.03.2015 Submission to IDA for approval

			on Final evaluation(3- times negotiation with bidder) :07.09.2015 NOC of IDA (final evaluation) :09.09.2015 Submission to Ministry :25.10.2015 425 days (opening-submission Ministry) Approval of CCGP :02.12.2015 Concurrence by Ministry:20.12.2015 481 days(submission-approval by Ministry)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] BEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :26.08.2014 Evaluation (final) :07.09.2015 377days (opening -evaluation)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	02 (Two)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/ Proposals		

6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) + review time by development partner [R-36(6)-schedule- III, Part-A]	Evaluation (final) :07.09.2015 Submission to Ministry :25.10.2015 Approval order from Ministry : 20.12.2015 (with approval of CCGP) 104 days (evaluation - approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	-
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board and Power Ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval(CCGP) :02.12.2015 NOA issue :06.12.2015 04 days (approval-NOA) Contract signing :15.12.2015 09 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week(70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) + review time by development partner [R-36(6)-schedule- III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :25.10.2015 Approval order from Ministry :20.12.2015 (with approval of CCGP) 56 days (submission Ministry-approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		IDA
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		

7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70 days (10 weeks) + + review time by development partner Opening to NOA :72 days + Contract signing :28 days Opening to contract:100 days +	Opening :26.08.2014 NOA issue :06.12.2015 467 days(opening-NOA Issue) Contract signing :15.12.2015 476 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT- Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:70 days (10 weeks) + + review time by development partner NOA to Contract signing: 28 days IFT to NOA : 100 days + IFT to contract :128 days +	IFT :22.07.2014 NOA :06.12.2015 502 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :15.12.2015 511 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk. 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not available
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [Rub-19(1) & 117(10)]	NO
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery	4 years (Within June, 2018)	4 years (Within June, 2018)
8.2	Day actual for Supply/Execution/Delivery		Ongoing (appx. 65% done)

8.3	Amount of LD imposed		N/A
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A
9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl.	15% of the original contract price	No

	Delivery Orders etc. made	[R-77(ka)]	
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director- 1 Deputy Project Director (SE) -2 Deputy Director (Tech)- 6 Asst. Engineer- 6 Computer Operator- 6 Peon- 5 Director (Admin)- 1 Deputy Director (Admin)- 2 Asst. Director (Admin)- 1 Director Finn- 1 Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1 Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1 Accountant- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 8(eight) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (URED-S-03)

Date of Review: 22 nd & 24 th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract name, number and Date Supervision and Management Consultancy Services URED-S-03 dated 15.12.2015	Contract Amount : USD 2,854,333 + BDT 155,017,065 inclusive of local indirect taxes (with 10% Contingency).
Contractor's Name and Address: M/ S NRECA International Ltd, USA.	

Procurement Method: ICB, QCBS

Category: Firm (National/International), Service

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of contract & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per standard Tender document of IDA.
Advertising (REOI)	Advertised on 22.07.2014 in the Ittfaq and Financial Express (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper), CPTU's website on 22.07.2014 and UN Development Business website 17.07.14 as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule -X & XI of PPR-2008
Shortlist/ Verify number, name etc	In response of REOI, 18 (eighteen) Nos Tender participated PEC (Proposal Evaluation Committee) evaluated submitted 18 (eighteen) offer with the criteria of EOI documents and also verify their experience, financial strength etc. and shortlisted 6 (six) firms as appended below. It would be mentioned here that as per the IDA

	<p>guideline, maximum 2 (two) Firm from each country were short listed</p> <p>01) M/S WAPCOS Ltd., India</p> <p>02) Lahmeyer International (India) Private Limited, India.</p> <p>JV Partner:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Lahmeyer International GmBll, Germany. ii. PEMEC, Bangladesh iii. Atlanta Enterprise Limited (AEL), Bangladesh. <p>03) NRECA International Ltd.USA.</p> <p>04) ADEA Power Consulting Pty. Ltd., Australia.</p> <p>Sub Consultant:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. SODEV Consultant International Ltd., Bangladesh. <p>05) Det Norske Varitas Pte. Ltd., Singapore.</p> <p>Sub Consultants:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. ACE Consultants Ltd., Bangladesh. ii. Niaz & Associated Ltd., Bangladesh. <p>06) SMEC International Pty. Ltd., Australia.</p> <p>Sub Consultant:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Development Design Consultants Ltd., Bangladesh.
Request For Proposal:	<p>After NOC from IDA on the short listed 6 (six) Firms, RFP (Request for proposal- Financial & Technical) documents were prepared by the consultant and send the document for approval of IDA on 15.12.2014. IDA accord approval on RFP was issued to 6 (six) shortlisted firm on 23.12.2014 Pre-Bid meeting on RFP document on 18.12.2014. RFP was held on 05.01.2015. RFP was received on 04.02.2015 and the following 3 (three) firm submitted the RFP.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. M/S WAPCOS Ltd., India ii. NRECA International Ltd.,USA. iii. SMEC International Pty. Ltd., Australia. <p>Sub Consultant:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Development Design Consultants Ltd., Bangladesh.
Time allowed for Submission of proposals	<p>EOI:</p> <p>Advertisement: 22.07.2014</p> <p>Submission: 25.08.2014</p> <p>34 days (advertisement- submission of EOI)</p> <p>RFP:</p> <p>Issue on: 23.12.2014</p> <p>Issue of addendum:08.01.2015</p> <p>Submission: 04.02.2015</p> <p>16 days (RFP issue - Submission).</p>

Evaluation Criteria as per SRFP	In the SRFP, there are criteria mainly the experience of the Firms, No. of similar Project completed, Experience of the key experts (education, experience of the project, works area – out the home country), consultant's Organization and Experience. Approach, methodology and work plan etc. were the major criteria. The minimum qualifying marks were 75 out of 100 marks.														
Technical Evaluation	<p>As the RFP was submitted in 2(two) envelope (Technical & Financial) PEC performed Technical evaluation first. 3 (three) firms out of 6(six) short listed Firms submitted proposal. PEC follows the IDA guideline in evaluation of the proposals. PEC considered</p> <p>(a) Specific experience of the firm (similar assignment- 5 marks; experience in developing country-5 marks)- 10 marks.</p> <p>(b) Methodology and work plan (technical approach & methodology- 15 marks, work plan-10 marks + organization & staff-10 marks) - 35 marks.</p> <p>(c) Key experts qualifications & compliance with the assignment (Team leader- 12 marks, Senior Power Distribution specialist -10 marks, contract specialist – 5 marks, DTL- 8 marks, Distribution line specialist- 6 marks, S/S specialist – 6marks, social/environment specialist -4marks & sym analyst -4 marks) 55 marks.</p> <p>In Technical Evaluation, WAPCOS Ltd. obtained 57.98 marks, NRECA -89.28 marks and SMEC -78.06 marks. NRECA International Ltd USA obtained the highest marks (89.28).</p>														
Evaluation report comments if any (verify existence of Proposals)	PEC performed the Technical, Financial evaluation as per the Guidelines by IDA. PEC also performed the negotiation with the highest scored obtained bidder as per the Guideline of IDA. After negotiation, PEC prepared the Final evaluation. PEC also verify the submitted document of the Firms.														
Financial envelope opening	The Technical evaluation was send to IDA for approval on 15.3.2015, IDA issue no-objection (NOC) on Technical evaluation, On 18.03.2015, the financial offer of 2 (two) technically qualified bidder (M/S NRECA international Ltd, USA and SMEC international Pty Ltd, Australia) was opened.														
Combined quality and cost evaluation, approval	<p>PEC finished combined evaluation both technical and financial as per the criteria mentioned in the RFP document. (Clause 27.1 of the RFP). As the evaluation was QCBS method (technical- 90 and financial-10) after combined evaluation (technical & financial together) the scope of the technically qualified 2 (two) firm were</p> <table> <tr> <th></th><th>Tech score</th><th>Financial score</th><th>Final score</th></tr> <tr> <td>NRECA</td><td>89.24</td><td>77.82</td><td>88.13</td></tr> <tr> <td>SMEC</td><td>78.06</td><td>100</td><td>80.25</td></tr> </table> <p>So, in combined evaluation NRECA International is the 1st ranked</p>				Tech score	Financial score	Final score	NRECA	89.24	77.82	88.13	SMEC	78.06	100	80.25
	Tech score	Financial score	Final score												
NRECA	89.24	77.82	88.13												
SMEC	78.06	100	80.25												

	<p>qualified bidder recommended by PEC. PEC also made negotiation with the lowest Bidder (NRECA) 3 (three) times and finalized the negotiation and was PEC recommendation send to IDA for concurrence on 07.09.2015 IDA issue No-Objection of the final negation (combined evaluation) on 09.09.2015 BREB's approval the combined evaluation Report of PEC on 16.09.2015 and on 25.10.2015 submission to ministry for approval.</p> <p>On 02.12.2015 the proposal was approved by CCGP. Ministry issued approval letter on 20.12.2015.</p>
Signing of the Contract document	<p>After approval of the proposal by CCGP of 02.12.2015, BREB issue NOA on 06.12.2015 and contract sign was on 15.12.2015 (Before formal approval letter from Ministry on 20.12.2015).</p> <p>The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as (a) Notification of Award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) particular conditions of contract, (e) General Condition of contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The schedule of Requirement and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were not attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties on each page.</p> <p>Contract agreement was signed on white paper and not on non-judicial stamps.</p>
Advance payment guarantee etc.	No advance Guarantee
Complaints and Appeals if any	N/A
Contact and completion date	4 years (Within June, 2018)
Variations and/or replacement of key personals	
Actual completion date	Ongoing (appx. 65% done)
Outputs/ Reports	
Timeliness of Payments	
Other matters	
Compliance with agreed	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the</p>

<p>provisions</p> <p>Yes/No (Explain)</p>	<p>beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU’s website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of BEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 377 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008.BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p> <p>However as it is IDA funded Project, So PPR is not mandatory for all the steps.</p>
--	--

Part 4: Report on physical Inception (Package UREDS-S-03)

Procurement Item name and no	Supervision and management Consultancy Service(682 Man-month)
Location	N/A
Date of visit	22 April 2018 at PD office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka
Date of Contract	15.12.2015
Contracted completion date (Original)	4(four) year, June 2018.
Actual completion date	Not yet completed (on going).
Contract value	USD 2,854,333 + BDT 155,017,065 inclusive of local indirect taxes (with 10% Contingency). (BDT: 272.70 Million).
Final Contract Value	On going (Final bill not decided).
Supplier Contractor	M/S NRECA International LTD, USA.
Arrival date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/warehouse (Goods)	N/A

Scope of work	To support the Project Management Unit (PMU) of BREB in activities related to reviewing design, tendering, contracting, construction and supervision of the Project including the supervision of the Social and Environment Monitoring Program. The Consultant will also coordinate closely with the “Survey, Design and Supervision Local Consultants” of individual PBSs as well as the individual technical consultant and the individual procurement consultant for proper Implementation of the Project work.
Materials (Supply and quality)	N/A
Construction supervision	N/A
Time overruns	On going.
Cost overruns	N/A
Deficiencies/ defects observed	Project Completion time not as per DPP. Time extension under process.
Arrival Date at project site/warehouse (Goods)	N/A
Timelines of payments to contractor	No Payment made on FY 2015-2016.
Comments and recommendations	Step to be taken for proper utilization of the consultants man-month by BREB.

Annex: B-1

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: REE-RRDP-II-G-12-Lot-1)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	24 th April, 2018w
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Rural Electrification Expansion Rajshahi -Rangpur Division Program-II (REE-RRDP-II) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Contract Reference	Supply of Distribution Transformer (G4-900 Nos,G5-1100 Nos,G6-50 Nos,G7-10 Nos,G16-1200 Nos & G17-200 Nos) RRDP-II-G-12-(Lot-1) dated 03.09.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 27,79,02,000.00
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Goods(Supply of Distribution Transformer)
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under REE-RRDP-II Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (REE-RRDP-II-G-12-Lot-1)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (05.02.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque :13.02.2015 Daily Star : 14.02.2015 Jugantar :12.02.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU : 19.02.2015
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	03 (Three)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	02 (Two)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :12.02.2015 Submission :19.03.2015 35 days (preparation-sub.)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	07(Seven)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	04 (Four) Dr. Md. Aynal Haque,BUET Md. Abdur Rauf Miah,Powercell Md. Masum Hossain,BTCL Md. Mustafizur Rahman,PDB

4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary ,Power Division
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] PEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :19.03.2015 Evaluation : 20.04.2015 32 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:23.04.2015 Approval by Board :23.04.2015 35 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :19.03.2015 Evaluation :20.04.2015 Submission to Board:23.04.2015 Approval by Board :23.04.2015 32 days (opening-evaluation) 35 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	02 (Two)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week + (as required for decision before expeditious expiry of tender validity period) Board- 7 weeks=49 days NOA- 1 week=7 days [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :20.04.2015 Approval by Board :23.04.2015 03 days (evaluation –Board's Approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	CCGP
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP

6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board & ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :06.08.2015 NOA issue :09.08.2015 03 days (approval-NOA) Contract signing :03.09.2015 25 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week + (as required for decision before expeditious expiry of tender validity period) Board- 7 weeks=49 days NOA- 1 week=7 days [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :06.05.2015 Approval by CCGP :22.07.2015 Approval order by Ministry :06.08.2015 77 days (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		IDA
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70 days Opening to NOA:72 days Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:100 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :19.03.2015 NOA issue :09.08.2015 43 days(opening-NOA) Contract signing :03.09.2015 168 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation of NOA:70 days IFT to NOA:100 days Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:128 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	IFT :12.02.2015 NOA :09.08.2015 178 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :03.09.2015 203 days (IFT-contract)

7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b) PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not available
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [Rub-19(1) & 117(10)]	No.
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks. From the date of contract sign : (03.09.2015) 50% : 25.11.2015 100% : 23.12.2015
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		50% : 25.11.2015(one item G-16-100Nos on 28.11.2015) 100% : 23.12.2015
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	Agrees Sum as specified in the Particular conditions of Contract (PCC)-R34(14)	Tk. 47,325.00
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	N/A
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A

9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		<p>Yes</p> <p>Project Director- 1</p> <p>Deputy Project Director (SE) -2</p> <p>Deputy Director (Tech)/</p> <p>Executive engineer- 3</p> <p>Deputy Director (Admin)- 1</p> <p>Asst. Engineer- 9</p> <p>Computer Operator- 8</p> <p>Peon- 4</p> <p>Asst. Director (Admin)- 1</p> <p>Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1</p> <p>Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1</p> <p>Accountant- 1</p>
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		<p>Yes</p> <p>6(six) completed training</p>

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (REE-RRDP-II-G-12-Lot-1)

Date of Review: 24 th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Number and Date: Distribution Transformer (G4-900 Nos,G5-1100 Nos,G6-50 Nos,G7-10 Nos,G16-1200 Nos & G17-200 Nos) RRDP-II-G-12-(Lot-1) Dated : 03.09.2015	Contract Amount : BDT 27,79,02,000.00
Contractor's Name and Address: M/ S Confidence Electric Ltd, Dhaka	

Procurement Method: NCT, OTM

Category: Goods (Distribution Transformer)

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 13.02.2015 with other 13 packages/sub-packages in the Ittafaque, On 12.02.2015 in the Jugantarand, on 14.02.2015 in the Daily Star and on 19.02.2015 in the CPTU website (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper) as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule –X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	N/A
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	35 days (preparation-submission)
Tender opening	Tender was received at two places (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed

and minutes of Tender opening	Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkket Dhaka) & Power Cell (10 th floor), Bidyut Bhabaon, Abdul Goni Road, Dhaka. The Tender was opened on 19.03.2015 at one place (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkket Dhaka). Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by TOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f).
Tender security records	Tender security records (Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount) with their confirmations are available in PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	Commercial, financial and technical evaluation was done by the TEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report, detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record, financial capability etc. Verification of authenticity of the Bid security and credit facilities were also carried out by TEC. In the evaluation report, TEC mentioned that the offered price of lowest Bidder (Confidence Electrics Ltd, Dhaka) 21.72% higher than the estimated price and 0.05% less than the last purchase price of the similar item. So TEC recommended accepting the quoted price of Confidence Electrics Ltd. The name of the participating Bidder are follows: 01) M/S Confidence Electrics Limited 02) M/S T S Transformers Ltd.
Contract document	The documents mentioned in the contract agreement are: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A
Performance security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: OBL/PB/BG/187/2015, Issue date: 25.08.2015, Expiry date: 10.12.2016, Guarantee amount: BDT 2,77,90,200 issued by One Bank Ltd.
Complaints and Appeals	N/A
Contractual completion date	50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks. From the date of contract sign : (03.09.2015) 50% : 25.11.2015 100% : 23.12.2015

Actual completion date	50% : 25.11.2015(one item G-16-100Nos on 28.11.2015) 100% : 23.12.2015																																								
Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																								
Delivery receipt or like instrument	<p style="text-align: center;">Khulna Ware House</p> RR NO. 566 Date 20.10.2015 G5= 1100 Nos. RR NO. 5685 Date 12.11.2015 (G4=900 Nos; G7=10 Nos; G17-200 Nos; G16=500 Nos; G6=50 Nos) =1660 Nos RR NO.5717 Date 07.12.2015 G16= 700 Nos																																								
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	Tk.47,325.00(For delay of 3 days ie 1 week)																																								
Timeliness of payment	<p style="text-align: center;">Payment Statement</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Payment Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>21.10.15</td><td>7,49,10,000.00</td><td></td><td>74,91,000.00</td><td>37,45,500.00</td><td>6,36,73,500.00</td><td>21.10.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>16.11.15</td><td>13,67,37,000.00</td><td></td><td>1,36,73,700.00</td><td>68,36,850.00</td><td>11,62,26,450.00</td><td>16.11.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>15.12.15</td><td>6,62,55,000.00</td><td></td><td>66,25,500.00</td><td>33,12,750.00</td><td>5,63,16,750.00</td><td>15.12.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>18.01.16</td><td>2,77,90,200.00</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>2,77,42,875.00</td><td>18.01.16</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart</p>						Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	21.10.15	7,49,10,000.00		74,91,000.00	37,45,500.00	6,36,73,500.00	21.10.15	16.11.15	13,67,37,000.00		1,36,73,700.00	68,36,850.00	11,62,26,450.00	16.11.15	15.12.15	6,62,55,000.00		66,25,500.00	33,12,750.00	5,63,16,750.00	15.12.15	18.01.16	2,77,90,200.00				2,77,42,875.00	18.01.16
Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																			
21.10.15	7,49,10,000.00		74,91,000.00	37,45,500.00	6,36,73,500.00	21.10.15																																			
16.11.15	13,67,37,000.00		1,36,73,700.00	68,36,850.00	11,62,26,450.00	16.11.15																																			
15.12.15	6,62,55,000.00		66,25,500.00	33,12,750.00	5,63,16,750.00	15.12.15																																			
18.01.16	2,77,90,200.00				2,77,42,875.00	18.01.16																																			
Others matters	<p>Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.</p> <p>TEC mentioned that the estimate was prepared on the basis of approved rate of the year 2011-2012. Within last 3 year (from the date of estimate) price of the raw materials, labour, and transportation costs are increased.</p>																																								
Compliance with agreed provisions	Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following: a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual																																								

<p>Yes or No (Explain)</p>	<p>obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 32 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. However, BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p>
---------------------------------------	--

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (REE-RRDP-II-G-12-Lot-1)

Procurement Item name and number	Supply of Distribution Transformer (G4-900 Nos,G5-1100 Nos,G6-50 Nos,G7-10 Nos,G16-1200 Nos & G17-200 Nos)					
Location	PE's office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka.					
Date of visit	22.05.2018 & 24.05.2018					
Date of Contract	Contract Signing : 03.09.2015					
Contracted completion date (Original)	50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks. From the date of contract sign : (03.09.2015) 50% : 25.11.2015 100% : 23.12.2015					
Actual completion date	50% : 25.11.2015(one item G-16-100Nos on 28.11.2015) 100% : 23.12.2015					
Contract value	BDT 27,79,02,00.00					
Final Contract Value	BDT 2,77,42,875.00					
Supplier Contractor	M/ S Confidence Electric Ltd, Dhaka, UTC Building ,(7 th floor, 8, Panthapath, Kawran Bazar , Dhaka -1215).					
Arrival Date at port	N/A					
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	<table><tr><td colspan="2">Khulna Ware House</td></tr><tr><td colspan="2">RR NO. 566 Date 20.10.2015 G5= 1100 Nos. RR NO. 5685 Date 12.11.2015 (G4=900 Nos; G7=10 Nos; G17-200 Nos; G16=500 Nos; G6=50 Nos) =1660 Nos RR NO.5717 Date 07.12.2015 G16= 700 Nos</td></tr></table>		Khulna Ware House		RR NO. 566 Date 20.10.2015 G5= 1100 Nos. RR NO. 5685 Date 12.11.2015 (G4=900 Nos; G7=10 Nos; G17-200 Nos; G16=500 Nos; G6=50 Nos) =1660 Nos RR NO.5717 Date 07.12.2015 G16= 700 Nos	
Khulna Ware House						
RR NO. 566 Date 20.10.2015 G5= 1100 Nos. RR NO. 5685 Date 12.11.2015 (G4=900 Nos; G7=10 Nos; G17-200 Nos; G16=500 Nos; G6=50 Nos) =1660 Nos RR NO.5717 Date 07.12.2015 G16= 700 Nos						
Scope of work	Supply of Distribution Transformer (G4-900 Nos,G5-1100 Nos,G6-50 Nos,G7-10 Nos,G16-1200 Nos & G17-200 Nos).					
Materials	Supplied : Distribution Transformer(G4-900 Nos,G5-1100 Nos,G6-50					

(Supply and quality)	Nos,G7-10 Nos,G16-1200 Nos & G17-200 Nos)as per Receiving Reports (RR) as mentioned above. The quality were verified by BREB team and fund satisfactory.																																								
Workmanship Quality	Before delivery of the goods, BREB's inspection team made pre-delivery inspection in the manufacture's factory to ensure the quality of materials as per specification and technical standards. After the delivery of the goods to the BREB's Ware House at Khulna. Post- delivery inspection was conducted by BREB's team for quality and quantity and found satisfactory.																																								
Construction supervision	N/A																																								
Time overruns	N/A																																								
Cost overruns	Time over run and LD imposed TK 47325.00																																								
Deficiencies/ defects observed	Distribution Transformers were received by Khulna Houses. From Ware Houses, the goods were allocated by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB. Dhaka to the PBSs that received the goods and supplied the allocated X-forms to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBSs received the goods from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed up in their stock register and supplied these materials to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there are no contract numbers or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where the total 3460 Nos of distribution transformer purchased under the contract had been used.																																								
Timelines of payments to contractor	<p style="text-align: center;">Payment Statement</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Payment t Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Paymen t Date</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>21.10.15</td><td>7,49,10,000.00</td><td></td><td>74,91,000.00</td><td>37,45,500.00</td><td>6,36,73,500.00</td><td>21.10.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>16.11.15</td><td>13,67,37,000.00</td><td></td><td>1,36,73,700.00</td><td>68,36,850.00</td><td>11,62,26,450.00</td><td>16.11.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>15.12.15</td><td>6,62,55,000.00</td><td></td><td>66,25,500.00</td><td>33,12,750.00</td><td>5,63,16,750.00</td><td>15.12.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>18.01.16</td><td>2,77,90,200.00</td><td></td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td>2,77,42,875.00</td><td>18.01.16</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods (REE-RRDP-II-G-12-Lot-1) were reimbursed by Mushak-11.</p> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart</p>						Payment t Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Paymen t Date	21.10.15	7,49,10,000.00		74,91,000.00	37,45,500.00	6,36,73,500.00	21.10.15	16.11.15	13,67,37,000.00		1,36,73,700.00	68,36,850.00	11,62,26,450.00	16.11.15	15.12.15	6,62,55,000.00		66,25,500.00	33,12,750.00	5,63,16,750.00	15.12.15	18.01.16	2,77,90,200.00		-	-	2,77,42,875.00	18.01.16
Payment t Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Paymen t Date																																			
21.10.15	7,49,10,000.00		74,91,000.00	37,45,500.00	6,36,73,500.00	21.10.15																																			
16.11.15	13,67,37,000.00		1,36,73,700.00	68,36,850.00	11,62,26,450.00	16.11.15																																			
15.12.15	6,62,55,000.00		66,25,500.00	33,12,750.00	5,63,16,750.00	15.12.15																																			
18.01.16	2,77,90,200.00		-	-	2,77,42,875.00	18.01.16																																			
Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.																																								

Annex: B-2

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: REE-RRDP-II-G-16-Lot-2)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	24 th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Rural Electrification Expansion Rajshahi -Rangpur Division Program-II (REE-RRDP-II) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Contract Reference	Supply of Single Phase Electronic Meter 87500 Nos RRDP-II-G-16-(Lot-2) dated 28.10.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 1,00,537,500.00
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Goods
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under REE-RRDP-II Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (05.02.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque :25.06.2015 Observer :23.06.2015 Sangbad :30.06.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU : 25.06.2015
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	No
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	07
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	03
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement : 23.06.2015 Submission : 29.07.2015 36 days (preparation-sub.)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	07(Seven)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	04 (Four) Dr. Md. AynalHaque,BUET Md. Abdur Rauf Miah,Powercell Md. MasumHossain,BTCL Md. MustafizurRahman,PDB

4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary ,Power Division
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] PEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :29.07.2015 Evaluation :13.08.2015 15 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:17.08.2015 Approval by Board :17.08.2015 19 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/ submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening : 29.07.2015 Evaluation :13.08.2015 Submission to Board:17.08.2015 Approval by Board :17.08.2015 15 days (opening-evaluation) 19 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	03 (Three)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/ Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week + (as required for decision before expeditious expiry of tender validity period) Board- 7 weeks=49 days NOA- 1 week=7 days [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :13.08.2015 Approval by Board :17.08.2015 04 days (evaluation –Board’s Approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	CCGP

6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board & ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :30.09.2015 NOA issue :01.10.2015 01 day (approval-NOA issue) Contract signing :28.10.2015 27 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week + (as required for decision before expeditious expiry of tender validity period) Board- 7 weeks=49 days NOA- 1 week=7 days [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :23.08.2015 Approval order by Ministry :30.09.2015 38 days (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		NO
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		NO
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70 days Opening to NOA:72 days Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:100 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :29.07.2015 NOA issue :01.10.2015 64 days(opening-NOA) Contract signing :28.10.2015 91 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation of NOA:70 days IFT to NOA:100 days Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:128 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	IFT :23.06.2015 NOA :01.10.2015 100 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :28.10.2015 127 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from	Records are not available

	website/others	issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk. 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [Rub-19(1) & 117(10)]	No.
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		16 weeks from the date of contract(28.10.2015) 50% : 19.01.2016 100% : 16.02.2016
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		50% : 24.02.2016 100% : 07.03.2016
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	Agrees Sum as specified in the Particular conditions of Contract (PCC)-R34(14)	Tk.26,73,102.74
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A

9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director- 1 Deputy Project Director (SE) 2 Deputy Director (Tech)/ Executive engineer- 3 Deputy Director (Admin)- 1 Asst. Engineer- 9 Computer Operator- 8 Peon- 4 Asst. Director (Admin)- 1 Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1 Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1 Accountant- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 6(six) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (REE-RRDP-II)

Date of Review: 24 th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Contract Number and Date supply of Single Phase Electronic Meter 87500 Nos. RRDP-II-G-16-(Lot-2) Date: 28.10.2015	Contract Amount : BDT 1,00,537,500.00
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S Echo Electronic Meters	

Procurement Method : NCT, OTM

Category : Goods.

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 25.06.2015 with other 04 packages/sub-packages in the Ittafaque, 30.06.2015 in the Sabgbad and 23.06.2015 in the Observer (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper) as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule –X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	N/A
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	36 days (preparation-submission)
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	Tender was received at two places (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka) & Power Cell (10 th floor), BidyutBhabaon, Abdul Goni Road, Dhaka. The Tender was opened on 29.07.2015 at one place (Big. Gen.

	Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka). Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by TOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f).
Tender security records	Information, concerning Bank Guarantee, Bank's name and amount as tender security provided by the tenderers and their confirmation, is available in the records of PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	Verification of authenticity of documents such as the Bid security, credit facilities test Report, supply records etc were carried out by TEC. Experience of tenderer was done by TEC. The name of the participating Bidder are follows: 01) M/S Echo Electricals Ltd. 02) M/S Pasha Electro Ind. Ltd. 03) M/S Techno Electricals Ltd.
Contract document	The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A
Per security details and records	Guarantee NO: UCBL/Bonani/BG/359/2015, Issue date: 20.10.2015, Expiry date: 11.01.2017, Guarantee amount: TK 1,00,53,750.00 issued by United Commercial Bank Bonani Branch 39 kamal Ataturk Avenue, Dhaka.
Protest & other matters	N/A
Contractual completion date	16 weeks from the date of contract sign (28.10.2015) 50% : 19.01.2016, 100% : 16.02.2016
Actual completion date	50% : 24.02.2016 100%: 20.04.2016

Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																									
Delivery receipt or like instrument	Khulna wear House, Khulna. RR No : 5840 dated 28.02.2016 (48860 Nos), RR No :5858 dated 10.03.16 (28416 Nos), RR No : 5929 dated 27.04.16 (10224 Nos).																																									
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	Tk.26,73,102.74																																									
Timeliness of payment	<div>Payment Statement</div> <table><tr><th>Payment Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment))</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>29.02.16</td><td>5,02,98,624.00</td><td></td><td>50,29,863.00</td><td>25,14,932.00</td><td>4,12,45,467.00</td><td>29.02.16</td></tr><tr><td>14.03.16</td><td>3,84,91,500.00</td><td></td><td>38,49,150.00</td><td>19,24,575.00</td><td>3,21,40,402.00</td><td>14.03.16</td></tr><tr><td>10.05.16</td><td>1,17,47,376.00</td><td></td><td>11,74,738.00</td><td>5,87,369.00</td><td>93,97,900.00</td><td>10.05.16</td></tr><tr><td>22.06.16</td><td>1,00,53,751.00</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>1,00,53,751.00</td><td>22.06.16</td></tr></table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart</p>							Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	29.02.16	5,02,98,624.00		50,29,863.00	25,14,932.00	4,12,45,467.00	29.02.16	14.03.16	3,84,91,500.00		38,49,150.00	19,24,575.00	3,21,40,402.00	14.03.16	10.05.16	1,17,47,376.00		11,74,738.00	5,87,369.00	93,97,900.00	10.05.16	22.06.16	1,00,53,751.00				1,00,53,751.00	22.06.16
Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																				
29.02.16	5,02,98,624.00		50,29,863.00	25,14,932.00	4,12,45,467.00	29.02.16																																				
14.03.16	3,84,91,500.00		38,49,150.00	19,24,575.00	3,21,40,402.00	14.03.16																																				
10.05.16	1,17,47,376.00		11,74,738.00	5,87,369.00	93,97,900.00	10.05.16																																				
22.06.16	1,00,53,751.00				1,00,53,751.00	22.06.16																																				
Evaluation	Commercial evaluation, financial evaluation and technical evaluation were done by the TEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record the financial capability etc.																																									
Compliance with agreed Provisions Yes or No (Explain)	Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following: a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008 b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address,																																									

	<p>telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p>
--	---

Part-4 Report in Physical Inception (Package : REE-RRDP-11-G-16-Lot-2)

Procurement Item no	Supply of Single Phase Electronic Meter. J-39=(87500Nos).
Location	PE's office BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka.
Date of visit	24th April 2018
Date of Contract	28.10.2015
Contracted completion date (Original)	16 weeks from the date of contract sign (28.10.2015) 50% : 19.01.2016, 100% : 16.02.2016
Actual completion date	50% : 24.02.2016 100%: 20.04.2016
Contract value	Tk. 10,05,37,500
Final Contract Value	Tk. 9,78,64,396.00
Supplier Contractor	M/S Echo Electronic Meters.
Arrival Date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	Khulna W . House : RR-5843 Dt: 28.02.16=48860 Nos. RR-5858 Dt: 10.03.16=28416 Nos. RR-5929 Dt: 27.04.16=10224 Nos. Total=87500 Nos.
Scope of work	Supply of Single Phage Electronic Meter. (J-39=87500 Nos).
Materials (Supply and quality)	<p>Pre Delivery inspections of the single phase Electric meters were undertaken by the Inspection and Testing Directorate of BREB on the supplier's factor. Pre-delivery inspection tests were found satisfactory and the goods conforming to the specifications prescribed in the tender document.</p> <p>Post landing inspections of the single phase Electric meters were also undertaken by the Inspection and Testing Directorate of BREB on at Khulna Ware House, BREB, Khulna. The inspections reports were found satisfactory.</p>
Construction supervision	N/A
Time overrun	Time Overrun and LD imposed .(Tk 26,73,104.00)
Cost overrun	Cost not overrun.

Deficiencies/ defects observed	87500 Nos.(Type J-39) of single phase electric meter were receiving by Khulna Ware House. The Ware House distributed meters as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB , Dhaka to the PBSs received by the goods (single phase electric meter) and supplied the item to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBSs receiving single phase electric meter from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract or package number. As a result, it has not been possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 31,022 Nos. of the single phase electric meter purchased under the contract have been used.																																										
Timelines of payments to contractor	<table><tr><th colspan="7">Payment Statement</th></tr><tr><th>Payment Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment))</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>29.02.16</td><td>5,02,98,624.00</td><td></td><td>50,29,863.00</td><td>25,14,932.00</td><td>4,12,45,467.00</td><td>29.02.16</td></tr><tr><td>14.03.16</td><td>3,84,91,500.00</td><td></td><td>38,49,150.00</td><td>19,24,575.00</td><td>3,21,40,402.00</td><td>14.03.16</td></tr><tr><td>10.05.16</td><td>1,17,47,376.00</td><td></td><td>11,74,738.00</td><td>5,87,369.00</td><td>93,97,900.00</td><td>10.05.16</td></tr><tr><td>22.06.16</td><td>1,00,53,751.00</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>1,00,53,751.00</td><td>22.06.16</td></tr></table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart.</p>	Payment Statement							Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	29.02.16	5,02,98,624.00		50,29,863.00	25,14,932.00	4,12,45,467.00	29.02.16	14.03.16	3,84,91,500.00		38,49,150.00	19,24,575.00	3,21,40,402.00	14.03.16	10.05.16	1,17,47,376.00		11,74,738.00	5,87,369.00	93,97,900.00	10.05.16	22.06.16	1,00,53,751.00				1,00,53,751.00	22.06.16
Payment Statement																																											
Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment))	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																					
29.02.16	5,02,98,624.00		50,29,863.00	25,14,932.00	4,12,45,467.00	29.02.16																																					
14.03.16	3,84,91,500.00		38,49,150.00	19,24,575.00	3,21,40,402.00	14.03.16																																					
10.05.16	1,17,47,376.00		11,74,738.00	5,87,369.00	93,97,900.00	10.05.16																																					
22.06.16	1,00,53,751.00				1,00,53,751.00	22.06.16																																					
Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.																																										

Annex: B-3

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: REE-RRDP-II-G-23-Lot-1)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	24 th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Rural Electrification Expansion Rajshahi -Rangpur Division Program-II (REE-RRDP-II) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Reference	Sub-Station Hardware & Connectors (BSC-12.40=180, BSC-12.45=180, BS-32=180, BS-34=400, BS-40=780, BS-40.001=700, IS-017=180, IS-019=180, IS-020=700, IS-021=200, IS-022=160, IS-035=180, IS-074=400, IS-076=200, ISG-110=200, ISG-117=400, ISG-130=100, ISG-131=100, ISG-160=100 Nos.) RRDP-II-G-23-(Lot-1) dated 01.07.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 2,82,17,417.33
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Goods : Sub-Station Hardware & Connectors (BSC-12.40=180, BSC-12.45=180, BS-32=180, BS-34=400, BS-40=780, BS-40.001=700, IS-017=180, IS-019=180, IS-020=700, IS-021=200, IS-022=160, IS-035=180, IS-074=400, IS-076=200, ISG-110=200, ISG-117=400, ISG-130=100, ISG-131=100, ISG-160=100 Nos.)
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under REE-RRDP-II Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (RRDP-II-G-23-Lot-1)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (05.02.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	No requirement for Advertisement but a request for price offer [R-75(3)(4)][R-16(1)]	request for offer with price :04.03.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 core and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	N/A
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	01 (One) DPM
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	02 (Two)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :04.03.2015 Submission :24.03.2015 20 days (preparation-sub.)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	06(Six)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	02 (Two) Mr, Satyendo Nath Paul, DGM,BSCIC Mr. Mihir Chandra Dey Xen,CAA

4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Chairman BREB
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :24.03.2015 Evaluation :12.04.2015 12 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:19.05.2015 Approval by Board :19.05.2015 56 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/ submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening : 24.03.2015 Evaluation :12.04.2015 Submission to Board:19.05.2015 Approval by Board :19.05.2015 12days (opening-evaluation) 56 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	03 (Three) I (One) DPM
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week + (as required for decision before expeditious expiry of tender validity period) Board- 7 weeks=49 days NOA- 1 week=7 days [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :12.04.2015 Approval by Board :19.05.2015 37 days (evaluation –Board's Approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	BREB Board	BREB Board
6.3	Authority approved	BREB Board	BREB Board
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via PD to BREB

6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :19.05.2015 NOA issue :04.06.2015 16 days (approval-NOA) Contract signing :01.07.2015 27 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	Board- 2 weeks + NOA- 1 week [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry:23.08.2015 Approval by CCGP :22.07.2015 Approval by Ministry :06.08.2015 38 days (Submission-Approval) Evaluation :12.04.2015 Board's approval :19.05.2015 37 days (evaluation –Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		NO
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		NO
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:56 days (8 weeks) Opening to NOA:58 days Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:86 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :24.03.2015 NOA issue :04.06.2015 72 days(opening-NOA issue) Contract signing :01.07.2015 99 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	RFP to Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days[R-32] Evaluation of NOA:56 days (8 weeks) IFT to NOA:86 days Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:114 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	RFP :04.03.2015 NOA :04.06.2015 92 days (RFP-NOA) Contract signing :01.07.2015 119 days (RFP-contract)

7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b) PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not available
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [Rub-19(1) & 117(10)]	Yes
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		16 weeks (112 days) From the date of signing the contract (01.07.15) 50% 12 weeks(22.09.15) 100% 16 weeks (20.10.15)
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		50% : 30.09.2015 100% : 21.10.2015
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	Agrees Sum as specified in the Particular conditions of Contract (PCC)-R34(14)	LD Tk. 1,85,521.00
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A

9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director- 1 Deputy Project Director (SE) 2 Deputy Director (Tech)/ Executive engineer- 3 Deputy Director (Admin)- 1 Asst. Engineer- 9 Computer Operator- 8 Peon- 4 Asst. Director (Admin)- 1 Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1 Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1 Accountant- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 6(six) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (REE-RRDP-II)

Date of Review: 24 th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Contract No. and Date Supply of Sub-Station Hardware & Connectors (BSC-12.40=180, BSC-12.45=180, BS-32=180, BS-34=400, BS-40=780, BS-40.001=700, IS-017=180, IS-019=180, IS-020=700, IS-021=200, IS-022=160, IS-035=180, IS-074=400, IS-076=200, ISG-110=200, ISG-117=400, ISG-130=100, ISG-131=100, ISG-160=100 Nos.) RRDP-II-G-23-(Lot-1) dt 01.07.2015	Contract Amount: BDT 2,82,17,417.33
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S BMTF (Bangladesh Machine Tools Factories)	

Procurement Method : OTM, NCT supply of Sub-Station Hardware & Connectors.
Category : Goods:

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	No required for the Advertisement, Request for price offer [R75(3)(4)][R-76(11)]
Pre/Post Qualification	N/A
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	20 days (preparation-submission)
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	DPM
Tender security records	No requirement of Tender Security as per [Rule-22(6)]
B.E. Report,	BMTF(Bangladesh Machine Tools Factory Ltd, Joydebpur , Gazipur,

verify existence of Tenders-Names of Tenderers	Bangladesh, an enterprise of Bangladesh Army, They have capability to many factory on such item and have past supply record.
Contract document	The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A
Per security details and records	Guarantee NO: TBL/PB/PG/327/1015, Issue date: 18.06.2015, Expiry date: 25.05.2016, Guarantee amount: BDT 28,21,741.73. Issued by Trust Bank Ltd, Dhaka.
Protest & other matters	N/A
Contractual completion date	16 weeks from the date of contract sign (01.07.15) 50% : 12 weeks (22.09.15), 100% : (20.10.15)
Actual completion date	50% : 30.09.2015 100% : 21.10.2015
Bill of lading, if any	N/A
Delivery receipt or like instrument	Khulna wear House, Khulna. RR No : 56584 dated 08.10.15 (4580 Nos). <u>RR No : 5668 dated 21.10.15 (940 Nos).</u> Total : 5520 Nos.
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	LD Tk. 1,85,521.00

Timeliness of payment	Payment Statement						
	Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date
	13.10.15	2,37,74,166.00		23,77,417.00	11,88,709.00	2,00,89,169.00	13.10.15
	29.10.15	44,43,250.00		4,44,325.00	2,22,163.00	37,10,112.00	29.10.15
	02.12.15	28,21,741.00		-	-	28,21,741.00	02.12.15
Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart							
Evaluation	Evaluation was done by TEC. The offered price of BMTF was Tk. 28499536.00 TEC negotiated with BMTF as per Rule -76(3) of PPR-2008 and finalized the total price Tk. 28217417.33						
Compliance with agreed provisions Yes or No (Explain)	Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following: a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008 b) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available; c) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008. d) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.						

Part -4 Report on Physical Inspection (REE-RRDP -11-G-23)

Procurement Item name and number	Supply of Sub-Station Hardware and Connectors.
Location	PE's office, BREB Head office, Khilkhet , Dhaka.
Date of visit	24 April 2018
Date of Contract	01.07.2015
Contracted completion date (Original)	16 weeks from the date of contract sign (01.07.15) 50% : 12 weeks (22.09.15), 100% : (20.10.15)
Actual completion date	50% : 30.09.2015 100% : 21.10.2015
Contract value	Contract Amount: BDT 2,82,17,417.33
Final Contract Value	Contract Amount: BDT 2,80,31,896.33
Supplier Contractor	Bangladesh Machine Tools Factory Ltd, Joydebpur, Gazipur, Bangladesh.
Arrival Date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	Khulna Ware House : RR -5658 and 5659 Dt: 18.10.15=15 items(4580 Nos) : <u>RR-5660 Dt: 21.10.15=04 items(940 Nos)</u> Total=(5520 Nos)
Scope of work	Supply of Sub-Station Hardware, Connectors.
Materials (Supply and quality)	Pre Delivery inspections of the sub-station hardware, connectors were undertaken by the Inspection and Testing Directorate of BREB on the supplier's factor. Pre-delivery inspection tests were found satisfactory and the goods conforming to the specifications prescribed in the tender document. Post landing inspections of the sub-station hardware, connector were also undertaken by the

	Inspection and Testing Directorate of BREB on at Khulna Ware House, BREB, Khulna. The inspections reports were found satisfactory.																																	
Construction supervision	N/A																																	
Time overrun	Time Overrun and LD imposed : Tk. 185521.00																																	
Cost overrun	Cost not overrun.																																	
Deficiencies/ defects observed	S/S Hardware , Connector and accessories were receiving by Khulna Ware House . The Ware House distributed the goods as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka to the PBS that received the goods and supplied the items to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBS receiving the goods from different sources(contracts/ projecses) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there are is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where S/S Hardware, connector and accessories purchased under the contract had been used.																																	
Timelines of payments to contractor	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Payment Statement</u></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Payment Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>13.10.15</td><td>2,37,74,166.00</td><td></td><td>23,77,417.00</td><td>11,88,709.00</td><td>2,00,89,169.00</td><td>13.10.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>29.10.15</td><td>44,43,250.00</td><td></td><td>4,44,325.00</td><td>2,22,163.00</td><td>37,10,112.00</td><td>29.10.15</td></tr> <tr> <td>02.12.15</td><td>28,21,741.00</td><td></td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td>28,21,741.00</td><td>02.12.15</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart</p>						Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	13.10.15	2,37,74,166.00		23,77,417.00	11,88,709.00	2,00,89,169.00	13.10.15	29.10.15	44,43,250.00		4,44,325.00	2,22,163.00	37,10,112.00	29.10.15	02.12.15	28,21,741.00		-	-	28,21,741.00	02.12.15
Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																												
13.10.15	2,37,74,166.00		23,77,417.00	11,88,709.00	2,00,89,169.00	13.10.15																												
29.10.15	44,43,250.00		4,44,325.00	2,22,163.00	37,10,112.00	29.10.15																												
02.12.15	28,21,741.00		-	-	28,21,741.00	02.12.15																												
Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.																																	

Annex: B-4

Individual Contract Review Format(Package: RRDP-II-L-43-03) (e-GP System)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	22 nd & 24 th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Superintending Engineering(Project) Rajshahi Zone, under Rural Electrification Expansion Rajshah -Rangpur Division Program-II (REE-RRDP-II) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Reference	Construction of 20.349 Km OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS. RRDP-II-L-43-03dated:19.06.2016
Contract Amount	BDT 25,90,465.45
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Works: Construction of 20.349 Km OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS.
Method of Procurement	LTM (e-GP).
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Construction of OHD Lines under REE-RRDP-II Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB.• To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (RRDP-II-L-43-03)

(e-GP System)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16] e-GP Guidelines 3.3.1	Chairman BREB (05.02.2015)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Publication Date : 20.04.2016 Sangbad Protidin :25.04.2016 Uploaded Date : 20.04.2016
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)] e-GP Guidelines sec-3.5.12	CPTU :21.04.2016
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	Followed PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	26 (Twenty six)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	26 (Twenty six)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 14 days : [R-61(5)]	Uploaded Date : 20.04.2016 Submission : 05.05.2016 16 days (preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	02(Two) [R-7,Schedule-II] BPR-e-GP, Section-3.5.6.1	02 (Two)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)

4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	03 (Three) members, BPR-e-GP, Section 3.5.6.1	03(Three)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	N/A	N/A
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/PD/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	HOPE
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :05.05.2016 Evaluation :31.05.2016 26 days (opening- evaluation)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days (R-32) TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :05.05.2016 Evaluation :31.05.2016 26 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to PD :31.05.2016 26 days (opening-sub. to PD)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	26 (Twenty six)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC	PE may reject all tenders on the recommendations of the TEC, and with the approval HOPE invite Re0tender on certain grounds. [R-33(2)],[R-11(2)(c)(ii)]	N/A
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled	N/A	N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		

6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	HOPE: 6 weeks (42 days) Project Director:1 week (7 days) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :31.05.2016 Submission to PD :06.06.2016 Pd to CE :06.06.2016 CE to Member :09.06.2016 Member to HOPE :12.06.2016 Approval HOPE :12.06.2016 12 days (evaluation –Approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	Project Director)	HOPE, Chairman(BREB)
6.3	Authority approved	Project Director	HOPE, Chairman(BREB)
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via PD to HOPE (Chairman , BREB)
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)]/(a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :13.06.2016 NOA issue :13.06.2016 01 day (approval-NOA issue) Contract signing :19.06.2016 6 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	HOPE: 2 weeks (14 days) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Supmission : 06.06.2016 Approval : 12.06.2016 7 days (Submission – Apprval).
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report	N/A	N/A
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals	Project Director	Chairman, BREB. (6 weeks)
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:(6weeks) 42 days Opening to NOA:44 days Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:72	Opening :05.05.2016 NOA issue :13.06.2016 39 days(opening-NOA) Contract signing:19.06.2016 46 days (opening - contract)

		days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]A]	
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 24 days [R-61(5)] Safe Custody: 02 days[R-32] Evaluation to NOA:42days IFT to NOA:58 days Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:86 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Advertisement :24.04.2016 NOA :13.06.2016 50 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing:19.06.2016 56 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- BelowTk. 1.00 crore e-GP Guidelines, Section-3.7.4	Not applicable
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [Rub-19(1) & 117(10)]	Yes , within tender validity Period.
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		Contact Sining:19.06.2016 1 st Material issue:20.08.2016 100% : 270 days(16.05.2017)
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		On going (98% Completed)
8.3	Amount of LD imposed		No
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A

9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)] and [Rule-39(3)]	01 (One) Upto 28.09.2017 with the approval of PE(SE, Rajshahi)
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)] [Rule 78,79 & 80] of PPR-2008	Yes Tk 3,59,204.038 13.87% above of contract amount
10.3	No and amount of such orders	[Rule 78,79 & 80] of PPR-2008	01 (One) Tk 3,59,204.038
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved	[Rule-42(4)] of PPR-2008	No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption	[Rule-127] of PPR-2008	No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director- 1 Deputy Project Director (SE) -2 Deputy Director (Tech)/ Executive engineer- 3 Deputy Director (Admin)- 1 Asst. Engineer- 9 Computer Operator- 8 Peon- 4 Asst. Director (Admin)- 1 Deputy Director (Finn.)- 1 Asst. Director (Finn.)- 1 Accountant- 1

13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 6(six) completed training
------	------------------------------------	--	----------------------------------

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (REE-RRDP-II)

Date of Review: 22 nd & 24 th April, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Contract Number and Date Construction of 20.349 Km OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS. RRDP-II-L-43-03 dated:19.06.2016	Contract Amount: BDT 25,90,465.45
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S S HOQUE & Co.	

Procurement Method: LTM,e-GP

Category: Works : (Construction of 20.349 Km OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS).

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Procurement was done following e-GP Guidelines, most of the document is kept in archive by e-GP Portal. Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1), 96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	CPTU website on 21.04.2016 and the notice was uploaded on 20.04.2016
Pre/Post Qualification	Pre qualification was done by chief Engineer(Project), BREB, Dhaka.
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	16 days (preparation-submission)
Tender opening and minutes of	Well formatted and recorded, TOS, TOR-1 and TOR-2 were used for this purpose.

Tender opening	
Tender security records	Records of Tender Security by Per ToR-1 and TOR-2
B.E. Report, verify existence Names of Tenderers	<p>TER-1,2,3 & 4 were used for evaluation of the submitted Tenders.</p> <p>The Quoted price of all bidders were same(50% lower than be estimated) lowest bid was selected. Though lottery in presence of available bidders. The quoted price is accepted by TEC and has been recommended for awarding of contract in favor of m/s s. Haque & co.(winner) at a quoted price of Tk. 25,90465.45</p> <p>Bidder are follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 01) M/S S. Haque& Co. (winner) 02) M/S Chandan& Co. 03) M/S KHAN POWER GENERATION 04) M/S BANGLA ELEKTRIC CO. 05) M/S BHUIYAN BROTHERS 06) M/S M.H ENTERPRISE 07) M/S M.S TRADERS 08) M/S MANIK & CO. 08) M/S Micro Engineers 09) M/S MONRUZZAMAN 10) M/S SAHI & CO 11) M/S SAYEDUR RAHMAN 12) M/S Shahin&Shakil Enterprise 13) M/S Shikto Enterprise 14) M/S T.S.L CONSTRUCTION 15) M/S The Power 16) M/S TUSHAER TRADERS 17) M/S HABIB BROTHERS 18) M/S K.O.G Construction 19) M/S Modern Electric & Engineering 20) M/S Nurzahan Enterprise 21) M/S Quality Enterprise 22) SUM INTERNATIONAL 23) M/S The Sunflower Engineering Construction
Contract document	<p>The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and</p> <p>(i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures</p>

	of both the parties.																																																															
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A																																																															
Per security details and records	Guarantee NO: #35/2016, Issue date:19.06.16, Expiry date: 18.06.16, Guarantee amount: BDT 129523.27. Issued by southeast Bank Ltd.																																																															
Complaints and Appeals	N/A																																																															
Contractual completion date	Contract sign : 19.06.2016 1 st material issue :20.08.2016 100% 270 day from date of first material issue date (16.05.2017)																																																															
Actual completion date	On going : Time extended up to : 07.06.2017 by PE (SE Rajshahi)																																																															
Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																																															
Delivery receipt or like instrument	Materials supplied by BREB, Labour and carrying cost borne by the Contractor for line construction.																																																															
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	Not imposed. First completion Time extended up to 07.06.2017 by PE.																																																															
Timeliness of payment	<table><tr><th colspan="7">Payment Statement</th></tr><tr><th>Payment Recom. by PD</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>13.11.16</td><td>5,50,000.00</td><td></td><td>55,000.00</td><td>22,000.00</td><td>4,40,000.00</td><td>13.11.16</td></tr><tr><td>11.01.17</td><td>5,40,000.00</td><td></td><td>54,000.00</td><td>21,600.00</td><td>4,32,000.00</td><td>11.01.17</td></tr><tr><td>11.06.17</td><td>3,50,000.00</td><td></td><td>35,000.00</td><td>14,000.00</td><td>2,80,000.00</td><td>11.06.17</td></tr><tr><td>28.08.17</td><td>1,00,000.00</td><td></td><td>10,000.00</td><td>4,000.00</td><td>80,000.00</td><td>28.08.17</td></tr><tr><td>01.01.18</td><td>3,70,000.00</td><td></td><td>37,000.00</td><td>18,500.00</td><td>2,92,300.00</td><td>01.01.18</td></tr><tr><td>21.03.18</td><td>4,00,000.00</td><td></td><td>40,000.00</td><td>20,000.00</td><td>3,16,000.00</td><td>21.03.18</td></tr><tr><td>26.06.18</td><td>1,70,000.00</td><td></td><td>17,000.00</td><td>8,500.00</td><td>1,32,600.00</td><td>26.06.18</td></tr></table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart</p>	Payment Statement							Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	13.11.16	5,50,000.00		55,000.00	22,000.00	4,40,000.00	13.11.16	11.01.17	5,40,000.00		54,000.00	21,600.00	4,32,000.00	11.01.17	11.06.17	3,50,000.00		35,000.00	14,000.00	2,80,000.00	11.06.17	28.08.17	1,00,000.00		10,000.00	4,000.00	80,000.00	28.08.17	01.01.18	3,70,000.00		37,000.00	18,500.00	2,92,300.00	01.01.18	21.03.18	4,00,000.00		40,000.00	20,000.00	3,16,000.00	21.03.18	26.06.18	1,70,000.00		17,000.00	8,500.00	1,32,600.00	26.06.18
Payment Statement																																																																
Payment Recom. by PD	Bill Amount (BDT/US Dollar)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																																										
13.11.16	5,50,000.00		55,000.00	22,000.00	4,40,000.00	13.11.16																																																										
11.01.17	5,40,000.00		54,000.00	21,600.00	4,32,000.00	11.01.17																																																										
11.06.17	3,50,000.00		35,000.00	14,000.00	2,80,000.00	11.06.17																																																										
28.08.17	1,00,000.00		10,000.00	4,000.00	80,000.00	28.08.17																																																										
01.01.18	3,70,000.00		37,000.00	18,500.00	2,92,300.00	01.01.18																																																										
21.03.18	4,00,000.00		40,000.00	20,000.00	3,16,000.00	21.03.18																																																										
26.06.18	1,70,000.00		17,000.00	8,500.00	1,32,600.00	26.06.18																																																										
Other matters	Works delay due to shortage of materials in store rightof way problem heavy rainfall & irrigation field problem. Completion time counted from the date of issue of 1 st material which is unusal																																																															

	practice.
Compliance with agreed provisions Yes or No (Explain)	Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following: a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (RRDP-11-L43-43-03)

Procurement Item name and number	Construction of 20.349 Km OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS. RRDP-II-L-43-03 dated:19.06.2016
Location	PD Office BREB , Khilkhet , Dhaka.
Date of visit	22nd & 24th April 2018.
Date of Contract	19.06.2016
Contracted completion date (Original)	Contract signing :19.06.2016 1st material issue :20.08.2016 270 days from the date of 1st material issue(16.05.2017)
Actual completion date	On going : Time extended up to : 07.06.2017 by PE (SE Rajshahi)
Contract value	BDT 25,90,465.45
Final Contract Value	Tk 29,49,669.48 as per variation order (Tk 3,59,204.03) approved by Chairman BREB Dhaka on 07.11.2017 original contract amount Tk.25,90,465.45+variation order Tk.3,59,204.03=Total 29,49,664.48
Supplier Contractor	M/S S HOQUE & Co.
Arrival date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/warehouse (Goods)	N/A
Scope of work	Construction of 20.349 Km OHD Line under Rajshahi PBS.
Materials (Supply and quality)	Materials supplied by BREB. Labour and carrying cost by the Contractor for line construction.
Construction supervision	Construction supervision was undertaken by the consultant of appointed by BREB. The supervision was also undertaken by the Executive Engineer and Assistant Engineer of Rajshahi ZONE BREB
Time overruns	Completion time extended up to 07.06.2017(1st time) with the approval of PE (SE Rajshahi)
Cost overruns	Tk. 3,59,204.03 excess paid.
Deficiencies/ defects observed	1) For line Construction completion time of the work start from the date of first issue of materials instead of the day signing contract. 2) Shortage materials hampered the work and time extension

	<p>required.</p> <p>3) For the line Construction work, No Issuance Coverage was made. BREB mentioned that for inclusion of Insurance will increase the cost of the work. But safety of worker's life, insurance coverage will give then more comfort.</p>
Arrival Date at project site/warehouse (Goods)	N/A
Timelines of payments to contractor	N/A
Comments and recommendations	<p>a) Completion certificate should be issued immediately after proper inspection of the construction work and submission of as –built drawing by the construction.</p> <p>b) Completion time of contract should be extended with careful examination of the works. Extension of time again and again lead to delayed implementation of project activities.</p> <p>c) Directorate of BREB,Dhaka, should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the ware houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contactors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.</p> <p>d)The Allocation Letters of the poles to the PBSs and the receiving Reports of the poles should be kept in the contract file as proof of full execution of the contract.</p> <p>e) For the line Construction work, No Issuance Coverage was made. BREB mentioned that for inclusion of Insurance will increase the cost of the work. But safety of worker's life, insurance coverage will give then more comfort.</p>

Annex: C-1

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: CSS-03-1)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	1st & 2nd May, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Construction of Switching Station of Rural Electrification Program (CSS-REP) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Contract Reference	ASCR Bare Conductor (D1-130 Km,D4-40 Km,D5-80 Km & D28-450 Km) BREB/CSS-REP.P/CSS-03-1/2015-2016 dated: 13.07.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 13,62,71,900.00
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Goods (ASCR Bare Conductor-700 Km)
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under CSS-REP Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (CSS-03-1)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (11.11.2014)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque :23.12.2014 Daily Sun :22.12.2014 Corrigendum :21.01.2015 Ittafaque :20.01.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU :24.12.2014
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	04 (Four)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	03 (Three)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement :22.12.2014 Submission (ext.) :11.02.2015 51days (preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	07(Seven)

4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	04 (Four) Dr. Md. ShafiqulIslam,BUET Md. Abdur Rauf Miah,Powercell Kh. ZubaerHossain,BTCL Md. FakuzZaman,PDB
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary ,Power Division
5.0	Tenders/Proposals Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :11.02.2015 Evaluation :21.03.2015 38 days (opening- evaluation) Re-evaluation :05.04.2015 53days (opening- re-evaluation) Submission to Board:15.04.2015 Approval by Board :15.04.2015 63 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/ submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :11.02.2015 Evaluation :21.03.2015 Re-evaluation :05.04.2015 53 days (opening- re-evaluation) Submission to Board:15.04.2015 Scrutiny by Board :15.04.2015 63 days (opening-sub. to Board) Submission to Ministry:22.04.15 70 days (opening- submission to Ministry)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	03 (Three)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		

6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :21.03.2015 Re-Evaluation :05.04.2015 Approval by Board :15.04.2015 10 days (re-evaluation – Board's approval) Submission to Ministry:22.04.15 Approval order by Ministry :15.06.2015 71 days (re-evaluation-approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	CCGP
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board & ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :15.06.2015 NOA issue :16.06.2015 01 day (approval-NOA issue) Contract signing :13.07.2015 27 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :22.04.2015 Approval order by Ministry :15.06.2015 54 days (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		N/A
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of	Safe Custody: 2days[R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70days [10 weeks] + Opening to NOA :72 days+ Contract signing:28 days	Opening :11.02.2015 NOA issue :16.06.2015 125 days(opening-NOA) Contract signing:13.07.2015

	NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Opening to contract:100 days + [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	152 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:70 days+ IFT to NOA:100 days+ Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:128 days+ [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	IFT :22.12.2014 NOA :16.06.2015 176 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :13.07.2015 203 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not found
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1) & 117(10)]	No.
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		16 weeks (112 days) 50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks from the day of contract
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		50% :04.10.2015 100% :01.11.2015
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	0.05% of contract price for each week of delay or part thereof [PCC-35.1]	within contract competed
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action	N/A

		[R-57(3)(4)]	
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A
9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decisions of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and Amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD/Facilities		Yes Project Director- (Executive Engineer) - 1 Asst. Engineer- 4 Sub. Asst. Engineer- 4 Computer Operator- 2 Peon- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 02(Two) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (CSS-03-1)

Date of Review: 1st & 2nd May, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Number and Date: ASCR Bare Conductor :D1-130 Km,D4-40 Km,D5-80 Km & D28-450 Km CSS-03 dated: 13.07.2015	Contract Amount: BDT 13,62,71,900.00
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S BRB cables Industries Ltd. BSCIC Industrial Estate Kushtia-7000, Bangladesh	

Procurement Method : NCT, OTM
Category : Goods (ASCR Bare Conductor-700 Km)

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 23.12.2014 with other 08 (eight) packages/sub-packages in the Ittafaque, On 22.12.2014 in the Daily Sun and on 24.12.2014 CPTU's website (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper). One corrigendum on extending the last selling date tender closing date & time, Tender Opening date & time, tender security (package No:CSS-03) were published in the Ittafaque on 21.01.2015 and Daily Sun on 20.01.2015.The Advertisement was as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule -X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	Done during the Evaluation
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	51 days (preparation-submission-ext)
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	Tender was received at two places (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka) & Power Cell (10 th floor), Bidyut Bhabaon, Abdul Goni Road, Dhaka. The Tender was opened on 11.02.2015 at one place (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkhet Dhaka). Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by TOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f).

Tender security records	Tender security records (Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount) with their confirmations are available in PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	<p>Commercial, financial and technical evaluation was done by the TEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report, detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record, financial capability etc.</p> <p>Verification of authenticity of the Bid security and credit facilities were also carried out by TEC. In the evaluation report, TEC mentioned that the offered price of lowest Bidder (BRB Cables Industries Ltd) is 9.28% higher than the estimated price and 6.68% higher than the last purchase price of the similar item. Moreover market price increases from the date of tender invitation (23.12.2014) to tender submission (11.02.2015). So TEC recommended accepting the quoted price of BRB Cables Industries Ltd.</p> <p>The name of the participating Bidders are follows:</p> <p>01) M/S SBS Cables Ltd 02) M/S SQ wire & cables Co. Ltd 03) M/S BRB Cables Industries Ltd.</p>
Contract document	The documents mentioned in the contract agreement are: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A
Performance security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: 997168LG150250, Issue date: 02.07.2015, Expiry date: 15.12.2016, Guarantee amount: BDT 1,36,27,190.00 issued by Dutch-Bangla Bank Ltd., Kushtia Branch, Kushtia.
Complaints and Appeals	N/A
Contractual completion date	<p>50% within 12(twelve) weeks & 100% within 16 (sixteen) weeks (13.07.2015)</p> <p>50% : 04.10.2015 100% : 01.11.2015</p>

Actual completion date	50% : 04.10.2015 100% : 01.11.2015														
Bill of lading, if any	N/A														
Delivery receipt or like instrument	Dhaka Central Ware House (Savar) RR NO. 100787 dated 13.10.2015 D1 -130 Km D4 -40 Km D5 -80 Km D28 -450 Km Total= 700 Km														
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	N/A														
Timeliness of payment	<p style="text-align: center;">Payment Statement</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat* (BDT)</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>122644710.00</td><td>136271900.00</td><td>13627190.00</td><td>13627190.00</td><td>6813595.00</td><td>115831115</td><td>02.11.15</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods were reimbursed by Mushak-11. Payments to contractor were timely as described in the above chart</p>	Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	122644710.00	136271900.00	13627190.00	13627190.00	6813595.00	115831115	02.11.15
Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date									
122644710.00	136271900.00	13627190.00	13627190.00	6813595.00	115831115	02.11.15									
Others matters	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.														
Compliance with agreed provisions Yes or No (Explain)	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per</p>														

	<p>provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to re-evaluation) was 53 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. However, BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p>
--	--

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (CSS-03-1)

Procurement Item name and number	Supply of ASCR Bare Conductor (D1-130 Km, D4-40 Km, D5-80 Km & D28-450 Km) =700 Km
Location	Central Ware House, Savar, Dhaka and PE's office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka
Date of visit	25.04.2018 & 28.04.2018
Date of Contract	Contract Signing : 13.07.2015
Contracted completion date (Original)	50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks from the date of contract signing (13.07.2015) 50% : 04.10.2015 100% : 01.11.2015
Actual completion date	100%: 01.11.2015
Contract value	TK : 13,62,71,900
Final Contract Value	TK : 13,62,71,900
Supplier Contractor	M/S, BRB Cable Industries Ltd., BSCIC Industrial Estate, Kushtia-7000, Bangladesh
Arrival Date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	Dhaka Central Ware House (Savar) RR NO. 100787 dated 13.10.2015 D1 =130 Km D4 =40 Km D5 =80 Km <u>D28 =450 Km</u> Total= 700 Km
Scope of work	Supply of Bare Conductor, D1=130 Km, D4 =40 Km, D5 =80 Km & D28=450 Km Total = 700 Km

Materials (Supply and quality)	Supplied Bare Conductor-700 Km as per Receiving Reports (RR) as mentioned above.						
Workmanship Quality	Before delivery of the goods, BREB's inspection team made pre-delivery inspection in the manufacture's factory to ensure the quality of materials as per specification and technical standards. After the delivery of the goods to the BREB's store at Savar. Post-delivery inspection was conducted by BREB's team for quality and quantity.						
Construction supervision	N/A						
Time overruns	N/A						
Cost overruns	N/A						
Deficiencies/ defects observed	Materials were received by Dhaka Central Ware House (Savar). From the Ware Houses Materials are distributed as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB with the receive register of Ware House (Store). Dhaka to the PBSs that received the goods and supplied the items to different contractors working in the respective PBS areas. The PBSs received the goods from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 700 km of Bare Conductor purchased under the contract had been used.						
Timelines of payments to contractor	<u>Payment Statement</u>						
	Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date
	122644710.00	136271900.00	13627190.00	13627190.00	6813595.00	115831115	02.11.15
	NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods were reimbursed by Mushak-11. Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart						
Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.						

Annex: C-2

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: CSS-07-02)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	1st & 2nd May, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Construction of Switching Station of Rural Electrification Program (CSS-REP) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Contract Reference	SPC Pole (50') R48-2300 Nos. BREB/CSS-REP.P/CSS-07-02/2015-2016 dated 16.07.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 11,34,17,600.00
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Goods(SPC Pole, R48-2300 Nos)
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under CSS-REP Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (CSS-07-02)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (11.11.2014)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque : 23.12.2014 Daily Sun : 22.12.2014 Corrigendum Ittafaque :21.01.2015 Daily Sun :20.01.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU : 24.12.2014
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	No
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	04 (Four)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	03 (Three)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement : 22.12.2014 Submission(ext.) :11.02.2015 51days (preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	07(Seven)

4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	04 (Four) Dr. Md. ShafiqulIslam,BUET Md. Abdur Rauf Miah,Powercell Kh. ZubaerHossain,BTCL Md. FakuzZaman,PDB
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary ,Power Division
5.0	Tenders/Proposals Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :11.02.2015 Evaluation :21.03.2015 38 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:25.03.2015 Approval by Board :25.03.2015 42 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/ submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening : 11.02.2015 Evaluation : 21.03.2015 38 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:25.03.2015 Scrutiny by Board :25.03.2015 42 days (opening-sub. to Board) Submission to Ministry:22.04.15 70 days (opening- submission to Ministry)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	03 (Three)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/ Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :21.03.2015 Approval by Board :25.03.2015 4 days (evaluation – Board's approval) Submission to Ministry :22.04.2015 Approval order by

			Ministry :17.06.2015 88 days (evaluation –approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	CCGP
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board & ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :17.06.2015 NOA issue :18.06.2015 01 day (approval-NOA issue) Contract signing :16.07.2015 28 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :22.04.2015 Approval order by Ministry :17.06.2015 56 days (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		N/A
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/ Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days[R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70days[10 weeks] + Opening to NOA:72 days + Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:100 days+ [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :11.02.2015 NOA issue :18.06.2015 127 days(opening-NOA) Contract signing:16.07.2015 155 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/	IFT to Opening: 28 days	IFT :22.12.2014

	RFP and issuance of NOA/ PO /Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:70 days+ IFT to NOA:100 days+ Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:128 days+ [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	NOA :18.06.2015 178 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :16.07.2015 206 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not found
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1) & 117(10)]	No.
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery	16 weeks (112 days) 50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks from the day of contract	16 weeks (112 days) (Within 08.11.2015)
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		04.11.2015
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	0.05% of contract price for each week of delay or part thereof [PCC-35.1]	NO (within contract competed)
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons there of	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of	N/A	N/A

	complaints		
9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decisions of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and Amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD/Facilities		Yes Project Director- (Executive Engineer) - 1 Asst. Engineer- 4 Sub. Asst. Engineer- 4 Computer Operator- 2 Peon- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 02(Two) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (CSS-07-02)

Date of Review: 1 st & 2 nd May, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Number and Date SPC Pole(50') R48-2300 Nos BREB/CSS-REP.P/CSS-07-02/2015-2016 dated:19.06.2016	Contract Amount: BDT 11,34,17,600.00
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S Contech Construction Ltd, Dhaka.	

Procurement Method : NCT, OTM

Category : Goods (SPC Pole, R48-2300 Nos)

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 23.12.2014 with other 08 (eight) packages/sub-packages in the Ittafaq, On 22.12.2014 in the Daily Sun and on 24.12.2014 CPTU's website (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper). One corrigendum on extending the last selling date tender closing date & time, Tender Opening date & time, tender security (package No:CSS-07-02) were published in the Ittafaq on 21.01.2015 and Daily Sun on 20.01.2015 as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule -X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	Done during the Evaluation
Time allowed for submission of Tenders	51 days (preparation-submission-ext)
Tender opening	Tender was received at two places (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed

and minutes of Tender opening	Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkket Dhaka) & Power Cell (10 th floor), BidyutBhabaon, Abdul Goni Road, Dhaka. The Tender was opened on 11.02.2015 at one place (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkket Dhaka). Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by TOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f).
Tender security records	Tender security records (Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount) with their confirmations are available in PD office.
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	<p>Commercial, financial and technical evaluation was done by the TEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report, detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record, financial capability etc.</p> <p>Verification of authenticity of the Bid security and credit facilities were also carried out by TEC. In the evaluation report, TEC mentioned that the offered price of lowest Bidder (Contech Construction Ltd) is 5.81% higher than the estimated price and 0.19% higher than the last purchase price of the similar item. Moreover market price of raw materials and carrying of materials increases from the date of tender invitation (23.12.2014) to tender submission (11.02.2015). So TEC recommended to accept the lowest evaluated bidder M/S Contech Construction Ltd to award the contract. The name of the participating Bidders are follows:</p> <p>01) M/S Contech Construction Ltd 02) M/S Pathar Limited 03) M/S Castle Construction Ltd.</p>
Contract document	<p>The documents mentioned in the contract agreement are: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and</p> <p>(i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.</p>
Advance payment guarantee	N/A

details and records																																																																																					
Performance security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: UCBL/Banani/243/2015, Issue date: 08.07.2015, Expiry date: 31.12.2016, Guarantee amount: BDT 1,13,41,760.00 issued by United Commercial Bank Ltd.,Sharif Plaza (1st & 2nd floor), 39, kemal Ataturk Avenue, Banani, Dhaka-1213																																																																																				
Complaints and Appeals	N/A																																																																																				
Contractual completion date	50% within 12(twelve) weeks & 100% within 16 (sixteen) weeks (16.07.2015) 50% :8.10.2015 100% :05.11.2015																																																																																				
Actual completion date	50% : 8.10.2015 100% :05.11.2015																																																																																				
Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																																																																				
Delivery receipt or like instrument	<div>The SPC poles were received by 04(four) PBS (Magura, Joypurhat, Thakurgoan, Meherpur) with the following receiving report (RR) & date:</div> <table><tr><th>Sl No</th><th>Name of PBS</th><th>RR No</th><th>Date</th><th>Pole Type</th><th>Quantity (Nos)</th></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Magura</td><td>200002</td><td>19.09.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>225</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Magure</td><td>200004</td><td>03.11.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>225</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Sub-Total</td><td colspan="3">=450</td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200001-200003</td><td>22.09.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>300</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200012</td><td>26.10.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>51</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200013</td><td>27.10.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>51</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200014-200015</td><td>29.10.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>88</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200018</td><td>01.11.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>102</td></tr><tr><td>6</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200020</td><td>03.11.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>08</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Sub-Total</td><td colspan="3">=600</td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Takurgoan</td><td>200003</td><td>19.09.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>84</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Takurgoan</td><td>200006</td><td>29.09.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>28</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Takurgoan</td><td>200009</td><td>05.10.2015</td><td>R48</td><td>139</td></tr></table>	Sl No	Name of PBS	RR No	Date	Pole Type	Quantity (Nos)	1	Magura	200002	19.09.2015	R48	225	2	Magure	200004	03.11.2015	R48	225	Sub-Total			=450			1	Jaypurhat	200001-200003	22.09.2015	R48	300	2	Jaypurhat	200012	26.10.2015	R48	51	3	Jaypurhat	200013	27.10.2015	R48	51	4	Jaypurhat	200014-200015	29.10.2015	R48	88	5	Jaypurhat	200018	01.11.2015	R48	102	6	Jaypurhat	200020	03.11.2015	R48	08	Sub-Total			=600			1	Takurgoan	200003	19.09.2015	R48	84	2	Takurgoan	200006	29.09.2015	R48	28	3	Takurgoan	200009	05.10.2015	R48	139
Sl No	Name of PBS	RR No	Date	Pole Type	Quantity (Nos)																																																																																
1	Magura	200002	19.09.2015	R48	225																																																																																
2	Magure	200004	03.11.2015	R48	225																																																																																
Sub-Total			=450																																																																																		
1	Jaypurhat	200001-200003	22.09.2015	R48	300																																																																																
2	Jaypurhat	200012	26.10.2015	R48	51																																																																																
3	Jaypurhat	200013	27.10.2015	R48	51																																																																																
4	Jaypurhat	200014-200015	29.10.2015	R48	88																																																																																
5	Jaypurhat	200018	01.11.2015	R48	102																																																																																
6	Jaypurhat	200020	03.11.2015	R48	08																																																																																
Sub-Total			=600																																																																																		
1	Takurgoan	200003	19.09.2015	R48	84																																																																																
2	Takurgoan	200006	29.09.2015	R48	28																																																																																
3	Takurgoan	200009	05.10.2015	R48	139																																																																																

	4	Takurgoan	200010	08.10.2015	R48	149																																						
	5	Takurgoan	200012	01.11.2015	R48	98																																						
	6	Takurgoan	200013	02.11.2015	R48	154																																						
	7	Takurgoan	200015	04.11.2015	R48	48																																						
	Sub-Total			=700																																								
	1	Meherpur	200036-200037	28.11.2015	R48	135																																						
	2	Meherpur	200035	25.11.2015	R48	120																																						
	3	Meherpur	200021	03.11.2015	R48	20																																						
	4	Meherpur	200001-200004	23.09.2015	R48	275																																						
	Sub-Total			=550																																								
	Total (SPC pole R48)=2300 Nos.																																											
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	N/A																																											
Timeliness of payment	<div>Payment Statement</div> <table><tr><th>Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat* (BDT)</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>22190400.00</td><td>24656000.00</td><td rowspan="5">11341760.00</td><td>2465600.00</td><td>1232800.00</td><td>20957600.00</td><td>30.09.15</td></tr><tr><td>18284889.60</td><td>20316544.00</td><td>2031655.00</td><td>1015828.00</td><td>9000000.00</td><td>29.10.15</td></tr><tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>8269061.00</td><td>03.11.15</td></tr><tr><td>39410150.40</td><td>43789056.00</td><td>4378906.00</td><td>2189453.00</td><td>37220697.00</td><td>17.11.15</td></tr><tr><td>22190400.00</td><td>24656000.00</td><td>2465600.00</td><td>1232800.00</td><td>20957600.00</td><td>30.11.15</td></tr></table> <p>NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods were reimbursed by Mushak-11.</p> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described in the above chart</p>						Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	22190400.00	24656000.00	11341760.00	2465600.00	1232800.00	20957600.00	30.09.15	18284889.60	20316544.00	2031655.00	1015828.00	9000000.00	29.10.15					8269061.00	03.11.15	39410150.40	43789056.00	4378906.00	2189453.00	37220697.00	17.11.15	22190400.00	24656000.00	2465600.00	1232800.00	20957600.00	30.11.15
Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																						
22190400.00	24656000.00	11341760.00	2465600.00	1232800.00	20957600.00	30.09.15																																						
18284889.60	20316544.00		2031655.00	1015828.00	9000000.00	29.10.15																																						
					8269061.00	03.11.15																																						
39410150.40	43789056.00		4378906.00	2189453.00	37220697.00	17.11.15																																						
22190400.00	24656000.00		2465600.00	1232800.00	20957600.00	30.11.15																																						
Others matters	The SPC pole received by the 04 (four) PBSs from the contractor as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka. The PBSs received the SPC poles and supplied the item to different contractors working in the respective areas. The PBSs received SPC poles from different sources (contracts/projects) and																																											

	<p>mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 2300 Nos of SPC poles purchased under the contract had been used.</p>
<p>Compliance with agreed provisions</p> <p>Yes or No (Explain)</p>	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008'</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 38 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p>

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (CSS-07-02)

Procurement Item name and number	SPC Pole(50') R48-2300 Nos.					
Location	Magura PBS, Joypurhat PBS, Thakurgoan PBS and Meherpur PBS					
Date of visit	25.04.2018 & 28.04.2018 at PE's office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka					
Date of Contract	Contract Signing : 16.07.2015					
Contracted completion date (Original)	50% within 12(twelve) weeks & 100% within 16 (sixteen) weeks (16.07.2015) 50% :8.10.2015 100% :05.11.2015					
Actual completion date	50% :8.10.2015 100% :05.11.2015					
Contract value	BDT 11,34,17,600.00					
Final Contract Value	BDT 11,34,17,600.00					
Supplier Contractor	M/S Contech Construction Ltd House No- 78, Road No-2, Banani Dhaka-1213, Bangladesh					
Arrival Date at port	N/A					
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	The SPC pole were supplied to 04(four) PBS (Magura PBS, Joypurhat PBS, Thakurgoan PBS and Meherpur PBS) with receiving report (RR) and date as follows:					
	SI No	Name of PBS	RR No	Date	Pole Type	Quantity (Nos)
	1	Magura	200002	19.09.2015	R48	225
	2	Magure	200004	03.11.2015	R48	225
	Sub-Total			=450		
	1	Jaypurhat	200001-200003	22.09.2015	R48	300
	2	Jaypurhat	200012	26.10.2015	R48	51
	3	Jaypurhat	200013	27.10.2015	R48	51
	4	Jaypurhat	200014-200015	29.10.2015	R48	88

	5	Jaypurhat	200018	01.11.2015	R48	102
	6	Jaypurhat	200020	03.11.2015	R48	08
	Sub-Total			=600		
	1	Takurgoan	200003	19.09.2015	R48	84
	2	Takurgoan	200006	29.09.2015	R48	28
	3	Takurgoan	200009	05.10.2015	R48	139
	4	Takurgoan	200010	08.10.2015	R48	149
	5	Takurgoan	200012	01.11.2015	R48	98
	6	Takurgoan	200013	02.11.2015	R48	154
	7	Takurgoan	200015	04.11.2015	R48	48
	Sub-Total			=700		
	1	Meherpur	200036-200037	28.11.2015	R48	135
	2	Meherpur	200035	25.11.2015	R48	120
	3	Meherpur	200021	03.11.2015	R48	20
	4	Meherpur	200001-200004	23.09.2015	R48	275
	Sub-Total			=550		
	Total (SPC pole R48)=2300 Nos.					
Scope of work	Supply of SPC Pole(50') R48-2300 Nos.					
Materials (Supply and quality)	Supplied SPC Pole (50') R48-2300 Nos. as per Receiving Reports (RR)					
Workmanship Quality	Before delivery of the goods, BREB's inspection team made pre-delivery inspection in the manufacture's factory to ensure the quality of materials as per specification and technical standards. After the delivery of the goods to the BREB's store, Post- delivery inspection was conducted by BREB's team for quality and quantity.					
Construction supervision	N/A					
Time overruns	N/A					
Cost overruns	N/A					
Deficiencies/ defects observed	The SPC pole received by the PBSs from the contractor as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka. The PBSs received the SPC poles and supplied the item to different contractors working in the respective areas. The PBSs received SPC poles from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the					

	allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 2300 Nos of SPC poles purchased under the contract had been used.						
Timelines of payments to contractor	<u>Payment Statement</u>						
	Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date
	22190400.00	24656000.00	11341760.00	2465600.00	1232800.00	20957600.00	30.09.15
	18284889.60	20316544.00		2031655.00	1015828.00	9000000.00	29.10.15
						8269061.00	03.11.15
	39410150.40	43789056.00		4378906.00	2189453.00	37220697.00	17.11.15
	22190400.00	24656000.00		2465600.00	1232800.00	20957600.00	30.11.15
	NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods were reimbursed by Mushak-11.						
Payments to contractor were timely as described in the above chart							
Comments and recommendations	<p>Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified.</p> <p>The allocation Letters of the poles to the PBS and the Receiving Reports of the poles should be kept in the contract file as of full execution of the contract.</p>						

Annex: C-3

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: CSS-07-01)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	1 st & 2 nd May, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Project Director, Construction of Switching Station of Rural Electrification Program (CSS-REP) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Reference	BREB/CSS-REP.P/CSS-07-01/2015-2016 dated 16.07.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 9,96,19,000.00
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Goods : SPC Pole(45') R47-2600 Nos
Method of Procurement	OTM
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement of materials for construction of Electric Lines and Sub-Stations under CSS-REP Project to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB. • To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (CSS-07-01)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16]	Chairman BREB (11.11.2014)
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Ittafaque : 23.12.2014 Daily Sun : 22.12.2014 Corrigendum Ittafaque : 21.01.2015 Daily Sun : 20.01.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)]	CPTU : 24.12.2014
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	No
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	07 (Seven)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	03 (Three)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least 28 days for above 5.00 crore; [R-61(4)]	Advertisement : 22.12.2014 Submission(ext.) : 11.02.2015 51 days (preparation-submission-ext)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	3 (Three) [R-7, schedule-II]	03(Three)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	Minimum 5 & normally not exceeding 7 members [R-8(1),schedule-II]	07(Seven)
4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	At least 2 (Two) [R-8(1),schedule-II]	04 (Four) Dr. Md. ShafiqulIslam,BUET Md. Abdur Rauf Miah,Powercell

			Kh. ZubaerHossain,BTCL Md. FakuzZaman,PDB
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/ Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	Secretary ,Power Division
5.0	Tenders/Proposals Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part- A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :11.02.2015 Evaluation :21.03.2015 38 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:25.03.15 Approval by Board :25.03.15 42 days (opening-sub. to Board)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/ submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :11.02.2015 Evaluation :21.03.2015 38 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to Board:25.03.15 Scrutiny by Board :25.03.15 42 days (opening-sub. to Board) Submission to Ministry :22.04.2015 70 days (opening- submission to Ministry)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	03 (Three)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/ Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC		No
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled		N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation :21.03.2015 Approval by Board :25.03.2015 4 days (evaluation – Board's approval) Submission to Ministry :22.04.2015

			Approval order by Ministry :17.06.2015 88 days (evaluation –approval)
6.2	AA as per DoFP	CCGP	CCGP
6.3	Authority approved	CCGP	CCGP
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via BREB Board & ministry
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :17.06.2015 NOA issue :18.06.2015 01 day (approval-NOA issue) Contract signing :16.07.2015 28 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	CCGP-10 week (70 days) + (as required for expeditious decision before expiry of tender validity period) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission to Ministry :22.04.2015 Approval order by Ministry :17.06.2015 56 days (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report		N/A
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals		N/A
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/ Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:70days[10 weeks] + Opening to NOA:72 days + Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:100+ days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :11.02.2015 NOA issue :18.06.2015 127 days(opening- NOA issue) Contract signing :16.07.2015 155 days (opening - contract)

7.2	Days actual between IFT/ RFP and issuance of NOA/ PO /Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 28 days Safe Custody: 02 days Evaluation to NOA:70 days+ IFT to NOA:100 days+ Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:128 days+ [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	IFT :22.12.2014 NOA :18.06.2015 178 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :16.07.2015 206 days (IFT-contract)
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b)PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore	Records are not found
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1) & 117(10)]	No.
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery	16 weeks (112 days) 50% within 12 weeks & 100% within 16 weeks from the day of contract	16 weeks (112 days) (Within 08.11.2015)
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		04.11.2015
8.3	Amount of LD imposed	0.05% of contract price for each week of delay or part thereof [PCC-35.1]	NO (within contract competed)
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons there of	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint (R-56)	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A

9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decisions of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)]	No
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)]	No
10.3	No and Amount of such orders		N/A
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved		No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption		No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD/Facilities		Yes Project Director- (Executive Engineer) - 1 Asst. Engineer- 4 Sub. Asst. Engineer- 4 Computer Operator- 2 Peon- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 02(Two) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (CSS-07-01)

Date of Review: 1 st & 2 nd May, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Contract Name, Contract No. and Date Supply of SPC Pole(45') R47-2600 Nos CSS-07-01 dated:16.07.2015	Contract Amount: BDT 9,96,19,000.00
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S Pre-Stressed Pole, House: 78, Road-2, Banani, Dhaka-1213, Bangladesh.	

Procurement Method : OTM, NCT

.Category : Goods (Supply of SPC Pole, R47-2600 Nos)

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 23.12.2014 with other 08 (eight) packages/sub-packages in the Ittafaq, On22.12.2014 in the Daily Sun and on 24.12.2014 CPTU's website (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper). One corrigendum on extending the last selling date tender closing date & time, Tender Opening date & time, tender security (package No:CSS-07-01) were published in the Ittafaq on 21.01.2015 and Daily Sun on 20.01.2015 as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule -X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	Done during the Evaluation
Time allowed for submission	51 days (preparation-submission-ext)

of Tenders	
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	Tender was received at two places (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkket Dhaka) & Power Cell (10 th floor), Bidyut Bhabaon, Abdul Goni Road, Dhaka. The Tender was opened on 11.02.2015 at one place (Big. Gen. Sabihuddin Ahmed Hall, 1 st floor, Head Office, BREB, Nikunga-2, Khilkket Dhaka). Tender Opening Sheet was (TOS) prepared, and signed by TOC members as per provision of Rule-97(4)(f).
Tender security records	Tender security records (Bank Guarantee number, Bank's name, issue date, expiry date and security amount) with their confirmations are available in PD office
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	<p>Commercial, financial and technical evaluation was done by the TEC with Names and designation of the officials undertaking the evaluation. In the evaluation report, detailed has been elaborated regarding the verification of test report, supply record, financial capability etc.</p> <p>Verification of authenticity of the Bid security and credit facilities were also carried out by TEC. In the evaluation report, TEC mentioned that the offered price of lowest Bidder (Pre-Stressed Pole Ltd.) is 5.39% higher than the estimated price and 0.01% higher than the last purchase price of the similar item. Moreover market price of raw materials and carrying of materials increases from the date of tender invitation (23.12.2014) to tender submission (11.02.2015). So TEC recommended to accept the lowest evaluated bidder M/S Pre-Stressed Pole Ltd. to award the contract. The name of the participating Bidders are follows:</p> <p>01) M/S POLES AND CONCREATE LIMITED</p> <p>02) M/S Contech Construction Ltd.</p> <p>03) M/S Pre-Stressed Pole Ltd.</p>
Contract document	<p>The documents mentioned in the contract agreement are: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and</p> <p>(i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.</p>

Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A																																															
Performance security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: UCBL/Banani/244/2015, Issue date: 08.07.2015, Expiry date: 31.12.2016, Guarantee amount: BDT 99,61,900.00 issued by United Commercial Bank Ltd.,Sharif Plaza (1 st & 2 nd floor), 39, kemal Ataturk Avenue, Banani, Dhaka-1213																																															
Complaints and Appeals	N/A																																															
Contractual completion date	50% within 12(twelve) weeks & 100% within 16 (sixteen) weeks (16.07.2015) 50% :08.10.2015 100% : 05.11.2015																																															
Actual completion date	50% :08.10.2015 100% : 05.11.2015																																															
Bill of lading, if any	N/A																																															
Delivery receipt or like instrument	The SPC poles were received by 04(four) PBS (Magura, Joypurhat, Thakurgoan, Meherpur) with the following receiving report (RR) & date: <table><tr><td>SI No</td><td>Name of PBS</td><td>RR No</td><td>Date</td><td>Pole Type</td><td>Quantity (Nos)</td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Magura</td><td>200001</td><td>17.09.2015</td><td>R47</td><td>250</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Magure</td><td>200003</td><td>03.11.2015</td><td>R47</td><td>250</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Sub-Total</td><td colspan="3">=500</td></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200004-200007</td><td>22.09.2015</td><td>R47</td><td>340</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200008</td><td>03.01.2015</td><td>R47</td><td>10</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Jaypurhat</td><td>200019</td><td>01.11.2015</td><td>R47</td><td>57</td></tr></table>						SI No	Name of PBS	RR No	Date	Pole Type	Quantity (Nos)	1	Magura	200001	17.09.2015	R47	250	2	Magure	200003	03.11.2015	R47	250	Sub-Total			=500			1	Jaypurhat	200004-200007	22.09.2015	R47	340	2	Jaypurhat	200008	03.01.2015	R47	10	3	Jaypurhat	200019	01.11.2015	R47	57
SI No	Name of PBS	RR No	Date	Pole Type	Quantity (Nos)																																											
1	Magura	200001	17.09.2015	R47	250																																											
2	Magure	200003	03.11.2015	R47	250																																											
Sub-Total			=500																																													
1	Jaypurhat	200004-200007	22.09.2015	R47	340																																											
2	Jaypurhat	200008	03.01.2015	R47	10																																											
3	Jaypurhat	200019	01.11.2015	R47	57																																											

	4	Jaypurhat	200021-200022	03.11.2015	R47	184																																
	5	Jaypurhat	200023-200025	04.11.2015	R47	209																																
	Sub-Total			=800																																		
	1	Takurgoan	200001	09.09.2015	R47	86																																
	2	Takurgoan	200002	14.09.2015	R47	99																																
	3	Takurgoan	200004	19.09.2015	R47	51																																
	4	Takurgoan	200005	29.09.2015	R47	34																																
	5	Takurgoan	200007	30.09.2015	R47	10																																
	6	Takurgoan	200008	02.10.2015	R47	20																																
	7	Takurgoan	200011	01.11.2015	R47	85																																
	8	Takurgoan	200014	03.11.2015	R47	115																																
	Sub-Total			=500																																		
	1	Meherpur	200038	28.11.2015	R47	50																																
	2	Meherpur	200031	15.11.2015	R47	75																																
	3	Meherpur	200019-200022	03.11.2015	R47	275																																
	4	Meherpur	200005-200009	29.09.2015	R47	400																																
	Sub-Total			=800																																		
	Total (SPC Pole, R47)=2600 Nos																																					
	Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	N/A																																				
	Timeliness of payment	<div>Payment Statement</div> <table><tr><th>Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat* (BDT)</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>22414275.00</td><td>24904750.00</td><td rowspan="4">9961900.00</td><td>2490475.00</td><td>1245238.00</td><td>21169037.00</td><td>30.09.15</td></tr><tr><td>21034935.00</td><td>23372150.00</td><td>2337215.00</td><td>1168608.00</td><td>19866327.00</td><td>02.11.15</td></tr><tr><td>23793615.00</td><td>26437350.00</td><td>2643735.00</td><td>1321868.00</td><td>22471747.00</td><td>17.11.15</td></tr><tr><td>22414275.00</td><td>24904750.00</td><td>2490475.00</td><td>1245238.00</td><td>21169037.00</td><td>30.11.15</td></tr></table> <p>NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods were reimbursed by Mushak-11.</p> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described in the above chart</p>						Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	22414275.00	24904750.00	9961900.00	2490475.00	1245238.00	21169037.00	30.09.15	21034935.00	23372150.00	2337215.00	1168608.00	19866327.00	02.11.15	23793615.00	26437350.00	2643735.00	1321868.00	22471747.00	17.11.15	22414275.00	24904750.00	2490475.00	1245238.00	21169037.00
Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																
22414275.00	24904750.00	9961900.00	2490475.00	1245238.00	21169037.00	30.09.15																																
21034935.00	23372150.00		2337215.00	1168608.00	19866327.00	02.11.15																																
23793615.00	26437350.00		2643735.00	1321868.00	22471747.00	17.11.15																																
22414275.00	24904750.00		2490475.00	1245238.00	21169037.00	30.11.15																																
Others matters	The SPC pole received by the 04 (four) PBSs from the contractor as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka. The PBSs received the SPC poles and supplied the item to different contractors working in the respective areas. The PBSs received SPC poles from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the																																					

	<p>contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 2600 Nos of SPC poles purchased under the contract had been used. .</p>
<p>Compliance with agreed provisions</p> <p>Yes or No (Explain)</p>	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p> <p>b) Records of persons purchasing tender documents with full contract details, such as ID or personal details, mailing address, telephone, facsimile number and electronic mail address were not maintained fully as per provisions of Rule -6 and Rule – 64(6) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>c) Checklist with steps for tender opening was not followed fully as per provisions of Rule-97(4) (G) and Schedule IV (Part-D) of PPR-2008;</p> <p>d) No record for sending request for publication of contract award in CPTU's website as per Rule-37(1) of PPR-2008 was available;</p> <p>e) Checklist showing the time spent at each stage of procurement contract/Schedule of Activities were not maintained fully as per Rule-8(17) (18) & Schedule –IV (Part-A) of PPR-2008.</p> <p>f) It was not clear whether the evaluation report was sent by the convener of TEC directly to the tender approval authority in sealed envelope as per Rule-36 of PPR-2008.</p> <p>g) Evaluation time (Opening to evaluation) was 38 days does not match with Rule -36(6), schedule –III, Part-A of PPR-2008. BREB explain that verification of the authenticity of documents such as Bids Security, credit facilities, test report, supply records, audited balance sheet etc required more time for evaluation.</p>

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (CSS-07-01)

Procurement Item name and no	Supply of SPC Pole (45') R-47-2600 Nos..					
Location	Magura PBS, Joypurhat PBS, Thakurgoan PBS and Meherpur PBS					
Date of visit	25.04.2018 & 28.04.2018 at PE's office, BREB, Khilkhet, Dhaka					
Date of Contract	Contract Signing : 16.07.2015					
Contracted completion date (Original)	50% within 12(twelve) weeks & 100% within 16 (sixteen) weeks (16.07.2015) 50% :8.10.2015 100% :05.11.2015					
Actual completion date	50% :8.10.2015 100% :05.11.2015					
Contract value	BDT 9,96,19,000.00					
Final Contract Value	BDT 9,96,19,000.00					
Supplier Contractor	M/S Pre-Stressed Pole, House: 78, Road-2, Banani, Dhaka-1213, Bangladesh.					
Arrival Date at port	N/A					
Arrival Date at project site/ warehouse	The SPC pole were supplied to 04(four) PBS (Magura PBS, Joypurhat PBS, Thakurgoan PBS and Meherpur PBS) with receiving report (RR) and date as follows:					
	SI No	Name of PBS	RR No	Date	Pole Type	Quantity (Nos)
	1	Magura	200001	17.09.2015	R47	250
	2	Magure	200003	03.11.2015	R47	250
	Sub-Total			=500		
	1	Jaypurhat	200004-200007	22.09.2015	R47	340
	2	Jaypurhat	200008	03.01.2015	R47	10
	3	Jaypurhat	200019	01.11.2015	R47	57
	4	Jaypurhat	200021-200022	03.11.2015	R47	184
	5	Jaypurhat	200023-200025	04.11.2015	R47	209
	Sub-Total			=800		

	1	Takurgoan	200001	09.09.2015	R47	86
	2	Takurgoan	200002	14.09.2015	R47	99
	3	Takurgoan	200004	19.09.2015	R47	51
	4	Takurgoan	200005	29.09.2015	R47	34
	5	Takurgoan	200007	30.09.2015	R47	10
	6	Takurgoan	200008	02.10.2015	R47	20
	7	Takurgoan	200011	01.11.2015	R47	85
	8	Takurgoan	200014	03.11.2015	R47	115
	Sub-Total			=500		
	1	Meherpur	200038	28.11.2015	R47	50
	2	Meherpur	200031	15.11.2015	R47	75
	3	Meherpur	200019-200022	03.11.2015	R47	275
	4	Meherpur	200005-200009	29.09.2015	R47	400
	Sub-Total			=800		
	Total (SPC Pole, R47)=2600 Nos					
Scope of work	Supply of SPC Pole(45') R47-2600 Nos					
Materials (Supply and quality)	Supplied SPC Pole (45') R47-2600 Nos. as per Receiving Reports (RR)					
Workmanship Quality	Before delivery of the goods, BREB's inspection team made pre-delivery inspection in the manufacture's factory to ensure the quality of materials as per specification and technical standards. After the delivery of the goods to the BREB's store. Post- delivery inspection was conducted by BREB's team for quality and quantity.					
Construction supervision	N/A					
Time overruns	N/A					
Cost overruns	N/A					
Deficiencies/ defects observed	The SPC pole received by the PBSs from the contractor as per allocation letter issued by the Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka. The PBSs received the SPC poles and supplied the item to different contractors working in the respective areas. The PBSs received SPC poles from different sources (contracts/projects) and mixed them up in the stock register and supplied these to the contractors without mentioning contract number or package number. In the allocation letter there is also no mention of the contract number or package number. As a result, it was not possible to identify the ultimate sites or places where 2600 Nos of SPC poles purchased under the contract had been used.					

Timelines of payments to contractor	<u>Payment Statement</u>						
	Payment Recom. by CS & M Dte	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date
	22414275.00	24904750.00	9961900.00	2490475.00	1245238.00	21169037.00	30.09.15
	21034935.00	23372150.00		2337215.00	1168608.00	19866327.00	02.11.15
	23793615.00	26437350.00		2643735.00	1321868.00	22471747.00	17.11.15
	22414275.00	24904750.00		2490475.00	1245238.00	21169037.00	30.11.15
NOTE: 15% VAT of the Goods were reimbursed by Mushak-11. Payments to contractor were timely as described in the above chart							
Comments and recommendations	Directorate of MPSS, BREB, Dhaka should mention the contract number or the packages number in the allocation letter and the Ware Houses and PBSs should also mention the number in the stock register while receiving goods and supplying them to the contractors so that the ultimate sites or areas where the procured goods under a contract are used can be identified. The allocation Letters of the poles to the PBS and the Receiving Reports of the poles should be kept in the contract file as of full execution of the contract.						

Annex: C-4

Individual Contract Review Format (Package: CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03) (e-GP System)

Part-1: General

Data of Review	22nd & 24th April, 2018
Name of Reviewer	K.M. Hassan
Procuring Entity Name	Superintending Engineer (Project), Rajshahi Zone under Construction of Switching Station for Rural Electrification Program (CSS-REP) Rural Electrification Board (REB)
Contract Name and Contract Reference	Construction of 8.194 KM OHD Line under Jaypurhat PBS. CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03 dated:24.12.2015
Contract Amount	BDT 24,81,311.94
Procurement Type	NCT
Category of Procurement	Works
Method of Procurement	LTM(e-GP)
Object of Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construction of OHD Lines CSS-REP Project is to reduce system losses and enhancing the capacity of distribution network in rural area under BREB To accelerate economic activities in rural Area by increasing Electricity.
Financing Arrangement of the Procurement	Development (GOB)

Part-2: Compliance with Act and Rules (CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03) (e-GP System)

		Applicable Provisions	Actual
1.0	Procurement Plan		
1.1	Approval Status of APP.	HOPE or an officer authorized by him [R-16] e-GP Guidelines 3.3.1	Chairman BREB
2.0	Procurement Opportunities		
2.1	Advertised in Newspaper	To be advertised in at least one Bengali and one English national newspaper [R-90(2)(ka)]	Daily News Today : 26.11.2015 Daily Shomokal : 25.11.2015
2.2	Advertised in CPTU's website	Procurement of Tk1.00 crore and above be sent to CPTU's website [R-90(2)(jha)] e-GP Guidelines sec-3.5.12	CPTU :23.11.2015
2.3	Tenders/Proposals followed PPR, 2008	To be followed PPR, 2008	Followed PPR-2008
2.4	Tenders/Proposals followed DP's Guidelines	N/A	N/A
3.0	Tenders/Proposals Submission		
3.1	No of Sale/Issuance of Tender/Proposal Documents	No limit	02 (Two)
3.2	No of Tenderer participated	No limit	02 (Two)
3.3	Days allowed per Rule for preparation and Submission of tender	At least -14 days; [R-64(5)]	Advertisement : 23.11.2015 Submission : 09.12.2015 16 days (preparation-submission)
4.0	Formation of TOC/BOC and TEC/BEC		
4.1	No of members in TOC/BOC	02(Two) [R-7,Schedule-II] BPR-e-GP, Section-3.5.6.1	02 (Two)
4.2	No of member in TOC/BOC from TEC/BEC	1 (One) [R-7, schedule-II]	01(One)
4.3	No of members in TEC/BEC	03 (Three) members, BPR-e-GP, Section 3.5.6.1	03(Three)

4.4	No of external members in TEC/BEC	N/A	N/A
4.5	Authority approved TEC/BEC	Tender Approving Authority/PD /Chairman/ Secretary [R-8(3)]	HOPE
5.0	Tenders Evaluation		
5.1	Days allowed per Rule between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] PEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule-III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :09.12.2015 Evaluation :15.12.2015 6 days (opening- evaluation)
5.2	Days actual between opening and completion/submission of evaluation Report	Safe Custody-2 days [R-32] TEC Evaluation-21 days [R-36(6),schedule- III, part-A] 23 days (opening to evaluation)	Opening :09.12.2015 Evaluation :15.12.2015 6 days (opening- evaluation) Submission to PD :15.12.2015 6 days (opening-submission to PD)
5.3	Responsiveness of Tender/Proposal	No requirement for a minimum number of responsive tenderers [R-98(14)(28)]	02 (Two)
5.4	Re-invitation of Tenders/Proposals recommended by TEC/BEC	PE may reject all tenders on the recommendations of the TEC, and with the approval HOPE invite Re0tender on certain grounds. [R-33(2)], [R-11(2)(c)(ii)]	N/A
5.5	Procurement proceedings annulled/ cancelled	N/A	N/A
6.0	Approval of Tenders/Proposals		
6.1	Days actual between evaluation and Approval	HOPE: 6 weeks (42 days) Project Director:1 week (7 days) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Evaluation : 15.12.2015 Submission to PD : 17.12.2015 Approval by PD : 18.12.2015 03 days (evaluation –Approval) PD to CE : 20.12.2015 CE to Member : 20.12.2015 Member to Chairman:21.12.2015 Approval of HOPE :21.12.2015 06 days (evaluation –Approval)

6.2	AA as per DoFP	Project Director	HOPE, Chairman (BREB)
6.3	Authority approved	Project Director	Chairman ,BREB
6.4	Evaluation report was sent directly to the AA	Be sent directly to AA in sealed envelope [R-36(3)]	Via PD to HOPE (Chairman, BREB)
6.5	Days actual for issuance of NOA/PO/Contracts sign/LOI	a) NOA- Within 7 working days of receipt of approval but before expiry of tender validity date [R-36(4)](a),schedule-II] b) Contract signing – within 28 days from issuance of NOA [R-102(11),schedule-II]	Approval :21.12.2015 NOA issue :23.12.2015 02 days (approval-NOA) Contract signing :24.12.2015 03 days (NOA–contract signing)
6.6	Days actual for Contract award decision by AA	HOPE: 2 weeks (14 days) [R-36(6)-Schedule-III, Part-A]	Submission :09.12.2015 Approval :21.12.2015 12 days (Submission-Approval)
6.7	Authority other than AA, if any, made additional review of the evaluation report	N/A	N/A
6.8	Authority higher or lower than AA, if any, approved the Tenders/Proposals	Project Director	Chairman ,BREB
7.0	Contract Award		
7.1	Procurement Processing lead-time i.e. days actual between opening and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	Safe Custody:2 days [R-32] Evaluation to NOA:(6 weeks)42days Opening to NOA:44 days Contract signing:28 days Opening to contract:72 days [R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	Opening :09.12.2015 NOA issue :23.12.2015 14 days(opening-NOA issue) Contract signing:24.12.2015 15 days (opening - contract)
7.2	Days actual between IFT/RFP and issuance of NOA/PO/Contract signing/LOI	IFT to Opening: 14 days [R-61(5)] Safe Custody: 02 days[R-32] Evaluation to NOA:42days IFT to NOA:58 days Contract: 28 days IFT to Contract:86 days	Advertisement :23.11.2015 NOA :23.12.2015 30 days (IFT-NOA) Contract signing :24.12.2015 31 days (IFT-contract)

		[R-36(6) Schedule-III, Part-A]	
7.3	Publication of award in CPTU's website/PE's website/others	a) CPTU's website: Within 7 working days from issuance of NOA for not less than 1 month for Tk 1.00 crore and above [R-37(1 & 2)] b) PE's website- Below Tk. 1.00 crore e-GP Guidelines, Section- 3.7.4	Not applicable
7.4	Contract award made within the initial Tender/Proposal validity period	Generally 60-120 days [R-19(1)]&[Rule-117(10)]	Yes, within tender validity period
8.0	Completion of Contract		
8.1	Day per original contract time specified for Supply/ Execution/ Delivery		Contract signed :24.12.2015 1 st material issued :19.01.2016 Completion by 180days:(18.07.2016)
8.2	Day actual for Supply/ Execution/Delivery		100% Completion 27.06.2016
8.3	Amount of LD imposed		No
9.0	Complaints and Appeal		No
9.1	Complaint, if any, lodged and reasons thereof	Complaint may be lodged to PE within 7 days of becoming aware of the matter of complaint [R-56]	No
9.2	Resolution of complaints per Rules	The PE within 5 working days shall consider the complaint and decide whether to reject the complaint or take corrective action [R-57(3)(4)]	N/A
9.3	Modifications resulting from resolution of complaints	N/A	N/A

9.4	Appeal of Independent Review Panel	A person within 7 working days of the receipt of the written decision may be appeal to a Review Panel only if he has exhausted all his options of complaints to the Administrative Authority [R-57(10)(11)(12)]	N/A
9.5	Review Panel's decision and follow-on	Decision of the Review Panel within 12 working days from the receipt of the complaint	N/A
10.0	Contract Amendment		
10.1	No of times contract time extended and days	Up to 20% of the original contract time. Above 20% approval of HOPE shall be required [R-74(4)] and [Rule-39(3)]	One time (But without time extension)
10.2	Variation/Extra Work/Repeat/ Addl. Delivery Orders etc. made	15% of the original contract price [R-77(ka)] [Rule 78,79 & 80] of PPR-2008	Yes
10.3	No and amount of such orders	[Rule 78,79 & 80] of PPR-2008	01 (One) Tk (19,36,367+1,09,168) =20,96,168
11.0	Contract Disputes unresolved	[Rule-42(4)] of PPR-2008	No
12.0	Fraudulence and Corruption	[Rule-127] of PPR-2008	No
13.0	Procurement Management Capacity		Yes
13.1	HRD facilities		Yes Project Director- (Executive Engineer) - 1 Asst. Engineer- 4 Sub. Asst. Engineer- 4 Computer Operator- 2 Peon- 1
13.2	No of Staff trained in procurement		Yes 02(Two) completed training

Part-3: Post Reviews of Goods/Works Contracts (CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03)

Date of Review: 1 st & 2 nd May, 2018	Name of the Reviewer: K.M. Hassan
Name :Construction of 8.194 KM OHD Line under Jaypurhat PBS Number :CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03 Date :24.12.2015	Contract Amount: BDT 24,81,311.94
Contractor's Name and Address: M/S G.M Traders, Kadirganj, Aambagan, Rajshahi.	

Procurement Method : e-GP, LTM

Category : Works (Construction of 8.194 KM OHD Line under Jaypurhat PBS)

Aspects	Comment and Findings
Procurement Documentation (Filing)	Procurement was done following e-GP Guidelines. Most of the documents is kept in archive of e-GP Portal. Standard Tender Documents of CPTU were followed. Tender Data Sheet (general, tender document, qualification criteria, preparation of tender, submission of tender, opening and evaluation of tender, award of complain & appeal), Particular Condition of Contract, Tender and Contract Form (including price schedule, specification submission sheet, Payment terms, Insurance etc), Schedule of Requirements, Technical Specification and Drawings, were filled up as per provisions of Rule -4(1),96(1) and Schedule XII of PPR-2008.
Advertising	Advertised on 25.11.2015 with other 04 packages/sub-packages in the Daily Shomokall , on 26.11.2015 in the Daily News Today and on 23.11.2015 CPTU's website (at least one Bengali & one English national newspaper) as per provision of Rule-90(2)(ka) and in the format prescribed in Schedule –X & XI of PPR-2008.
Pre/Post Qualification	Pre qualification list was done by Chief Engr. (Project), BREB, Dhaka.
Time allowed for submission	16 days (preparation-submission)

of Tenders	
Tender opening and minutes of Tender opening	Well formatted and recovered. ToS, ToR-1 and TpR-2 were used for the purposes.
Tender security records	Records of tender security as per Tor-1 and ToR-2
B.E. Report, verify existence of Tenders- Names of Tenderers	TER-1,2,3 and 4 were used while evaluation 01) M/S G.M Traders 02) M/S Habib Brothers
Contract document	The documents mentioned in the contract agreement such as: (a) Notification of award, (b) Tender Submission Sheet as submitted by the tenderer, (c) completed price schedule, (d) Particular Conditions of Contracts, (e) General Condition of Contract, (f) Technical Specifications, (g) Drawings, (h) The Schedule of Requirements and (i) Other documents listed in the PCC as forming part of the contract, were attached with the contract agreement with signatures of both the parties.
Advance payment guarantee details and records	N/A
Performance security details and records	Bank Guarantee NO: PG69/2015, Issue date: 23.12.2015, Expiry date: 22.06.2016, Guarantee amount: BDT 1,24,065.00 issued by NCC Bank, Rajshahi Branch, Rajshahi.
Complaints and Appeals	N/A
Contractual completion date	Contract signing :24.12.15 1 st material issue :19.01.2016

	180 days from the date of 1 st material issue(18.07.2016)						
Actual completion date	100% : 27.06.2016						
Bill of lading, if any	N/A						
Delivery receipt or like instrument	Materials supplied by BREB. Labour and carrying cost borne by the conductor for line construction works.						
Liquidated damages, details and enforcement for delays	NO						
Timeliness of payment	<u>Payment Statement</u>						
	Payment Recommended. by field Office	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M-Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date
	13.11.16	5,50,000.00		55,000.00	IT 22,000.00 VAT 33,000.00	4,40,000.00	13.11.16
	11.01.17	5,40,000.00		54,000.00	IT 21,600.00 VAT 32,400.00	4,32,000.00	11.01.17
	11.06.17	3,50,000.00		35,000.00	IT 14,000.00 VAT 21,000.00	2,80,000.00	11.06.17
	28.08.17	1,00,000.00		10,000.00	IT 4,000.00 VAT 6,000.00	80,000.00	28.08.17
	01.01.18	3,70,000.00		37,000.00	IT 18,500.00 VAT 22,200.00	2,92,300.00	01.01.18
	21.03.18	4,00,000.00		40,000.00	IT 20,000.00 VAT 24,000.00	3,16,000.00	21.03.18
	26.06.18	1,70,000.00		17,000.00	IT 8,500.00 VAT 11,900.00	1,32,600.00	26.06.18
	Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart						
	**Deducted amount TK 1250 for non return of wooded drums.						
	N.B. Since it was a GOB funded Project , there was no advance payment.						

<p>Others matters</p>	<p>Due to shortage of schedule items substitute items were used to execute the work.</p> <p>The completion time of the works count from the date of first issue of the materials is unusual practice.</p> <p>The original length was 8.19km As-built drawing 6.08 km so the works is less than the original work order.</p>
<p>Compliance with agreed provisions</p> <p>Yes or No (Explain)</p>	<p>Complied with the provisions of PPR 2008, except the following:</p> <p>a) Records & documents of procurement contracts from the beginning of procurement planning up to the full contractual obligations were not maintained fully in the relevant procurement file as per provisions of Rule 43(1)(2)(3)(4) and Schedule – VIII (Part (A+B)) of PPR-2008</p>

Part- 4: Report on physical Inception (CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03)

Procurement Item name and number	Name: Construction of 8.194 KM OHD Line under Jaypurhat PBS Number : CSS-REP-JPA-N-L-03 Date : 24.12.2015
Location	PD Office BREB , Khilkhet , Dhaka.
Date of visit	22 nd & 24 th april 2018.
Date of Contract	19.06.2016
Contracted completion date (Original)	Contract signing :24.12.15 1 st material issue :19.01.2016 180 days from the date of 1 st material issue(18.07.2016)
Actual completion date	100% : 27.06.2016
Contract value	TK.24,81,311.94
Final Contract Value	Tk. 20,86,317(Tk19,86,317 shedule item Tk1,09,801-variation order)
Supplier Contractor	M/S. Sahi & Co, Hazipara (Simultola), Thakurgaon.
Arrival date at port	N/A
Arrival Date at project site/warehouse (Goods)	N/A
Scope of work	Construction of 8.194 km OHD Line under Joypurhat PBS.
Materials (Supply and quality)	Materials supplied by BREB. Labour and carrying cost by the Contractor for line construction.
Construction supervision	Construction supervision was undertaken by the consultant of appointed by BREB. The supervision was also undertaken by the Executive Engineer and Assistant Engineer of Rajshahi ZONE BREB
Time overruns	N/A
Cost overruns	N/A
Deficiencies/ defects observed	1) For line Construction completion time of the work start from the date of first issue of materials instead of the day signing contract. 2) Shortage materials hampered the work and time extension required. 3) For the line Construction work, No Issuance Coverage was made. BREB mentioned that for inclusion of Insurance will increase the cost of the work. But safety of worker's life, insurance coverage will give then more comfort.
Arrival Date at	N/A

project site/warehouse (Goods)																																																									
Timelines of payments to contractor	<div>Payment Statement</div> <table><tr><th>Payment Recommended. by field Office</th><th>Bill Amount (BDT)</th><th>R/M-Refund (after completion)</th><th>R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment)</th><th>IT & Vat* (BDT)</th><th>Cheque Amount</th><th>Payment Date</th></tr><tr><td>13.11.16</td><td>5,50,000.00</td><td rowspan="7"></td><td>55,000.00</td><td>IT 22,000.00 VAT 33,000.00</td><td>4,40,000.00</td><td>13.11.16</td></tr><tr><td>11.01.17</td><td>5,40,000.00</td><td>54,000.00</td><td>IT 21,600.00 VAT 32,400.00</td><td>4,32,000.00</td><td>11.01.17</td></tr><tr><td>11.06.17</td><td>3,50,000.00</td><td>35,000.00</td><td>IT 14,000.00 VAT 21,000.00</td><td>2,80,000.00</td><td>11.06.17</td></tr><tr><td>28.08.17</td><td>1,00,000.00</td><td>10,000.00</td><td>IT 4,000.00 VAT 6,000.00</td><td>80,000.00</td><td>28.08.17</td></tr><tr><td>01.01.18</td><td>3,70,000.00</td><td>37,000.00</td><td>IT 18,500.00 VAT 22,200.00</td><td>2,92,300.00</td><td>01.01.18</td></tr><tr><td>21.03.18</td><td>4,00,000.00</td><td>40,000.00</td><td>IT 20,000.00 VAT 24,000.00</td><td>3,16,000.00</td><td>21.03.18</td></tr><tr><td>26.06.18</td><td>1,70,000.00</td><td>17,000.00</td><td>IT 8,500.00 VAT 11,900.00</td><td>1,32,600.00</td><td>26.06.18</td></tr></table> <p>Payments to contractor were timely as described above in the chart **Deducted amount TK 1250 for non return of wooded drums. N.B. Since it was a GOB funded Project , there was no advance payment.</p>							Payment Recommended. by field Office	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date	13.11.16	5,50,000.00		55,000.00	IT 22,000.00 VAT 33,000.00	4,40,000.00	13.11.16	11.01.17	5,40,000.00	54,000.00	IT 21,600.00 VAT 32,400.00	4,32,000.00	11.01.17	11.06.17	3,50,000.00	35,000.00	IT 14,000.00 VAT 21,000.00	2,80,000.00	11.06.17	28.08.17	1,00,000.00	10,000.00	IT 4,000.00 VAT 6,000.00	80,000.00	28.08.17	01.01.18	3,70,000.00	37,000.00	IT 18,500.00 VAT 22,200.00	2,92,300.00	01.01.18	21.03.18	4,00,000.00	40,000.00	IT 20,000.00 VAT 24,000.00	3,16,000.00	21.03.18	26.06.18	1,70,000.00	17,000.00	IT 8,500.00 VAT 11,900.00	1,32,600.00	26.06.18
Payment Recommended. by field Office	Bill Amount (BDT)	R/M-Refund (after completion)	R/M- Deduction (When R/A bill payment)	IT & Vat* (BDT)	Cheque Amount	Payment Date																																																			
13.11.16	5,50,000.00		55,000.00	IT 22,000.00 VAT 33,000.00	4,40,000.00	13.11.16																																																			
11.01.17	5,40,000.00		54,000.00	IT 21,600.00 VAT 32,400.00	4,32,000.00	11.01.17																																																			
11.06.17	3,50,000.00		35,000.00	IT 14,000.00 VAT 21,000.00	2,80,000.00	11.06.17																																																			
28.08.17	1,00,000.00		10,000.00	IT 4,000.00 VAT 6,000.00	80,000.00	28.08.17																																																			
01.01.18	3,70,000.00		37,000.00	IT 18,500.00 VAT 22,200.00	2,92,300.00	01.01.18																																																			
21.03.18	4,00,000.00		40,000.00	IT 20,000.00 VAT 24,000.00	3,16,000.00	21.03.18																																																			
26.06.18	1,70,000.00		17,000.00	IT 8,500.00 VAT 11,900.00	1,32,600.00	26.06.18																																																			
Comments and recommendations	<p>a) Completion certificate should be issued immediately after proper inspection of the construction work and submission of as –built drawing by the construction.</p> <p>b) Completion time of contract should be extended with careful examination of the works. Extension of time again and again lead to delayed implementation of project activities.</p> <p>c) For timely completion after to be given of the works.</p> <p>d) The Allocation Letters of the poles to the PBSs and the receiving Reports of the poles should be kept in the contract file as proof of full execution of the construction.</p> <p>e) For the line Construction work, No Issuance Coverage was made. BREB mentioned that for inclusion of Insurance will increase the cost of the work. But safety of worker’s life, insurance coverage will give then more comfort.</p>																																																								



Visit for Civil and Line Construction work under Mymensingh PBS.